VERBEIA

VERBEIA

VERBEIA

VERBEIA

VERBEIA

JOURNAL OF ENGLISH AND SPANISH STUDIES

REVISTA DE ESTUDIOS FILOLÓGICOS

Universidad
Camilo José Cela

FACULTAD DE EDUCACIÓN

Juan José Magaña Redondo (UNED, España)
Carmen Maíz Arévalo (Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España)
Ricardo Marín Ruiz (Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, España)
Félix Martín (Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España)
Silvia Molina Plaza (Universidad Politécnica de Madrid, España)
Salvador Montaner Villalba (Valencian International University)
Alfredo Moro Martín (Universidad de Cantabria, España)
Juan Antonio Núñez (Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, España)
Jaime Olmedo Ramos (Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España)
Marta Ortiz Canseco (Universidad Internacional de La Rioja, España)
Diana de Paco (Universidad de Murcia, España)
Mariano de Paco (Universidad de Murcia, España)
Antonio Pareja Lora (Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España)
Emilio Javier Peral Vega(Universidad Complutense de Madrid, España)
José Antonio Pérez Bowie (Universidad de Salamanca, España)
Lourdes Pomposo Yanez (UCJC, España)
Timothy Read (UNED, España)
Margarita Reiz (RESAD, España)
Margarita Rigal (Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha, España)
Pilar Rodríguez Arancón (UNED, España)
Gerardo Rodríguez-Salas (Universidad de Granada, España)
Santiago Rodríguez-Stracham (Universidad de Valladolid, España)
Raúl Ruiz Cecilia (Universidad de Granada, España)
Virtudes Serrano (Asociación de Autores de Teatro, España)
Silvia Sánchez Calderón (Universidad de Valladolid)
Ricardo J. Sola Buil (Universidad Alcalá de Henares, España)
Adolfo Sotelo Vázquez (Universidad de Barcelona, España)
Noa Talaván Zanón(UNED, España)
Simone Trecca (Università degli Studi Roma Tre, Italia)
Carmen Valero Garcés (Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, España)

NÚMERO 3

En esta ocasión, el número 3 de *Verbeia* abre la sección de Lingüística con un destacado artículo de Juana María Anguita que versa sobre las destrezas escritas del inglés, donde se pretende hacer una valoración del nivel de inglés escrito en la Educación Primaria; el artículo de Najlaa Kounitrate analiza la traducción de unas locuciones presentes en tres versiones al árabe de la obra *Pedro Páramo*, se trata de un estudio fraseológico contrastivo español–árabe. La sección de Literatura la introduce un análisis muy interesante de Patricia Álvarez donde se vinculan las ideas feministas de Irigaray con Magda, la protagonista de la novela *En medio de ninguna parte* de Coetzee; el siguiente escrito de Álvaro Manzano pretende realizar un análisis innovador de *Los versos satánicos* de Rushdie, además de, en palabras del autor, desacreditar falsos mitos sobre la novela. Esther Muñoz, en el siguiente estudio, debate los elementos míticos de *The Ebony Tower* y trata de probar que los mitos son patriarcales y que contribuyen a la sumisión de las mujeres. Magnífico trabajo es el de Concepción Parrondo sobre la realidad de los blancos pobres en el sur de los Estados Unidos en la obra de Dorothy Allison, *A Bastard Out of Carolina*. El quinto trabajo, igualmente meritorio, es el de Rocío Riestra sobre la heroína distópica en *Divergente*. Se cierra esta sección con un artículo muy completo de Mariángeles Rodríguez sobre "la censura de los lenguajes del cuerpo" en el teatro español en los setenta. En este número contamos, además, con una acertada reseña de Paula Albitre sobre la obra de Araceli López Serena*, Oralidad y escrituralidad en la recreación del español coloquial.*

Estoy profundamente satisfecha con el año 2017 pues ha sido especialmente fructífero para *Verbeia*, hemos logrado publicar nuestro primer monográfico, digital e impreso, estamos trabajando en el segundo para octubre de 2018 y tenemos ya preparado el tercero, que verá la luz en 2019.

Vamos cerrando números y abriendo nuevos proyectos, crecemos con la ayuda de un equipo Editorial y Científico inigualable. Hay mucho esfuerzo y trabajo, pero también mucha ilusión cada vez que publicamos un nuevo número.

Espero que este sea tan exitoso como los anteriores.

Sonia Sánchez Martínez
Editora de *Verbeia*

ÍNDICE
LINGÜÍSTICA

LITERATURA

RESEÑAS

LINGÜÍSTICA

English at Primary Education In Madrid. Biliteracy or Bilingualism? Writing Skills

Inglés en Educación Primaria en Madrid. ¿Bialfabetismo o bilingüismo? Destrezas escritas

Juana María Anguita Acero
Universidad Alfonso X El Sabio
janguace@uax.es

Resumen

Este estudio pretende hacer una valoración (primer acercamiento) del nivel de inglés escrito de alumnos de 3º de Educación Primaria de dos colegios de la Comunidad de Madrid (bilingüe y no bilingüe). La metodología utilizada es tanto cuantitativa (recuento de fallos encontrados en un dictado realizado en clase) como cualitativa (análisis de dichos fallos). Los resultados obtenidos muestran que más de un 90% de los alumnos analizados cometen fallos en un dictado adecuado a su nivel y que, a pesar del esfuerzo realizado por la Administración desde el curso 2004-2005 por implantar una educación bilingüe de calidad (con más centros, auxiliares de conversación, horas de inglés y profesores habilitados), el colegio bilingüe tiene un nivel relativamente bajo y el no bilingüe está por debajo del anterior. Estos datos indican que, aunque la enseñanza de inglés en la Comunidad de Madrid ha mejorado desde su implantación, aún no ha conseguido los objetivos pretendidos (que en 2º, 4º y 6º de Educación Primaria los alumnos obtengan los niveles A1, A2 y B1). Sería necesario ampliar el estudio para confirmar este hecho.

Palabras clave: bialfabetismo, bilingüismo, destrezas escritas, Educación Primaria

Abstract

This study aims to assess (first approach) the level of written English of 3rd graders from two Primary Education schools in the Community of Madrid (bilingual and non-bilingual). Both quantitative (amount of mistakes made in a dictation activity carried out in class) and qualitative (analysis of aforementioned mistakes) measures have been used. More

than 90% of the analysed students made mistakes in the graded dictation showing that, although the Government has made a great effort to implement quality bilingual education since the 2004-2005 academic year (by increasing the number of centres, language assistants, English lessons and qualified teachers), the students in the bilingual school have a low level of written English and those from the non-bilingual school an even lower one. This suggests that although the teaching of English in the Community of Madrid has improved since the program's implementation, the intended objectives have not yet been fulfilled (students from 2nd, 3rd and 6th grades of Primary Education reach A1, A2 and B1 levels). It would be necessary to broaden this study in order to confirm this fact.

Keywords: biliteracy, bilingualism, writing skills, Primary Education

1.   INTRODUCTION

Throughout history, all civilizations have experienced the need to learn a foreign language. Usually, this need has been associated with the prevalence of a certain "empire". Looking back, Greek, Latin, French and Spanish are the main languages that have assumed this role. This day in age English is taking over and is the most commonly learned second language.

In Spain the study of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) is becoming increasingly important. For that reason, it is worth observing the strengths and weaknesses of the program and studying whether or not the teaching-learning process of English is appropriate in achieving intended communicative objectives. A comprehensive analysis of all these aspects would need to look at all language skills.

The English level of many Spanish learners is often behind that of other European students' (Eurostat, 2013). Why do students from The Netherlands, the Scandinavian Peninsula, Germany or even Romania have a better English level —both spoken and written— than Spanish students? Why do they become biliterate and bilingual more quickly despite the fact that they sometimes have less guided learning hours?

The answers to these questions cannot be exclusively found in the teaching hours. We have to take into account other aspects such as the Indoeuropean roots of the languages in use (Germanic or Romance, among many others), students' exposure to English, students' profile, social aspects (the dubbing of films, second language learning tradition, family background and profile, or history), teachers' training, and teaching methodologies and techniques, among others (Martín, 2000 y Pastor, 2004).

The following research is a first approach to the study of English writing skills in two Spanish schools. We will focus on work done by two groups of Primary Education 3rd

graders (from two schools —one bilingual and one non-bilingual— located in the southern area of Madrid).

In this study we try to prove that English-Spanish biliteracy and bilingualism could be improved in the aforementioned schools. We also try to explain why this is through the classification and analysis of the problems encountered and the way students face them. This will constitute a milestone towards the improvement of their academic results.

2. RELATED LITERATURE

2.1. Literacy and biliteracy. An overview

When people talk about literacy, they usually refer to the development of reading and writing skills in any mother tongue (henceforth L1) and when they talk about biliteracy, they refer to the development of the same skills but in two languages, usually the L1 and a second language (henceforth L2).

However, is literacy as simple as we might think? According to UNESCO (2005: 147): "At first glance, 'literacy' would seem to be a term that everyone understands. But at the same time, literacy as a concept has proved to be both complex and dynamic [...]". Reading and writing do not only involve learning a set code and being able to decode it to interpret messages and information. When individuals learn to read and write they are not isolated, they receive constant input from outside and, in most occasions, make use of other basic skills (such as listening and speaking) that complement the other two.

Meek (1991), Lawton and Gordon (1996), UNESCO (2005) and UNICEF (2007), among many others, provide a wide range of definitions of the term but there is not a generally accepted one. Blake and Hanley (1995: 89) state that "[t]he attribute of literacy is generally recognised as one of the key educational objectives of compulsory schooling. It refers to the ability to read and write to an appropriate level of fluency". This is probably the definition that best applies to the present study.

From the moment babies are born a communication process is put into practice to understand and be understood. Reading and writing are a step further in maturity and communication processes but there is no ideal age at which these abilities should be developed (Read, 2007).

On this matter, Read (2007: 17) points out:

> When children start learning [...] at primary school, there is usually an emphasis on developing listening and speaking skills. Through listening [...], children are led naturally into speaking. [...], children gradually develop the ability to produce language and to interact with others in a more extended way.

If these initial skills are not well established, evolution in communication cannot be guaranteed. As Read (2007) has highlighted, there is a gradual development.

Therefore, reading and writing are two additional basic skills students have to start developing in their early years. Although, as previously mentioned, there is no specific age or time at which they should master them. The education legislation in force (among other factors) will establish and make decisions about what, when and how students should acquire the aforementioned skills.

In this regard, Read (2007: 48) states:

> One of the main debates is not about whether children should learn to read and write [...] but when it is most beneficial to start. The answer is not clear-cut not conclusive and depends on the context and a range of factors, such as the children's L1, and whether this shares the Roman script, the children's existing literacy skills in L1[...].

In the learning process to communicate, taking into account the logical steps to develop L1 communication skills (listening, speaking, reading and writing), reading and writing come after listening and speaking. The same pattern should apply to biliteracy. Unfortunately, this does not always happen.

Traditional teaching methods, such as the grammar-translation method that started being used in the late XVIIIth century and that has continued being used —although substantially less— until today (Martín, 2000), focuses on reading and writing, disregarding listening and speaking. At the present time, the tendency is to develop the four skills paying particular attention to speaking and listening (communicative approach) in order to fulfil social communicative needs.

Nowadays, biliteracy plays an important role within schools that may or may not follow a bilingual program because learning a foreign language is compulsory in any modern educational system. Biliteracy therefore contributes to the development of the two aforementioned skills (reading and writing).

That being said, schools should make a sound interpretation of the different curricula and legislation to ensure that students develop reading and writing skills.

Byalistok, Luk and Kwan (2005: 44) highlight that:

> There are two reasons that literacy may proceed differently for bilingual and monolingual children: The first is that bilinguals develop several of the background skills for literacy differently from monolinguals; the second is that bilinguals may

have the opportunity to transfer the skills acquired for reading in one language to reading in the other. In both cases, the relation between the writing systems in the two languages determines the commonality in the cognitive skills required for reading and may also determine the extent to which bilingualism affects literacy acquisition.

The educational community and the administration should recognize that, even though bilingualism in English is a common aim in countries such as Spain, the proper atmosphere and conditions must be provided for it to become a reality.

2.2. Bilingualism and the concept of culture

Bilingualism is a broad term in which two languages, cultures and many other aspects are involved. Here we are referring to bilingual competence since we are focused on the first stages that may lead to bilingualism in the future. Attending lessons at a bilingual school does not mean becoming bilingual but developing bilingual competence to a certain extent. These two terms, "competence" and "bilingualism" are, according to the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (henceforth CEFRL), identified and summarized in three very simple words "knowledge, skills and attitudes" (CEFRL, 2001: 101-130).

Concerning bilingualism, NALDIC (National Association for Language Development in the Curriculum), which is the national association for English as an additional language (EAL) in the UK, states that it "[…] is the ability to use two languages" (Franson, 2011). They admit that this definition is very simple for such a complicated concept. Bilingualism is defined this way because there is lack of agreement on how much knowledge of two languages is required for someone to be considered bilingual.

Bathia's and Ritchie's definition combines the two terms ("bilingual" and "competence"): "Bilingual Competence is defined as 'the ability to use the target languages effectively and appropriately for authentic personal, educational, social, and/or work-related purposes'". (Bathia and Richie, 2004: 549).

This definition involves having the ability to communicate (communicative competence) and to communicate effectively, which also requires having a deep cultural knowledge of the languages to be used.

We can find traces of our culture both in the L1 and in the L2 we try to learn. Spanish is spoken in different territories around the world and, although there are objective rules established by the Spanish Royal Academy that apply to the Spanish language, there are always specific nuances linked to the place we come from. This also applies to English. In

13

consequence, can we say that English follows the same standards everywhere? Can we state that we all speak the same English? The answer is Yes and No.

Yes, because we speak the international English that can be understood globally. That is to say, English has become a lingua franca that makes understanding between people possible.

> The need for a global language is particularly appreciated by the international academy and business communities, and it is here that the adoption of a single lingua franca is most in evidence [...] as well as thousands of individual contacts being made daily all over the globe. (Crystal, 2003:13).

No, because we do not speak English with the same features as English native speakers do in their countries of origin (the United States of America, Australia, Ireland or South Africa, etc.). What most people speak is a hybrid English, in which cultural aspects are disregarded.

2.3. Bilingual Education in the Community of Madrid

In Spain there is a national education law (LOMCE, 2013) which regulates education in a broad sense, and two royal decrees both for Primary (126/2014) and Secondary Education (1105/2014). Each community is completely autonomous concerning their regional education legislation (always based on the national one). The legislation in Madrid is related to decrees 89/2014 (Primary Education) and 48/2015 (Secondary Education) which establish the curricula for both educational stages.

There is also total freedom for the Spanish regions to decide to what extent and how to implement bilingualism. In Madrid, there are two orders: Order 5958/2010 (Primary Education) and Order 3331/2010 (Secondary Education). Legislation for private schools and high schools is different but this paper will focus on public primary education.

The main features of bilingual primary schools and high schools are related to the subjects and number of lessons taught in English, teachers' training and profile requirements and external exams.

Students have lessons in English 5 days a week. The only subjects that are compulsory to be taught in Spanish are Mathematics, Spanish Language and Literature (Primary Education). In Secondary Education there is also a second foreign language in addition to English.

In Primary Education, Social Science, Natural Science and Arts have to be taught in English. Schools have the freedom to include more subjects in English (usually Music, Physical

14

Education or both). The same criteria apply to Secondary Education; the only difference between the two is the existence of additional subjects such as History, Geography, Biology and Geology.

Teachers are required to obtain the *Habilitación* or *Acreditación* certificates (by passing an exam) from the Community of Madrid (C1-C2 levels) or validate their Cambridge or Trinity C1 or C2 certificates.

In relation to external exams, it is compulsory for the students to pass certain external tests (usually Trinity or Cambridge, as agreed upon by the Community of Madrid). These tests take place in 3rd and 6th grades of Primary Education; and the 2nd and 4th years of Secondary Education. Something essential to be taken into account is that if students in t 6th grade of Primary do not obtain the level expected by the Community, they will not have the opportunity to enter the Bilingual Section at Bilingual High Schools, just the Bilingual Program. This is stated in Order 3331 (2010: 221).

In Madrid, non-bilingual primary schools and high schools usually include English in their compulsory subjects. The differences between bilingual and non-bilingual schools are the subjects taught in English (just English Language in non-bilingual schools) and the amount of weekly hours (3 hours in non-bilingual schools).

2.4. Errors and mistakes

As in our study we analyse the errors and mistakes Spanish students make in written English, this section will highlight those topics.

The learning process of an L2 is never perfect. The lack of knowledge in that L2 leads to logical errors and mistakes. Corder (1967) differentiates between the two by saying that errors happen due to a capability failure, while mistakes are related to a performance failure. Nevertheless, the difference is not always clear.

In this process there is an evolution towards perfection where different stages or *interlanguages* (Selinker, 1982) exist. Interlanguages are independent languages halfway between the L1 and the L2 that the student is learning. There is no limited number of interlanguages, the amount of them is not linked to the type of L2 being learned and they do not necessarily involve a perfect learning process (Marin, 2013: 182-198).

Alexopoulou (2010) studies interlanguages along with errors and mistakes based on the difficulties and problems any foreign language learner encounters.

Marin (2013) tries to explain different error levels and identifies three major groups: errors by linguistic category; errors by linguistic levels; and target modification taxonomy. He also presents some strategies learners use to communicate. Among them, he found that

simplification, *generalization*, *omission*, *silence*, *interference* and *transference* are the most relevant.

Taking into account that when learning any L2 there are some phenomena that may arise and that this usually happens depending on the genetic distance between the users' L1 and L2, Alexopoulou (2010) pays especial attention to *fossilization*, *transfer*, *systematicity*, *variability*, *permeability* and *acculturation*. As this taxonomy is very important for our study, we will analyse it in depth.

Tarone (2006: 748) states that "[c]entral to the notion of interlanguage is the phenomenon of fossilization —that process in which the learner's interlanguage stops developing, apparently permanently". Sometimes users feel that they cannot improve or that their L2 proficiency level is not advancing.

As for *transfer*, Corder (1981: 99-100) states that:

> Transfer has usually been invoked as a learning strategy —the incorporation into the interlanguage grammar of mother tongue systems. [...] The notion, however, of 'transfer' as a learning strategy would account for the generation of sentences having mother tongue-like features which, where if the L1, system were not identical with the L2 would be counted as 'interference errors.

This is also a very common phenomenon since learners tend to take advantage of resources they are familiar with and that may fit their communicative needs. The similarities between L1 and L2 cause users to take risks. When this transfer becomes common, it leads to the following phenomenon: *systematicity*. That is why Corder (1981: 67) also highlights:

> The terms interlanguage and interlingua suggest that the learner's language will show systematic features both of the target language and of other languages he may know, most obviously of his mother tongue. In other words his system is a mixed or intermediate one.

Variability occurs when there is a variation due to inconsistent hypothesis or data. Corder (1981: 75) once more explains that "[...] variability in the characteristics of the interlanguage of language learners can be accounted for by appeal of the influences of inconsistent data, a variety of different heuristic hypotheses, and differing treatments in teaching [...]".

Variability is sometimes associated with permeability but they are different phenomena. Sharwood (1988: 175) explains it very clearly by indicating that "[t]he notion of

16

permeability therefore essentially reflected not only the greater degree of instability possessed by learner grammatical systems as opposed to those of native speakers but also to the special role of the L1 system in L2 grammars".

In this sense, permeability is not just related to the proficiency level of users in the L2 but also to the L2 itself, its grammar (closer or further from the L1).

The last phenomenon, *acculturation*, is defined by Berry (2005: 698) as "[…] the dual process of cultural and psychological change that takes place as a result of contact between two or more cultural groups and their individual members".

Marin (2013) states that acculturation is probably the most sensitive phenomenon because of the consequences that the contact with and practice of both L1 and L2 may trigger.

As we have seen, the concepts "error" and "mistake" have different connotations and may involve changes in many linguistic and cultural aspects. Although the exposed phenomena can happen in all languages being learned, each linguistic system will have specific samples.

3. RESEARCH DESIGN

3.1. Objectives

The main aim of this research is to see whether Spanish 3rd graders from bilingual and non-bilingual Primary Education schools in the Community of Madrid are proficient enough in English (writing skills). Depending on the results, we will be able to state if we are effectively implementing bilingual education or if we are still focusing on biliteracy.

The second aim is to analyse the types of errors and mistakes Spanish third graders make when writing in English.

The third aim is to reflect on whether the English teaching-learning process is better in the bilingual or in the non-bilingual school according to the results obtained.

3.2. Method (methodology, participants, instrument, procedures)

3.2.1. Methodology

The methodology used to carry out this research is quantitative as well as qualitative.

It is quantitative as we study the amount of errors and mistakes made by 46 Primary Education third graders when writing their first dictation in a bilingual and in a non-bilingual school. The research is likewise qualitative as we study the nature of the mistakes found according to the classification discussed in Section 2.4. of the related literature.

17

3.2.2. Participants

There were 46 students (boys and girls between 8-9 years old) who wrote a dictation to be analysed. 23 of those students follow an English bilingual program while the other 23 receive a traditional Spanish monolingual education where English is just one subject. There were 2 teachers (1 from a bilingual school and 1 from a non-bilingual school) who read the dictation.

3.2.3. Instrument

We took a dictation from Essential Grammar in Use for elementary learners (Murphy, 2007: 12-13).

It should be noted that in the aforementioned pages (12 and 13) there are no specific dictations but several sentences related to the verb 'to be' in the present simple tense. The dictation is therefore a combination of twelve sentences chosen by the teachers. Both the vocabulary and the grammar follow the Primary Education curriculum established in the Community of Madrid (Decree 89/2014, 4th July).

> My name is Lisa.
> I'm 22.
> I'm American.
> I'm from Chicago.
> I'm a student.
> I'm not married.
> My brother is very tall.
> He's a policeman.
> It's ten o'clock.
> You're late again.
> Tom isn't interested in Politics.
> He's interested in Music. (Murphy, 2007: 12-13)

This edition of *Essential Grammar in Use* for elementary learners is addressed to people who want to learn EFL at an introductory stage. According to the CEFR, this book is useful for A1-B1 students (the book itself includes this information).

Contents on pages 12 and 13 correspond to the first unit where the verb "to be" is presented.

As stated by the Primary Education curriculum of the Community of Madrid, this type of content, along with the appropriate writing and listening skills necessary to write a dictation, start to be studied in 1st grade. In the following years, contents are expanded and build on previous knowledge. Consequently, students participating in this research should be able to understand and replicate each of the sentences in the dictation.

Furthermore, by the end of 3rd grade, it is compulsory for all students to participate in some external examinations in order to assess their level of Mathematics, Spanish Language and English Language.

As for English, students are expected to reach, at the least, an A1 level (both in bilingual and non-bilingual schools). Therefore, students from bilingual schools should find this dictation easy and those from non-bilingual schools at least achievable.

3.2.4. Procedures

The dictation was performed at the beginning of the second term. By that time, students were more familiar with English as they had been in class for nearly four months. Additionally, they had studied English for the previous two academic years

As a first step, students practiced listening, reading, basic grammar, speaking and pronunciation daily so as to assimilate the rules.

As there are some common writing rules in English and Spanish (for example, the capitalization of proper nouns), simple parallelisms between both languages were studied. Students also copied texts from other sources in order to become familiar with words and how to write them.

After nearly three months with these routines, students faced their first dictation in February 2017 (our test).

In order to follow objective guidelines concerning listening tests, we have followed those established by Cambridge and Trinity exams (listening exercises were repeated twice and reading speed took into account students' grade).

Once the dictation was finished, a final reading was done at a normal speed.

As for the study of the data obtained, a sentence by sentence analysis was conducted. There were 12 sentences in total that were examined by focusing on the errors and mistakes encountered and the amount of students who made them.

The dictations were analysed in two separate blocks. One corresponded to the bilingual school and the other to the non-bilingual school.

The data obtained has helped uncover whether or not differences exist between bilingual and non-bilingual education; if so, whether or not those differences are relevant and therefore if bilingual education programs are working. In the case that they are not, we could suggest how to improve them.

3.3. Results

For reasons of space, it is not possible to include all of the responses in which errors and mistakes could be easily identified; therefore we provide some of the most remarkable examples.

3.3.1. Bilingual school

1. My name is Lisa.

All students wrote this sentence correctly. Only one of them wrote "Lisa" in lower-case letters. We can consider that a slip.

2. I'm 22.

There were 4 students who made mistakes in this sentence.

a) 2 of them wrote "I'm" as "**Im**", which means they were not familiar with apostrophes (punctuation rules). We can state this because later in their dictations they repeated the same mistake.

b) 1 student wrote "I'm" phonetically ("**Aim**"). This mistake shows that the student (who repeated the same mistake later in the dictation) was not familiar with the English spelling and pronunciation patterns. He/she transferred Spanish rules (you write what you hear).

c) 1 student wrote "I" without capitalization ("**i**"). In this particular case, it could have been a slip since this mistake was not made again.

3. I'm American.

This sentence was wrongly written by 10 students. Mistakes can be classified as:

a) "American" was not capitalized by 5 students which was a capitalization mistake.

b) 4 students wrote "America" instead of "American". This was a listening problem.

c) 2 students wrote "I'm" without an apostrophe (punctuation mistake). Out of these 2, there was one who made a spelling mistake ("Ameri**ri**can").

d) 2 students ended "American" with a spelling mistake: "american**d**" (spelling + capitalization) and "American**t**".

e) 1 student wrote "**Aim**" instead of "I'm". As previously stated, this mistake shows that the student was not familiar with the English spelling and pronunciation patterns. He/she transferred Spanish rules.

4. I'm from Chicago.

This sentence was wrongly written by 8 students.

a) 5 students had problems with the spelling of "Chicago": **c**hicago, Chi**go**, Chicago**n**, Chiga**g**o, **Ch**cago. Some of them can be considered slips while others, such as chicago, reflect capitalization problems.

b) 2 students wrote "from" incorrectly (fro**n**, fro**on**). It is very common to have problems with final -m as this letter never appears in final position in Spanish. Students tend to pronounce/read it incorrectly by using -n.

c) 2 students wrote "**Im**" instead of "I'm", which shows a lack concerning punctuation rules (use of apostrophes).

d) 1 student, the same as in the previous sentences containing "I'm", wrote it phonetically as "**Aim**" (see explanation in sentence 2).

5. I'm a student.

There were 9 students who made a mistake when writing this sentence.

a) 3 students wrote "I'm" incorrectly. 2 of them omitted the apostrophe (punctuation mistake), "**Im**". These students were the same as in the previous sentences. 1 of them had previously written the word phonetically as "**Aim**". For further explanation, see sentences above.

b) 1 student did not write the indefinite article "a" (listening problem).

c) 7 students wrote the word "student" incorrectly.

2 of them wrote the word phonetically, which shows an unawareness of English writing and pronunciation rules as well as Spanish-English transfer (stud**i**ent and st**iu**dent).

2 students were clearly affected by Spanish pronunciation as they wrote an initial e- before -s- (**e**student). They overgeneralized the Spanish rule (transfer problem).

1 student did not write the final -t, likely because in Spanish there are no words with this ending (**studen**).

1 student, student, maybe committing the largest error, added an apostrophe (stude**n't**).

1 student had trouble with subject-verb-adjective agreement (a student**s**).

6. I'm not married.

As in all the previous sentences, there were 2 students whose mistake was related to the lack of apostrophe in "I'm" (**Im**) and another student who wrote "I'm" phonetically (**Aim**).

There were 12 students in total who made some kind of mistake related to this sentence and more specifically with the word "married" (marrie**t**, **madrid**, marr**it**, marri**d**, ma**rit**, ma**rid**, mar**ied**). These students had problems with the endings due to phonetic issues). Once again, in Spanish words are written as they sound.

7. My brother is very tall.

10 students made mistakes in this sentence.

a) 8 students wrote the word "brother" incorrectly. The main issue was phonetic as "th" is pronounced /ð/. This sound could be identified with the Spanish /d/ (overgeneralization and transfer). We found the following responses: bro**d**er, br**hod**er, bro**t**er and bro**t**er**h**. The examples containing "h" show that students had seen/read the word sometime before.

b) 3 students omitted part of the sentence. They might not have known how to write the words or simply got lost.

c) 6 students wrote "very" with -b. 2 of them also wrote -i instead of -y, and another one wrote **brari**.

d) 5 students wrote "tall" incorrectly. All of them used -o- instead of -a- (phonetic mistake) and some of them had problems with the -ll ending (**toll**, **tol**, **talk**, **top**). They did not know that they might be using words with different meanings, such as toll, talk and top.

8. He is a policeman.

Only 5 pupils wrote this sentence correctly.

a) 1 student avoided writing the sentence.

b) 6 students had problems with "He's". 2 of them omitted the subject and 2 others used the possessive pronoun "**his**". In both cases students showed the existence of phonetic problems and a lack of knowledge of English grammatical rules. 1 student wrote "her." Finally, another student wrote "He's" as "he is". He might not have interiorized the punctuation rules (apostrophes).

c) 15 students could not write "policeman" correctly. In all the cases, they wrote it phonetically. 14 of them wrote: poli**s**man, p**lis**man, p**olse**me**n**, pol**es**man, **polation**, polic**i**man, poli**e**man, polic**i**eman, and poli**o**man.

d) One student wrote the collective noun "police". This student probably had doubts about the compound word "policeman" and opted to write something he/she knew that could be correct.

9. It's ten o'clock.

5 students wrote this sentence correctly and 6 more made only a very simple mistake related to the word "o'clock". They forgot the apostrophe. English punctuation is difficult to understand for Spanish students at early stages.

As for the rest, we had the following examples:

a) 1 student omitted the sentence.

b) Concerning, "It's", 3 students just wrote the pronoun "It" without the verb. They showed a lack of grammatical knowledge, as in English all sentences need a subject. 4 students wrote "Its" which could mean two things: either they had problems with apostrophes or they lacked grammatical knowledge (subject+verb "to be" is not the same as a possessive pronoun).

c) 11 students had problems with the spelling of "o'clock". The different spelling options were: o'clo**k**, **oclok**, **ocloc**, **okolok**, **o clock**, **o kloc**, **o clok**. All of them were related to phonetics and the transfer from Spanish rules.

10. You're late again.

As in sentences 8 and 9, only 5 students made no mistakes. 2 other students wrote this sentence perfectly but did not contract the verb. Their sentence was: "You are late again." 1 student omitted it.

15 students made some kind of mistake.

a) 8 students wrote "You're" incorrectly. 2 wrote the possessive adjective "**Your**". Although they are pronounced in the same way (homophones), they are not interchangeable. Students showed a grammatical lack.

1 student wrote the subject but not the verb ("**You**"). Again an important grammatical mistake took place.

5 students showed a lack of very basic English by writing: **yoo ar**, **yuor**, **yor**, **llour are**. They wrote things that sound similar but have no meaning.

b) 8 students wrote "late" wrongly. In most cases, they made a phonetic mistake: **leit**, **leyt**, **lite***, late**r***, **liter***, **let***. "Lite", "liter" and "let" (with asterisks) show that the students did not recognize the pronunciation of the English vowels. As for "later", although this word exists, the student might have been absent for a second or might have misinterpreted.

c) Concerning "again", 2 students omitted it, while 11 wrote it phonetically: **egen**, **agan**, **egain**. "**Egen**" was written by the majority.

11. Tom isn't interested in Politics.

This sentence posed two main difficulties: "interested" and "Politics". 6 students wrote the whole sentence correctly with only one mistake, the capitalization of "Politics" ("**p**olitics").

a) 5 students did not capitalize "Tom". This showed a problem with the capitalization of proper nouns, a rule that exists in both Spanish and English.

b) 3 students did not know the contracted negative form of the verb "to be". 3rd person singular was written as: **in't**, **isen't**, **is**.

c) 11 students wrote "interested" phonetically. Adjectives taken from participial forms are very difficult to understand at early stages. We found the following responses: interest**id**, interest**ided**, interest**ind**, interest**ik**, interes**ited**, interes**it**. "Interestid" was written most often. This mistake could not be considered extremely important (Spanish phonetic transfer). Listening problems were quite obvious.

d) Concerning "Politics", 7 students wrote it correctly but in lower-case letters. 10 students had problems with the capitalization and the last syllable of the word. When two or more consonants appear together (cluster), Spanish students tend to have problems as this never happens in their mother tongue. The responses were: politi**c**, politi**k**, politi**es**, politic**ts**, poleti**st**, politi**s**, poleti**ss**.

12. He's interested in Music.

The last sentence was correctly written by 9 students who just made a small mistake related to the capitalization of the word "Music" (**m**usic)

a) 3 students omitted the subject while 1 used the possessive pronoun "his" instead of "he's". Although the pronunciation is similar, they mean different things.

b) As in sentence 11, 10 students had spelling problems concerning "interested". Only one student corrected his/her mistake the second time.

The variations in the spelling of "interested" were the same as in sentence 11.

c) 16 students wrote "Music" correctly. As with "Politics", students disregarded capitalization.

1 student omitted the word while 6 wrote it phonetically: m**iu**sic, m**iu**si**k**, musi**k**, m**iu**se**k**, m**o**sic.

3.3.2. Non-Bilingual school

1. My name is Lisa.

a) 6 students wrote the sentence correctly and 6 only had problems concerning the spelling of the proper name: Li**ss**a, L**yss**a, **E**lisa, Li**ssi**. These mistakes could be considered unimportant compared to, for example, those related to verbs, common nouns, adjectives or adverbs. Proper nouns do not always follow a fixed pronunciation pattern (there are many proper nouns of foreign origin), particularly diminutives.

b) Concerning "My", there was a tendency to write it phonetically (8 students): M**ay**, M**i**, M**ai**.

c) "Name" was wrongly written by 8 students. There were several responses that indicated that the students had doubts about some letters (nam**n**, 1 student); 3 students wrote it phonetically as **neim**, **neime**, **neimei**, and 4 students showed lack of knowledge about what they had to write: **men**, **neen**, **nay**. This was an unexpected mistake as "name" is considered a basic word that students should recognize.

d) Only 1 student seemed to have doubt concerning "is" and he/she wrote: **its**. This mistake showed problems related to sentence structure.

2. I'm 22.

Only 4 students wrote this sentence correctly and 3 forgot the apostrophe in "I'm" ("**Im**") which was not considered significant compared to other mistakes.

a) 6 students disregarded the subject in "I'm": **An**, **Am**, **Aim**. This showed that they had not interiorized the order and compulsory elements of the English sentence (S+V+O). They followed the Spanish pattern where the subject is not compulsory. 10 more students showed serious difficulties. It seems that they tried to follow the dictation closely but

produced letter combinations very different than the proper spelling: **haim**, **ham**, **hoim**, **Aym**, **and**, **Ay**.

1 student wrote the sentence without any kind of separation between words, reflecting a lack of English knowledge: "**imtientithu**".

b) Number "22" was surprising because there were 3 students who wrote **12**, 1 student who wrote **92**, another one who did not write anything, and 3 more who wrote the number as: **tienti**, **ten two**, **toaty two**.

3. I'm American.

This sentence was written correctly by 5 students. The mistakes of the other 18 could be classified as:

a) "I'm" was written with the same mistakes as in sentence 2. Some of them lacked the subject, wrote it phonetically or invented the contraction.

b) Only 9 students wrote "American" correctly. 6 students wrote "America" instead of "American". 1 student wrote "Amer**y**ca". This could be a listening problem.

c) 8 students wrote phonetically what they thought they had heard but it showed they had neither understood nor recognized the word "American": **Amico**, **aneri cart**, **a meyical**, **arerica**, **Averi cart**, **a mami can**, **a merri can**.

4. I'm from Chicago.

This sentence was correctly written by 4 students. One of them made a small mistake related to the spelling of Chicago: Chi**garrot**. This could be considered a listening problem.

a) "I'm" was wrongly written by most of the students. 2 students wrote "**I**" and forgot about the verb. There was a tendency to write either the verb or the pronoun: **Am**, **An**. These examples show Spanish-English transfer issues and lack of listening skills. In general terms, students did not understand neither the verb "to be" nor the personal pronouns: **Ain**, **aiam**, **on**, **ai**, **and**, **aim**, **ay**, **haim**.

b) 6 students wrote "from" correctly while 7 wrote "fro**n**" It is very common to have problems with final -m as this letter never appears in final position in Spanish. This could be considered a transfer issue. 9 students did not understand this word, writing: **fon**, **form** (maybe in these 2 cases there was a listening mistake), also **fou**, **Ø**, **for**, **four**, **frod**, **froim**.

c) Only 8 students had problems with the spelling of "Chicago": **c**hicago, **chicoli**, **chigarrot**, **c**hica**c**o, Chicago**u**, Chica**d**o, **sicatu**, Chi**go**, Chicago**n**, **Ø**. As we saw, some of them could be considered slips while others, such as **c**hicago, reflected capitalization problems. Lack of knowledge and listening issues also had to be taken into account.

5. I'm a student.

No student wrote this sentence correctly.

25

a) Only 3 students wrote "I'm" correctly. There were 10 students who made mistakes related to phonetics and wrote: **Aim**, **am**, **im**, **Im**, **ain**, **ay am**. It seemed that the rest of the students did not know what to write: **Ø**, **a em** (among other options).

b) Just 1 student identified the indefinite article "a" while the other 22 did not write anything.

c) As for "student", only 1 student wrote it correctly.

There was a tendency to write the word phonetically, which showed an unawareness of English rules concerning writing and pronunciation. We also found examples of Spanish-English transfer (stud**i**ent, st**iu**dent, st**yi**den).

Several students were clearly influenced by Spanish pronunciation writing an e- before the -s- (**e**student, **e**studan, **e**studon, **e**studidet, **e**stiuran, **e**stution, **e**stiudon, **e**schudam, **e**stutan, **e**stiubed). Here they overgeneralised a Spanish rule (transfer problem).

Some of the answers were: **Ø**, **studon**, **es tiudam**, **study**, **staidon**, **stelven**, **steven**.

6. I'm not married.

No student wrote this sentence correctly.

Only 7 out of 23 students were able to write a sentence close to the one in the dictation: I'm not ma**rret**, **Him not merrit**, **An not merry**, **Am note merry**, **Im not merit**, **I'm not merry**, **I not merriet**, **im not marrying**, **hay not merit**. Only the first example seems to reflect an understanding of the dictation while the other 6 students seem to have identified three phonetic elements and tried to write them. The rest of the responses were unintelligible.

"I'm" was written like in the previous sentences already analyzed.

There were different spellings for "married", too. Apart from problems related to word endings due to phonetic issues (Spanish words are written as they sound), there was an important lack of English language knowledge.

7. My brother is very tall.

Only 1 student wrote the sentence without any mistakes. 2 had non-meaningful mistakes: My **bhother** is very **toll** and My brother is very **tool**. We considered them spelling and phonetic mistakes.

a) 5 students wrote the word "brother" correctly. The main issue was phonetic as "th" is pronounced /ð/. This sound could be identified with the Spanish /d/ (overgeneralization and transfer). We found the following responses: **frod**er, **roll**er, bro**d**er, **drod**er, **rost**er, br**hod**er, bro**t**er, **bho**ther, **bhrothrl**, **brhot**er, bro**htehr**. The examples containing "h" showed that students had seen/read the word before.

b) 1 student omitted the whole sentence. He/she probably did not know how to write it or got lost.

c) "is" was written correctly by 17 students. The other 6 either omitted it or wrote it as "its". This could be considered a phonetic and grammatical mistake.

d) 11 students wrote "very" correctly. Some switched -v with -b. Others used -i instead of -y or -r-instead of -rr-.

e) Only 1 student wrote "tall" correctly. The rest tended to use -o- instead of -a- (phonetic mistake) and some had problems with the ending -ll. They wrote -l or other endings from words that sound similarly (**toll**, **tol**, **tou**, **tool**, **told**, **tale**, **stol**, **tom**, **tory**). Some used words with different meaning, such as toll, told, tory and tool without realizing.

f) 4 students omitted the word.

8. He is a policeman.

No pupil wrote this sentence correctly.

a) 1 student avoided writing the sentence.

b) 3 students had a small problem with "He's". They wrote **Hes** (no apostrophe) and **His** (possessive pronoun). In both cases these students had phonetic problems and a lack of knowledge concerning English grammatical rules. The rest of the students (20) omitted the subject and wrote the verb as can be done in Spanish (phonetic and transfer issue).

c) Only 2 students spelled "policeman" correctly. The rest wrote it phonetically: poli**s**man, poli**sm**e**n**, poli**sm**e, police**Ø**, poli**sn**an, poli**sn**a**Ø**. 3 examples could not be read.

9. It's ten o'clock.

1 student wrote the sentence perfectly. 2 made a little mistake by not writing the apostrophe in "It's" (**Its**) which shows a lack of grammatical knowledge (subject+verb versus possessive pronoun). 5 more had some spelling mistakes concerning the same word (**I'ts**, **Its**, **I'st**). The rest of them omitted the subject, as in previous sentences, and wrote the verb on its own.

a) 2 students omitted the sentence.

b) Concerning, "It's", most of students omitted the subject once more. This mistake showed a lack of grammatical knowledge as in English all sentences need a subject.

c) 13 students wrote "o'clock" correctly, 8 had spelling problems and 2 did not write anything. The different spelling options were: o'clo**k**, **oclok**, **ocloc**, **a clok, clock**. All of them were related to phonetic and transfer (Spanish-English) issues.

10. You're late again.

This sentence seemed to be very complicated for the students as none of them wrote it correctly. Only 6 wrote something readable.

27

a) 4 out of the 6 students wrote "You're" incorrectly. They wrote the possessive adjective "**Your**". Although the words are homophones, they are not interchangeable. Students showed a lack of knowledge of grammatical rules.

The other 2 students wrote a nonexistent word: **Yoy**.

b) 2 (out of 6) students wrote "late" correctly. In most cases, it was written phonetically: **leit**, **leigt**.

c) Only 1 student spelled "again" correctly although he/she did not clearly separate this word from the previous one. The other responses followed a phonetic spelling: **agani**, **eggan**, **game**, **ogen**.

11. Tom isn't interested in Politics.

This sentence posed two main difficulties: "interested" and "Politics". No student wrote this sentence correctly. Only 4 of them wrote something readable.

a) 2 of the 4 students had capitalization problems concerning proper nouns. They did not write "Tom" with capital letters. This issue showed that they had not interiorized the rule in their L1.

b) Only 1 student wrote "isn't" correctly. The other 3 did not know the contracted negative form of the verb "to be," writing: **is**, **isen**, **is an't**.

c) None of the 4 students wrote "interested" correctly. All of them wrote different phonetic options. It seems that students were more familiar with the adjective from, adding the ending -ing instead of -ed for the participial form. We found the following spellings: interest**ing**, interest**in**, **intreit**, **intreti**.

d) Concerning "Politics", only 2 wrote it correctly. The other 22 had problems with capitalization (they used lower-case letters mostly). As in previous sentences, when two or more consonants appeared together (cluster), students had problems as this never happens in Spanish. In consequence, we found: **p**oliti**s**, **p**oliti**c**, Polit**an**s, **p**oliti**k**, **Ø**, **p**oli**ce**, Politic**k**s, **p**oliti**k**, Politic**k**, **p**olit**es**. Several responses could not be read.

12. He's interested in Music.

The last sentence is probably the most complicated to analyze. Maybe students felt tired as a good number of them omitted it. None of them wrote the sentence correctly. There was only 1 logical sample: **I's interestit in Music**.

In that sentence, we could see that "He's interested" had been phonetically interpreted and the aspiration of the personal pronoun "he" was disregarded.

a) "Music" was the only word that could be analyzed from all the students. They tended to make phonetic interpretations:

28

12 students wrote the word correctly with the capitalization variations and no spelling mistakes.

8 students wrote words that could not be interpreted, were wrongly written or omitted it.

The other 3 answers were good examples of Spanish transfer: **miusik**, **musi** and **musik**.

b) Something that should be highlighted is that some students, for the first time in the dictation, wrote "He's" as: **gis**. Some isolated words could be read although within the sentence they had no meaning. Some examples are: **is**, **in**, **I's**.

3.3.3. Types of errors and mistakes

In Section 2, we referred to Marin's classification of errors and mistakes (2013). Following his classification, our 46 students used different strategies to complete their dictations:

Simplification. They tended to join words and use apostrophes incorrectly to make things shorter. T They should have been able to differentiate between contracted and uncontracted forms. They also missed words (sometimes the subject or the indefinite article) because their phonetic skills were still very basic.

Generalization. Sometimes students mixed and misunderstood "its and it's" (and similar samples). This shows a lack of grammatical knowledge.

Omission. In many occasions students, especially students from our non-bilingual school, omitted words that they did not know or recognize.

Silence. This strategy was not used since we implemented a written record.

Interference. Sometimes students used "Spanglish" structures. The lack of subjects in sentences was one example.

Transference. Phonetic transferences were quite common. Students tended to guess words or letters they did not know by applying Spanish pronunciation rules to consonant endings of words.

Interference and transference were, without a doubt, the two strategies students used the most in this study.

One's own culture plays an essential role in the way a person writes and speaks. As Kramsch (1998: 3) states: "Through all its verbal and non-verbal aspects, language embodies cultural reality". According to this statement, the students' cultural components were behind every dictation in which traces of Spanish were found.

4. DISCUSSION

According to the aforementioned errors and mistakes, we can see that the dictation provided important information about the English level of the 46 students.

Table 1. Mistaken Students in Bilingual and Non-Bilingual Schools per Sentence

SENTENCE No.	Bilingual School (out of 23)	Non-Bilingual School (out of 23)
1	0	17
2	4	18
3	10	18
4	8	19
5	9	23
6	9	23
7	10	22
8	18	23
9	18	22
10	15	23
11	17	23
12	14	23

The results reveal that there are two important aspects to be discussed.

One aspect is related to the high number of mistakes made by students from ordinary education (Non-Bilingual School column). Apart from their lack of basic English knowledge compared to students from bilingual education (Bilingual School column), the organisation of what they wrote showed a writing literacy problem in English. The other aspect arises in the in-depth analysis provided in Section 3, where we can note that most pupils (above 90%) were neither able to recognize what was read in the dictation nor to build a logical sentence close to the original one.

Concerning students from the bilingual program, although their results were much better than those from ordinary education students, their mistakes were substantial. This is remarkable as these students have been in English bilingual education since their 1st year of Primary Education.

The dictation should have been easy for the students as the grammar was based on the present forms of the verb "to be". According to Decree 89/2014 that establishes the curriculum for Primary Education in the Community of Madrid, this content is firstly taught in 1st year of Primary, and is expanded upon in 2nd and in 3rd grades. Order 5958/2010, that governs bilingual schools in the Community of Madrid, highlights that this content has to be acquired at the end of the first cycle of Primary Education (when pupils finish their 2nd year of Primary school). This Order states that even the future "to be

going to" and the simple past should be introduced in 3ʳᵈ grade. So, in theory, any effective and comprehensive bilingual program should enhance, promote and, in the end, teach students so as to reach an optimum level of biliteracy (Field, 2014).

The results reflect that there might be a teaching problem in the bilingual school. As bilingual education is still a recent model that is gradually being implemented (it started in 2004-2005 in 26 public schools and now is present in 353), many Primary Education centres are improving their internal functioning and new teachers are becoming qualified to teach in these schools.

The learning of writing skills is difficult. "Writing is the most difficult task for learners [...] Clearly, pupils' listening, speaking and reading skills will evolve at a faster pace than their writing skills [...]" (Order 5958, 2010: 45). However, in 3rd grade writing should not be new but something in progress.

As far as we knew, there was no correlation between the teaching of the L1 and the L2 in the schools subject to study.

Therefore it is unlikely that the situation that Wiese (2004: 70) describes occurs at our particular bilingual education centre:

> Bilingual education programme models incorporate instruction in the native language and English, and beginning literacy instruction in the native language for language minority students. According to a growing body of research, knowledge that one acquires through one language will pave the way for knowledge acquisition in the second language.

The lack of the aforementioned connection stops the natural process of language acquisition and makes literacy in the L2 (English) difficult.

Among the difficulties these students encountered, we found that many of them recognized what they heard but that they were not able to properly reproduce it as they still lacked reading and writing skills.

During the activity, some students demonstrated frustration. Bilingual programs should aim to continue teaching the basic grammatical and spelling rules in a way that makes students feel secure and happy. Teachers' training is essential if we really want our students to advance. This is exactly what Cevallos (2014: ii) highlights:

> Recommendations are offered for stakeholders, such as the need to include courses in biliteracy as part of the initial teaching license, deliver courses in Spanish, and provide practicum experiences that prepare bilingual teachers and reading specialists to collaborate with colleagues and families.

31

In theory, "bilingual education programmes are socially constructed, not implemented, at both the school and classroom level" (Wiese, 2004: 86). That is to say, the management teams and teachers should work together in order to make our students learn effectively and meet the social needs stated in the legislation.

Another issue is related to the type of errors and mistakes made by the students. If we refer back to Section 2, we can see that our 3rd graders made mistakes, not errors. We can state this because they are involved in a learning process and their English knowledge is not totally developed yet. They do not have bad habits, they simply try to communicate and use the knowledge that they have.

To conclude, this first approach in analyzing bilingualism and biliteracy through the observation of writing skills has been both enriching and revealing. Broader research may lead us to acknowledge that Primary Education schools in the Community of Madrid should change their teaching methodology, where teachers are a key element.

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Alexopoulou, A. "La función de la interlengua en el aprendizaje de lenguas extranjeras". *Análisis de errores en la interlengua en aprendientes griegos de español*, Madrid: Ediciones Clásicas, 2005, 7-30.

Bathia, T. K. and **Ritchie**, W. C. *The handbook of bilingualism*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.

Berry, J. "Acculturation: Living Successfully in Two Cultures". *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*. 2005, 29*,* 697-712.

Blake, D. and **Hanley**, V. *Dictionary of Educational Terms*. Aldershot: Arena, 1995.

British Council. *Interlanguage*. London: British Council, 2016. https://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/article/interlanguage.

Cambridge Assessment. *What is literacy? An investigation into definitions of English as a subject and the relationship between English literacy and 'being literate'*. Cambridge: UCLES, 2013. http://www.cambridgeassessment.org.uk/Images/130433-what-is-literacy-an-investigation-into-definitions-of-english-as-a-subject-and-the-relationship-between-english-literacy-and-being-literate-.pdf.

Cevallos, T. M. *Understanding Biliteracy: Exploring the Live Experiences of Bilingual Reading Specialists*. Dissertation and Theses. Paper 1790. Portland: Portland State University, 2014.

Comunidad de Madrid. Orden 3331/2010, de 11 de junio, por la que se regulan los institutos bilingües de la Comunidad de Madrid. *BOCM* 160 (2010): 219-22. https://www.bocm.es/boletin/CM_Orden_BOCM/2010/07/06/BOCM-20100706-10.PDF.

Comunidad de Madrid. Orden *5958/*2010, de 7 de diciembre, por la que se regulan los colegios públicos bilingües de la Comunidad de Madrid. *BOCM* 17 (2011): 36-66.

http://www.bocm.es/bocm/Satellite?blobcol=urlordenpdf&blobheader=application%2Fpdf&blobkey=id&blobtable=CM_Orden_BOCM&blobwhere=1142628228755&ssbinary=true.

Corder, S. *Error Analysis and Interlanguage*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981.

Council of Europe*. Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, Teaching, Assessment.* Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 2001.

http://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/source/framework_en.pdf.

Crystal, D. *English as a global language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

España. Ley Orgánica 8/2013, de 9 de diciembre, para la mejora de la calidad educativa. *BOE* 295 (2013): 97858-921. https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/2013/BOE-A-2013-12886-consolidado.pdf.

Eurostat. "Two thirds of working age adults in the EU28 in 2011 state thy know a foreign language". *Newsrelease*. 2013, 138.

http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/2995521/5162658/3-26092013-AP-EN.PDF/139b205d-01bd-4bda-8bb9-c562e8d0dfac.

Field, R. *Bilingual Education and Biliteracy. Leadership for Change*. Philadelphia: Caslon Publishing, 2014.

Franson, Ch. "What is bilingualism?". *Bilingualism and Second Language Acquitition*. Edinburgh: NALDIC, 2011.

https://www.naldic.org.uk/eal-initial-teacher-education/resources/ite-archive-bilingualism/.

Han, Z., & **Odlin**, T. (Eds.). *Studies of fossilization in second language acquisition*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters, 2006.

Kramsch, C. *Language and Culture*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Lawton, D. and **Gordon**, V. *Dictionary of Education*, London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1996.

Marin, F. "Análisis y diagnóstico de errores en estudiantes de inglés como lengua extranjera". *Exedra Revista Científica ESEC*. 2013, 8, 181-198.

Martín, J.M. *La lengua materna en el aprendizaje de una segunda lengua*, Sevilla: Universidad de Sevilla, 2000.

Meek, M. *On Being Literate*. London: Bodley Head, 1991.

33

Murphy, R. *Essential Grammar in Use*. 3rd Edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007.

Pastor, S. Aprendizaje de segundas lenguas. Lingüística aplicada a la enseñanza de idiomas, Alicante: Universidad de Alicante, 2004.

Read, C. *500 Activities for the Primary Classroom*. London: Macmillan Publishers, 2007.

Selinker, L. *Rediscovering interlanguage*. London: Routledge, 2013.

UNESCO. *Education for All. Literacy for Life*. Paris: UNESCO, 2005.

UNICEF. *A Human Rights-Based Approach to Education for All*. Paris: UNICEF, 2007.

Wiese, A.M. "Bilingualism and Biliteracy for All? Unpacking Two-Way Immersion at Second Grade". *Language and Education*. 2004, Vol. 18, Nº. 1, 69-92.

The comparative phraseology: Translation of locutions in *Pedro Páramo* to Arabic

La fraseología comparada: Traducción de locuciones en *Pedro Páramo* al árabe

Najlaa Kounitrate
Escuela Superior Rey Fahd de Traducción - Marruecos
Koun_najlaa@hotmail.fr

Resumen

Las locuciones son unidades fraseológicas de suma importancia en el sistema lingüístico, cuya presencia en un texto objeto de traducción supone aumentar la problemática traductológica del mismo. En este trabajo, se analiza la traducción de unas locuciones presentes en tres versiones al árabe de la obra *Pedro Páramo*. Se trata de un estudio fraseológico contrastivo español – árabe que tiene como objetivo estimular el interés por este tipo de estudios, porque son de gran importancia y utilidad no solamente para el campo de la traducción, sino también para la enseñanza de ambas lenguas. Al principio, se identifican las locuciones, se interpreta su significado, se extraen los equivalentes propuestos por los tres traductores y al final se compara entre, por una parte, el texto original y sus tres traducciones al árabe, y por otra parte, entre las mismas traducciones, con el fin de descubrir tanto, el grado de equivalencia translémica basándose en la propuesta de Corpas Pastor (2003), como las técnicas de traducción adoptadas por los traductores.

Palabras clave: fraseología, locución, traducción, español, árabe.

Abstract

The locutions are phraseological units of great importance in the linguistic system, whose presence in a text object of translation supposes to increase it traductological problematic of the same. In this work, we analyze the translation of some locutions present in three Arabic versions of *Pedro Páramo*. It is a contrastive Spanish - Arabic phraseological study

that aims to stimulate interest in this type of studies, because they are of great importance and useful not only for the field of translation, but also for the teaching of both languages. First, we identify the locutions, we interpret their meaning, we extract the equivalents proposed by the three translators, and in the end, we compare between the original text and its three Arabic translations, and between the three translations, in order to discover the degree of equivalence of translation, based on the proposal of Corpas Pastor (2003), as well as the translation techniques adopted by the translators.

Keywords: phraseology, locution, translation, Spanish, Arabic

1. INTRODUCCIÓN

La locución es una combinación estable de dos o más palabras cuyo sentido no se entiende de la suma del significado de sus componentes. Su traducción a otra lengua constituye un desafío para el traductor, porque tiene que, en primer lugar, reconocer esta unidad fraseológica (UF), luego identificarla e interpretar su significado y al final transferirla a la lengua meta (LM).

Después de varias lecturas, notamos que hay muchas unidades fraseológicas en *Pedro Páramo*, lo que nos estimuló a analizar las locuciones en sus tres traducciones árabes.

Nuestro trabajo es un estudio contrastivo entre el texto origen (TO) y sus tres traducciones, por una parte, y entre las mismas traducciones por otra parte. Nos centramos en la fase de traducción de las locuciones, con el fin de indagar el grado de equivalencia y las estrategias empleadas en cada ejemplo.

2. *PEDRO PÁRAMO* Y SUS TRADUCCIONES ÁRABES

Pedro Páramo es una gran novela de la literatura mexicana que ha sido traducida a más de 40 idiomas y publicada en más de 80 países. Esta obra convirtió su escritor Juan Rulfo en una leyenda de la literatura en español, y en el autor mexicano más traducido en todo el mundo. El éxito de Rulfo y especialmente esta novela, su obra maestra, nos ha permitido manejar un corpus compuesto por tres traducciones árabes.

La traducción de esta novela requiere mucha atención, porque es una obra que aparenta sencilla, pero es muy profunda. Uno de sus grandes desafíos, es la búsqueda de equivalencias en la lengua árabe, manteniendo la fidelidad a los aspectos culturales que diferencian México de los demás países latinoamericanos.

Pedro Páramo ha sido traducida al árabe hasta la fecha cuatro veces: la traducción del palestino Sāleḥ Almāniy, la de la egipcia Sherīn ʿṣmat, la del iraquí Maruān Ibrāhīm, y la cuarta es una traducción indirecta basada en la versión francesa, y ha sido llevada a cabo por el marroquí Abdelghanī Abū elʿazm.

Cabe señalar que el análisis que presentamos en este artículo forma parte de nuestro proyecto de doctorado en el que tratamos las traducciones árabes de la obra *Pedro Páramo*, presentándose aquí solamente algunos datos sobre la fraseología contrastiva de la obra original y sus tres traducciones árabes.

3.   TRADUCCIÓN DE LA FRASEOLOGÍA

Para definir el término de unidades fraseológicas que incluye las locuciones, colocaciones, refranes, modismos, frases hechas, expresiones idiomáticas, expresiones fijas, etc., nos basamos en la propuesta de Corpas Pastor (1996: 20), que para ella son:

"[…] unidades léxicas formadas por más de dos palabras gráficas en su límite inferior, cuyo nivel superior se sitúa en el nivel de la oración compuesta. Dichas unidades se caracterizan por su alta frecuencia de uso, y de coaparición de sus elementos integrantes; por su institucionalización, entendida en términos de fijación y especialización semántica; por su idiomaticidad y variación potenciales; así como por el grado en el cual se dan todos estos aspectos en los distintos tipos".

Para los traductores, traducir la fraseología es un verdadero desafío porque las expresiones tienen su origen en un hecho histórico o una situación concreta y no se entienden fácilmente en la lengua meta. El problema mayor de la traducción de las unidades fraseológicas es saber identificarlas, interpretar su significado semántico - discursivo y buscar su equivalente literal o funcional en la lengua meta.

En cuanto a la traducción de las locuciones, varios traductólogos opinan que su traslación depende de su grado de equivalencia denotativa y connotativa en las dos lenguas, ya que su sentido total no se puede deducir del significado de los componentes tomados en conjunto o aisladamente, porque están dotadas de un significado idiomático que no se entiende a partir de una traducción literal. En este aspecto, Corpas Pastor (2003:215) manifiesta que los problemas de la traducción de las locuciones dependen, en gran medida, de las diferencias existentes entre el repertorio de locuciones y entre la lengua fuente y meta. Ello se debe, entre otras cosas, a que puede haber conceptualizaciones de realidades de la lengua fuente inexistentes en la lengua meta y, por eso, las locuciones no siempre pasan bien de las comunidades lingüístico-culturales fuente a las comunidades meta (Corpas Pastor 2003:213).

4. LA TRADUCCIÓN AL ÁRABE DE LAS LOCUCIONES APARECIDAS EN *PEDRO PÁRAMO*

En lo que concierne a la traducción de las locuciones, Corpas Pastor (2003: 215-222) establece cuatro fases: 1) identificación de la UF, 2) interpretación de la UF en el contexto, 3) búsqueda de correspondencias en el plano léxico, 4) establecimiento de correspondencias en el plano textual.

Nosotros nos centramos en la cuarta fase de la traducción fraseológica, es decir, el establecimiento de correspondencias a nivel textual, porque nos ayuda a saber cuál es el grado de correspondencia entre dos lenguas totalmente diferentes. Asimismo, analizamos los procedimientos usados para traducir las locuciones del español al árabe en la obra objeto de estudio.

Según Corpas Pastor (Corpas, 2003: 305) hay cuatro estrategias básicas de traducción de las unidades fraseológicas: 1) traducción mediante una unidad equivalente, ya sea una sola palabra o una UF, 2) traducción mediante una paráfrasis, 3) omisión en la lengua meta de una UF del original, 4) compensación mediante la introducción de una UF no presente en el texto origen. Dichas estrategias dependen del grado de equivalencia denotativa y connotativa entre las locuciones en ambos idiomas.

A continuación, analizamos unas locuciones extraídas de la obra, con sus tres traducciones al árabe, para ver hasta qué punto los traductores han podido trasmitir la misma idea del español al árabe, basándose en los procedimientos de traducción fraseológica de Corpas Pastor.

Cabe señalar que en las tres versiones encontramos casos en los que el traductor no reconoce la locución; otros casos en los que sí, el traductor la identifica pero falla en entender correctamente su sentido; y otros en los que la identifica y entiende su sentido, pero la traduce literalmente o por un equivalente fraseológico inadecuado.

"Al año siguiente naciste tú; pero no de mí, aunque estuvo en un pelo que así fuera. (Rulfo: 83)
"وفي العام التالي ولدت أنت، إنما ليس مني، مع أنه لم يكن هناك سوى قدر شعرة حتى يصبح الأمر كذلك. (Almāniy, 38)
"وفي العام التالي ولدت أنت، لكن ليس مني، مع أن الأمر كان قد أوشك على الحدوث. (ʿṣmat , 54)
"وفي العام التالي ولدت أنت ولكن ليس مني، وإن كنت قاب قوسين من أن أكون أمك. (Ibrāhīm, 78)

Estar en un pelo es una locución verbal coloquial que significa según el Diccionario de la Real Academia Española (DRAE) "estar a punto de".

El primer traductor, Sāleḥ Almāniy, ha elegido traducir la UF mediante una traducción literal:قدر شعرة حتى يصبح الأمر كذلك (en un pelo para que se realice), una literalidad completamente innecesaria, que puede causar la reacción de extrañeza al lector meta. Es un caso de equivalencia fraseológica nula porque la expresión usada por el traductor no logra la equivalencia comunicativa requerida.

La lengua meta ya posee un equivalente para la locución: se trata de la unidad fraseológica: كنت قاب قوسين من (estaba a punto de) empleada por el tercer traductor Ibrāhīm. La segunda traductora ha optado por la paráfrasis كان قد أوشك على الحدوث que significa lo mismo.

La propuesta de Ibrāhīm la podemos considerar como una equivalencia parcial porque las UFs reflejan el mismo concepto y tienen el mismo significado connotativo, pero no se componen de los mismos elementos léxicos, porque se han perdido ciertos matices semánticos.

"¿Qué pasó? – Le dije a Miguel Páramo - ¿Te dieron calabazas? (Rulfo: 87)
"ماذا جرى؟ هل خذلتك؟ ـ قلت لميغيل بارامو. (Almāniy, 43)
" ماذا حدث؟ ـ قلت لميجيل بارامو- "هل رفضوا طلبك؟ ('ṣmat , 59)
" ـ ما الذي حدث؟ قلت لميغيل بارامو ــ هل طردتك؟ (Ibrāhīm, 83)

Darse calabazas es una locución verbal cuyo significado fraseológico, según el Diccionario Fraseológico del Español Moderno (DFEM) es: "ser rechazado por alguien en sus pretensiones amorosas" y "negar lo que alguien pide". Esta locución no tiene su equivalente fraseológico en árabe.

El primer y tercer traductores la han traducido por un lexema خذلتك (te falló) y طردتك (te expulsó), con el fin de conseguir el mismo significado fraseológico de la UF o al menos acercarse a él, sin embargo, los lexemas elegidos no coinciden con el significado original de la locución.

Como se sabe, si el traductor no encuentra el equivalente fraseológico, recurre a la traducción mediante "lexemas o sintagmas libres que, si bien no reproducen los diferentes

niveles de composición y significación de la construcción original, al menos preservan sus semas denotativos básicos" (Robles i Sabater, 2010: 150), pero en este caso, el uso no ha sido satisfactorio.

En la segunda versión, la traductora ha optado por la sustitución mediante una paráfrasis رفضوا طلبك (rechazaron tu petición), parafraseando la locución y transmitiendo sólo la función comunicativa. En este caso, Corpas Pastor (2003: 217-218) apunta en que ante la ausencia de equivalentes fraseológicos en la LM, el traductor tiene que recurrir a "una paráfrasis de la carga semántica, pragmática y discursiva de la UF en el TO, valorando las posibilidades que le ofrecen los distintos procedimientos (oblicuos y directos) de traducción".

Se trata de una equivalencia nula porque es una locución española con un trasfondo cultural, sin equivalente fraseológico en árabe, así, los traductores explican el significado denotativo, no obstante, dejan perder valores connotativos.

Cabe señalar que la dificultad de la traducción de este tipo de unidades fraseológicas radica en que requiere una investigación minuciosa en la cultura de la lengua origen y de la lengua meta.

A través de los parpados me llegaba el albor del amanecer. Sentía la luz. Oía: - Se rebulle sobre sí mismo como un condenado. Y tiene todas las trazas de un mal hombre. (Rulfo: 117)
ومن خلال رموشي كانت تصلني بلجة الشروق. أحسست بالضياء: وسمعت: إنه يتلوى على نفسه مثل محكوم باللعنة. وكل مظاهر الإنسان الخبيث. (Almāniy, 80)
ومن خلال جفوني كان يصلني بزوغ الفجر. كنت أشعر بالضوء. كنت أسمع: - إنه يتلوى كالملعون. وله مظاهر الإنسان الشرير. ('ṣmat , 104)
وشعرت من خلال جفوني بالضوء الأول للفجر. كنت أشعر بالضوء وأسمع. - إنه يتقلب كالذين يشعرون بالذنب. وملامحه تشبه ملامح رجل سيء. (Ibrāhīm, 117)

Como un condenado es una locución adverbial coloquial que significa según el DRAE "con exceso más de lo habitual", y según el DFEM "muy fuertemente, en gran manera, excesivamente".

Los tres traductores han traspasado la unidad fraseológica literalmente: مثل محكوم باللعنة (como condenado por una maldición), كالذين يشعرون بالذنب (como un maldito) y كالملعون (como los que se sienten culpables).

Seguro que los traductores no reconocen la locución, y ofrecen soluciones que funcionan bien, sobre todo en la primera y segunda versiones, (la paráfrasis y el lexema respectivamente) porque llevan un rasgo de "fuerza", mientras que la tercera versión, el traductor se ha alejado mucho.

Aunque los traductores han fracasado en usar el equivalente fraseológico, ya que estamos ante el caso de la equivalencia nula, sus propuestas encajan en el contexto árabe y no causan extrañeza para el lector meta.

"'Hazte a la idea de que yo fui, Fulgor; él es incapaz de hacer eso: no tiene todavía fuerza para matar nadie. Para eso se necesita tener riñones de este tamaño.'"   (Rulfo:133)
أقنع نفسك بفكرة أني أنا الذي فعلت ذلك يا فلغور، فهو غير قادر على فعله: ليس لديه من القوة ما يكفي لقتل أحد بعد. فعمل شيء كهذا يحتاج إلى كليتين بهذا الحجم.   (Almāniy, 101)
" أقنع نفسك بفكرة أنني من فعل ذلك يا فلجور، فهو ما يزال لا يمتلك القوة على قتل أحد. فعمل ذلك يحتاج إلى كليتين بهذا الحجم".   (ʿṣmat , 127)
"حاول أن تقول أنني أنا الذي فعلت ذلك يا دون فلغور فهو غير قادر على عمل مثل هذا، ليس لديه القدرة على قتل أي شخص بعد، ولهذا فمن الضروري أن نكون كلانا بهذا الحجم"   (Ibrāhīm, 135)

En las tres traducciones, la locución tener riñones ha sido traducida literalmente por يحتاج إلى كليتين (necesita riñones) y أن نكون كلانا (que nuestros riñones).

Según el Diccionario Fraseológico del Español Moderno, esta unidad fraseológica se usa para referirse a ser valiente y tener valor.

Se trata de una locución con elemento somático 'riñones', órgano símbolo de coraje y valor, y tal vez es una forma culta para referirse a los testículos que también se usan para aludir al arrojo, como está mencionado en el Diccionario del Español Coloquial (DEC) "tener riñones es sin duda aféresis de testículos".

Estamos ante un caso de una equivalencia nula que los traductores la han tratado con la traducción literal, palabra por palabra, de los elementos fraseológicos, sin embargo, su significado no encaja y presenta problemas dado el contexto de la locución.

Los traductores en este ejemplo han optado por traducir la locución a través de una combinación libre de palabras. Es una solución con la que se alcanza la equivalencia comunicativa pero se pierde la expresividad de la locución de la lengua origen.

"- Con la sangre que lleva dentro no quiero tener esa responsabilidad.

- ¿De verdad cree usted que tengo mala sangre?

- Realmente sí, don Pedro."

(Rulfo: 138)

" ـ لا أريد تحمل هذه المسؤولية بسبب الدم الذي في عروقه.   - وهل تظن فعلا أن دمي هو دم خبيث؟   - في الحقيقة أجل يا دون بيدرو"   (Almāniy, 180)
"ـ لا أريد تحمل تلك المسؤولية بسبب دمه الذي يحمله بداخله.   - هل تظن حقا أنني أحمل دماء سيئة؟   - في الحقيقة أجل يا دون بدرو"   (ʿṣmat , 134)
" ـ لا أريد أن أتحمل المسؤولية بسبب الدم الذي يجري في عروقه.   - أتعتقد أن دمي دم فاسد؟   - نعم يا دون بيدرو"   (Ibrāhīm, 140/141)

Tener mala sangre es una locución verbal con el elemento somático 'sangre'. El significado denotativo de esta UF es: "una persona de condición aviesa o de carácter vengativo" (DRAE) y "[ser] mala persona [tener] malas intenciones o carácter perverso" (DFEM).

Trasladar esta locución al árabe se ha hecho a través de la traducción literal con falsos amigos دم فاسد، دماء سيئة، دم خبيث que en árabe significan respectivamente: sangre maligna, sangre mala, sangre corrompida.

A primera vista, ambas unidades fraseológicas (el original y las traducciones) resultan aparentemente equivalentes, ya que tienen los mismos componentes léxicos, pero cada una tiene un sentido diferente y se emplea en contextos totalmente distintos.

Estamos ante un caso de equivalencia aparente, que en árabe tiene un fraseolgismo nulo. Con la traducción literal proporcionada por los tres traductores, el lector árabe nunca entenderá el significado que acabamos de explicar, incluso se sentirá confundido.

De cualquier modo, se lo agradezco. La vieja tendrá al menos con qué entretenerse mientras yo suelto el trapo."

(Rulfo: 169)

على أية حال، أشكرك. هكذا سيكون لدى إمرأتي ما تنشغل به بينما أنا ألعب.

(Almāniy, 149)

على أية حال، أشكرك على هذا. سيكون لدى العجوز على الأقل ما يشغلها، وأنا أتسلى.

(ʿṣmat , 182)

وعلى أية حال فاني أشكرك إذ سيكون للعجوز شيء تتسلى به بينما أضحك أنا.

(Ibrāhīm, 178)

Soltar el trapo es una locución verbal coloquial cuyo significado fraseológico según el DRAE es: "echarse a llorar o echarse a reír", pero el Diccionario de Hispanoamericanismos (DH) ofrece otro significado diferente al del DRAE argumentando su propuesta por el ejemplo objeto de estudio: "Soltar el trapo: hacer su vida. (Mex.): "(…) se lo agradezco. La vieja tendrá al menos con qué entretenerse mientras yo suelto el trapo." (J. Rulfo, *Pedro Páramo*, 103)".

Se trata de un fraseologismo cuyo significado fraseológico y contextual no coinciden. Es un caso de polisemia palpable en las tres versiones propuestas por los traductores, que se han limitado a la definición del DRAE y de la mayoría de los diccionarios.

El procedimiento de traducción elegido es el lexema: أضحك (me río), أتسلى (me entretengo), ألعب (juego), que mantiene la imagen feliz del significado fraseológico, sin embargo, se pierde el carácter fraseológico contextual. Estamos ante un caso de equivalencia nula.

"Cuántas veces él tuvo que sacar de su misma bolsa el dinero para que ellas le echaran tierra al asunto: "¡Date de buenas que vas a tener un hijo güerito!"

(Rulfo:174)

"كم من المرات كان عليه أن يخرج نقودا من كيسه بالذات حتى ينسين ويلقين ترابا على القضية، وكان يقول لإحداهن "اضحكي بعبك، ستحصلين على ابن اشقر"

(Almāniy, 156)

كم من المرات اضطر إلى إخراج نقود من جيبه لكي ينسين الأمر، فقد كان يقول لهن: "خير لك، فسوف يكون لك ابن أشقر"

(ʿṣmat , 191)

كم مرة كان عليه أن يخرج نقودا من محفظته الخاصة لكي يغضوا الطرف عن القضية.. "ادفع عن طيب خاطر فسترزق بأبن أشقر الشعر"

(Ibrāhīm, 184)

Echar tierra al asunto significa "ocular algo, olvidar algo intencionalmente" según el Diccionario Fraseológico del Español Moderno, o "olvidar a alguien o dar por perdida una cosa" según el Diccionario de Hispanoamericanismos.

En los textos meta (TM), esta locución ha sido traducida de diferentes maneras. El primer traductor ha optado por la traducción literal, palabra por palabra يلقين ترابا على القضية (echaron tierra al asunto), la segunda traductora ha elegido la paráfrasis, explicando la locución origen لكي ينسين الأمر (para olvidarse del tema), mientras que el tercer traductor la ha traducido de manera satisfactoria mediante una UF existente en la lengua árabe غض الطرف (hacer la vista gorda). En los dos primeros casos, se trata de una equivalencia fraseológica nula.

El tercer traductor ha usado la locución que tiene el sentido de olvidar algo intencionalmente como posible correspondencia fraseológica en la LM, ya que mantiene muchas coincidencias con la locución original. La locución árabe, aunque no pertenece al mismo campo léxico de la locución española, comparte con ella la misma expresividad.

"Yo pecador se oía más fuerte, repetido, y después terminaban: "por los siglos de los siglos, amén", "por los siglos de los siglos, amén", "por los siglos…" (Rulfo: 144)
ال"أنا الخاطئة" تسمع أكثر قوة، مكرورة، ثم تنتهي: "إلى أبد الآبدين، آمين"، "إلى أبد الآبدين، آمين"، "إلى أبد.."‏. (Almāniy, 115)
وكانت "أنا خاطئة" تسمع أكثر قوة، وتكرارا، وبعد ذلك تنتهي: "إلى أبد الآبدين، آمين"، "إلى أبد الآبدين، آمين"، "إلى أبد.."‏. (ʿṣmat , 144)
(أنا خاطئ)، أخد يسمع هذا القول بقوة وعلى نحو متكرر وأخيرا سمع (منذ قرون وقرون آمين)، (منذ قرون وقرون آمين)، (منذ قرون..)‏. (Ibrāhīm, 147)

En este ejemplo, se trata de una locución adverbial que significa "para siempre jamás" (DRAE) y "eternamente" (Diccionario del Español Coloquial).

Esta UF ha sido traducida en la primera y la segunda versión mediante una unidad fraseológica árabe, mientras que el tercer traductor ha optado por la traducción literal creando una expresión nueva inexistente en la LM para transmitir el significado de la locución.

Almāniy y ʿṣmat han optado por sustituir la locución por otra locución existente en la lengua árabe أبد الآبدين, y es la técnica más recomendada, porque enriquece el TM y mantiene los rasgos estilísticos del autor del TO. Mientras que el tercer traductor ha

optado por la traducción literal. La locución árabe usada por ambos traductores comparte con la locución española la misma expresividad, pero no los mismos componentes, así, son equivalentes fraseológicos parciales.

Esta unidad fraseológica refleja un símbolo religioso propio de la cultura cristiana, que los dos primeros traductores lo han traducido por un referente cultural análogo en la lengua y cultura árabes, por lo cual, se pueden considerar equivalentes parciales que implican ciertas pérdidas en algunos parámetros.

En palabras de Corpas Pastor (2003: 227), la equivalencia parcial ocurre "cuando una UF y su equivalente presentan diferencias de significado —denotativo o connotativo—; distintas restricciones en los niveles diatópico, difásico y diastrático; o bien diferencias formales o estructurales".

"Me hace usted que se me vayan los colores. Me toca la luna. ¡Oh!, qué vergüenza.
- ¿Y qué? El matrimonio no es asunto de si haya o no haya luna. Es cosa de quererse. Y, en habiendo esto, todo lo demás sale sobrando.
(Rulfo:105)
"إنك تجعل الدم يغور في وجهي. إنني في الدورة. آه! يا للخجل.
- وماذا؟ الزواج مسألة وجود دورة أو عدمه وجودها. إنه الرغبة. وعندما تتوفر الرغبة فإن كل شيء يفيض على اللزوم.
(Almāniy, 66)
"لقد أخجلتني. فأنا في الدورة. آه! كم هذا مخجل.
- وماذا؟ الزواج ليس وجود الدورة أو عدمه وجودها. بل هو الرغبة. فعند وجودها فكل الباقي زائد عن اللزوم.
('ṣmat , 86)
"إنك تجعلني أشعر بالخجل. لقد أزف موعد القمر معي، أواه. يا للخجل.
- ثم ماذا. إن الزواج ليس مسألة وجود قمر أولا، إنه مسألة رغبة وعند وجودها لا تبقى للأشياء الاخرى أي اهمية.
(Ibrāhīm, 104)

La locución verbal tocarse la luna es sinónima de tocarse la regla. Según el Diccionario de Hispanoamericanismos, en México y Cuba la 'luna' refiere a menstruación.

Esta locución no tiene ningún equivalente fraseológico exacto en la lengua árabe, por lo cual, todas sus traducciones serían una equivalencia nula. Pese a ello, las paráfrasis إنني في الدورة y فأنا في الدورة (estoy en mi ciclo/periodo) propuestas por el primer y la segunda traductores son consideradas traducciones aceptadas. El tercer traductor la traduce literalmente, لقد أزف موعد القمر معي (la luna coincide conmigo), una propuesta fuera de contexto.

"Con usted debe haber pasado lo mismo, ¿no?

- No me acuerdo

- ¡Váyase mucho al carajo!

(Rulfo:70-71)

ولابد أن الأمر نفسه حصل معك، أليس كذلك؟
‑ لست أذكر
‑ لتذهب إلى الجحيم !
(Almāniy, 22)
لابد أن نفس الأمر حدث معك، أليس كذلك؟
‑ لا أتذكر
‑ لتذهب إلى الجحيم
('ṣmat , 35)
لابد ان الأمر نفسه قد حصل، أليس كذلك؟.
‑ لا أتذكر.
‑ اذهب إلى الشيطان !
(Ibrāhīm, 64)

Váyase [Irse] mucho al carajo es una locución verbal malsonante cuyo significado según el DRAE es: "estropearse o tener mal fin" y según el DFEM: "en oraciones imperativas u optativas indica rechazo violento o categórico de alguien/ algo".

En árabe, esta unidad fraseológica no tiene equivalente exacto, porque está vinculada con la cultura hispánica, pero los traductores optan en la mayoría de los casos por traducirla por لتذهب إلى الجحيم, es el caso de la primera y segunda traducción, mientras que el tercer traductor adopta اذهب إلى الشيطان, una colocación poco usada en árabe. La traducción de esta unidad fraseológica se hizo mediante expresiones creadas por los traductores.

Consideramos que la solución de los dos primeros traductores es correcta ya que alcanza la equivalencia comunicativa, la tercera también aunque en poca medida porque resulta un poco extranjera para el lector árabe.

Es un caso de la equivalencia parcial puesto que el procedimiento de traducción empleado es el de la sustitución por expresiones usadas en la literatura y habla árabes.

Ya sentado sobre el mostrador, maldijo a su madre, se maldijo a sí mismo y maldijo infinidad de veces a la vida "que valía un puro carajo".

(Rulfo:189)

وبعد أن جلس على الطاولة، شتم أمه، وشتم نفسه وشتم الحياة "التي لا تساوي أكثر من لعنة" شتائم لا نهاية لها (Almāniy, 167)
جلس فوق الطاولة، يلعن أمه، ويلعن نفسه ويلعن الحياة كثيرا "هي تستحق مجرد لعنة". (ʿṣmat , 213)
جلس على طاولة العرض الزجاجية يشتم امه ونفسه ويشتم أكثر من ذلك الحياة: "ليست الا خراء". (Ibrāhīm, 201)

Valer un puro carajo es una locución verbal malsonante, cuyo significado según el Diccionario del Español Coloquial "no valer nada", y según el Gran Diccionario de Uso del Español Actual (GDUSA) "no servir para nada".

En el nivel textual, todos los traductores han hecho una traducción literal con lo que se ha alcanzado la equivalencia comunicativa, acudiendo a expresiones malsonantes que dejan al lector árabe ante una extranjerización y hace visible el traductor: التي لا تساوي أكثر من لعنة, (no vale más que una maldición), هي تستحق مجرد لعنة (sólo merece una maldición).

Estamos ante una equivalencia fraseológica nula, aunque se puede decir que la tercera traducción, una expresión creada por el tradutor ليست الا خراء (no es más que una mierda), es la más cercana al original porque también en árabe es malsonante.

Los tres traductores han intentado reproducir el mismo significado fraseológico usando expresiones que han reflejado en cierto grado la equivalencia comunicativa representada por el descontento del personaje.

a.   Resultados cuantitativos del análisis

Equivalencia nula	7	64%
Equivalencia parcial	3	27%
Equivalencia total	0	0%
Equivalencia aparente	1	9%
Total	**11**	**100%**

Figura 1. Resultados del análisis

Si hacemos un análisis cuantitativo de los grados de equivalencia de las 11 locuciones estudiadas, encontramos que la equivalencia nula es la que domina con un 64%. Junto a ella notamos el uso frecuente de la equivalencia parcial con un 36%, y en menor grado y en un único caso la equivalencia aparente, mientras que la equivalencia total es inexistente.

5. CONCLUSIÓN

En el presente estudio hemos analizado las soluciones de traducción de las locuciones del español al árabe en tres versiones de la obra *Pedro Páramo*. A partir de este material se ha constatado que resulta difícil reproducir y conservar las cargas significativas y los aspectos culturales mexicanos de las unidades fraseológicas en los TM, lo que genera problemas de interpretación al público árabe.

Los diccionarios español – árabe existentes no están actualizados y sus propuestas no siempre son fructíferas porque a veces no reconocen la locución o no ofrecen ninguna información sobre ella o bien aportan informaciones no válidas para el ejemplo analizado en un contexto determinado. Asimismo, lamentablemente, hemos notado una carencia de diccionarios fraseológicos bilingües español – árabe, cuya elaboración sería muy importante para la lexicografía y los estudios fraseológicos contrastivos también.

Los sistemas fraseológicos del español y el árabe no muestran muchos rasgos en común, ya que no encontramos equivalentes fraseológicos totales, sin embargo, en la mayoría de los casos se trata de equivalencias nulas, y en menor número equivalencias parciales.

En varios casos, no era posible mantener el sentido completo de la locución, por eso los traductores han recurrido a la paráfrasis, a los lexemas simples que encajan en el contexto, o bien han traducido la locución literalmente a pesar de que la lengua árabe ya dispone de equivalentes fraseológicos.

Hemos notado en nuestro análisis que en varias ocasiones los traductores expresan la idea de la locución original literalmente por falta de correspondencias conceptuales dada la diferencia cultural y lingüística entre ambas lenguas, como es el caso de la locución tener riñones que no tiene en la lengua árabe un equivalente fraseológico en el mismo ámbito, y los traductores la han traducido literalmente por أن نكون كلانا o por يحتاج إلى كليتين.

Hemos observado que para traducir algunas locuciones los traductores crean expresiones que no hacen referencia a la misma situación y que sueñan raras en la lengua meta como las locuciones malsonantes Irse al carajo y Valer un puro carajo.

Cabe señalar que es muy frecuente el uso de la paráfrasis para resolver casos de equivalencia parcial o equivalencia nula ya que de las 33 soluciones propuestas por los tres traductores, la paráfrasis ha sido usada en 6 ocasiones: en el caso de las locuciones tocar la luna; como un condenado, estar en un pelo y echar tierra al asunto.

En lo que concierne a la traducción mediante una unidad fraseológica equivalente, solamente encontramos tres locuciones que han recurrido a esta estrategia: por los siglos de los siglos إلى أبد الآبدين; echar tierra al asunto غض الطرف y estar en un pelo كان قاب قوسين من.

Finalmente, y en cuanto a los grados de la equivalencia fraseológica, siete de las locuciones analizadas presentan una equivalencia nula, cuatro presentan la equivalencia parcial, un solo caso de equivalencia aparente mala sangre que ha sido traducido por falsos amigos que funcionan en el contexto árabe pero no expresan la misma idea del original. Sin embargo, no hemos encontrado ningún ejemplo representativo de la equivalencia total, tal vez, porque las dos realidades la de México y la de los lectores árabes son lejanos y no comparten muchas cosas.

REFERENCIAS BIBLIOGRÁFICAS

'Ṣmat, S. *Bīdrū Bārāmū [Pedro Páramo]*. El Cairo: Al haya al 'āma li qoṣūr aṯaqāfa, 2013.

Almāniy, S. *Bīdrū Bārāmū [Pedro Páramo].* Dammam: Dār Āṯar, 2013.

Corpas Pastor, G. *Manual de fraseología española*. Madrid: Gredos, 1996.

_____. *Diez años de investigación en fraseología: análisis sintáctico- semánticos, contrastivos y traductológicos*. Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2003.

Ibrāhīm, M. *Bīdrū Bārāmū [Pedro Páramo]*. Bagdad: Dār al māmūn li taryama wa nashr, 1990.

Martín Sánchez, M. *Diccionario del Español Coloquial: Dichos, Modismos y locuciones populares*. Madrid: Tellus. (DEC), 1997.

Real Academia Española. *Diccionario de la lengua española (23.ª ed.*). Madrid: Espasa. (DRAE), 2014.

Renaud, R. (coord.). *Diccionario de Hispanoamericanismos*. Madrid: Cátedra, 1997.

Robles I Sabater, F. "Las unidades fraseológicas del Pons Wörterbuch für Schule und Studium". *Cuadernos de Filología Alemana*. 2009, Anejo II, págs. 143-151.

Rulfo, J. *Pedro Páramo*. Madrid: Cátedra, 1986.

Sánchez Pérez, A**.** *Gran Diccionario de uso del español actual*. Madrid: SGEL, 2001.

Seco, M., **Andrés**, O. y **Ramos**, G. *Diccionario fraseológico documentado del español actual. Locuciones y modismos españoles*. Madrid: Aguilar, 2004.

LITERATURA

J. M. Coetzee´s *In the Heart of the Country*: Magda's Search for a New Language

En medio de ninguna parte de J. M. Coetzee: la búsqueda de Magda de un lenguaje femenino

Patricia Álvarez Sánchez
Universidad de Málaga
patriciaalvarezsanchez@gmail.com

Resumen

Irigaray ha indagado y analizado cómo tanto el psicoanálisis como la filosofía han excluido a las mujeres de posiciones significativas. En su obra *El espéculo de la otra mujer*, demuestra cómo nuestra civilización occidental se ha construido sobre una base ideológica masculina que silencia a las mujeres en su discurso. Además, enfatiza que las mujeres necesitan ocupar el lenguaje para crearse una identidad separada. En este artículo, vincularemos sus ideas feministas sobre el lenguaje con Magda, la protagonista de la novela *En medio de ninguna parte*, de J.M. Coetzee, una obra que fue publicada durante la segunda ola del feminismo. Analizaremos cómo Magda trata de reinventarse a sí misma fuera del mundo patriarcal que habita, y descubrir un lenguaje nuevo que le permita transcender el imaginario masculino y los límites que este impone. También indagaremos en sus alianzas con otras escritoras como Perkins Gilman, Plath y Woolf.

Palabras clave : Coetzee, *En medio de ninguna parte*, Irigaray, lenguaje, Woolf.

Abstract

Irigaray has explored and analysed how both psychoanalysis and philosophy have managed to exclude women from a meaningful existence as independent subjects. In her work *Speculum of the Other Woman* (1974), she demonstrates how Western civilisation has been articulated according to a masculine ideology that silences women in their discourse. She also emphasizes that women need to occupy language in order to create a separate identity. In this article, I will link her feminist ideas on language with Magda, the

51

protagonist of J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country* (1977), a novel that was published in the middle of the second-wave feminism. I will analyse how Magda tries to reinvent her identity outside the patriarchal world she inhabits and discover a new language in order to transcend the masculine imaginary and its boundaries. I will also explore her remarkable alliance with other female writers: Perkins Gilman, Plath and, above all, Woolf.

Keywords: Coetzee, *In the Heart of the Country*, Irigaray, Language, Woolf.

> In Irigaray's view, women start in an impossible position. Women are in a position of exclusion. […] Man's discourse, inasmuch as it sets forth the law…[knows] what there is to know about the exclusion. The exclusion of women is "internal" to an order from which nothing escapes: the order of (man's) discourse. (J.M. Coetzee, 1996: 27)

1.   COETZEE'S WOMEN NARRATORS

All Coetzee's novels examine and illustrate relations of power and different manifestations of hegemony, which are usually established, among other ways, by means of language. Moreover, in an interview with Sévry, Coetzee mentions: "I think there is evidence of an interest in problems of language throughout my novels. I don't see any disruption between my professional interest in language and my activities as a writer" (1986: 1). On the other hand, many of his most interesting characters are women and most of them interrogate structures of power, authority and language, but they are different from other characters in that they want to dominate their narratives, albeit the difficulties they encounter and, at the same time, they are all aware of their limited access to their stories.

Coetzee depicts very powerful women narrators in *In the Heart of the Country*, *Foe* (1986), *Age of Iron* (1990) and *Elizabeth Costello* (2003); one could even name them female warriors because of the obstacles they encounter to pursue their writing and their resistance to continue. These female narrators remain relatively unexplored because they are often conflated with Coetzee's own paradoxical position as a white liberal writer in South Africa trying to question authority. For example, Attwell has mentioned that it is possible that Coetzee has used a female voice in some of his novels as "a strategic way of positioning oneself on the margins of authoritative traditions" (2015: 142), but I will argue that another possible interpretation is that he links his female main characters with the storytelling of their experiences to show that writing is a way to transcend their subordinate place in the patriarchal imaginary.

Coetzee's female characters illustrate relationships of power. Most of them express their desire to narrate their own existence and not to be narrated. His four female protagonists,

Magda, Susan, Mrs Curren and Elizabeth Costello, assert their need to tell their stories through their own voices.[1] They write their stories in different forms: Magda keeps an intimate diary, Susan narrates her experiences on an island in *Foe* until she engages a writer to produce a novel based on her unique adventures,[2] Mrs Curren follows the epistolary tradition in *Age of Iron*,[3] and Elizabeth Costello publishes and reads her controversial academic papers in Coetzee's homonymous novel. Some of them link their writing to their bodies, as if writing were their nature. This is especially evident in the case of Mrs Curren:

> So day by day I render myself into words and pack the words into the page like sweets: like sweets for my daughter. [. . .] Words out of my body, drops of myself, for her to unpack in her own time, to take in, to suck, to absorb. ([1998] 1990: 8)

Later in the novel, when she mentions: "The words come from my heart, from my womb" ([1998] 1990: 133), she is making it even more evident that writing is linked to her femininity.

 Of all these and more very interesting examples where women need to bequeath their words to the world, I am going to analyse the protagonist of Coetzee's second novel, Magda, because she is by far his most transgressive female character and his most powerful representation of the rejection of patriarchy. As a white woman in a patriarchal Boer society, Magda is constrained to an unmovable role where she cannot transcend her subordinate position nor progress; she becomes obsessed with reimagining her identity in a world where women are revered as wives, mothers and child bearers, then marginalized to silence. In order to do so, she searches for a new language that will enable her to reinvent herself.

---

[1] Other female characters decide to remain silent, at least according to the masculine narrators, like Lucy in *Disgrace* (1999) and the barbarian girl in *Waiting for the Barbarians* (1980). In the case of Lucy, a very plausible interpretation is that she does not report the rape because she does not want her story to be appropriated.

[2] Susan tries to bring to life her singular story as the first female castaway, but the writer she engages seems to be more interested in her maternity and she tells him: "I am a free woman who asserts her freedom by telling her story according to her own desire" ([1987] 1986: 131). At the end of the novel she has been narrating, she starts to disappear as a character, because Foe, the author, is taking more control of the narration and diminishing her achievements.

[3] Mrs Curren recounts the events that mark the last days of her life in a long letter to her daughter in *Age of Iron*. She asserts her need to write as if her life depended on it. In fact, it is evident that she is afraid of the void that will present itself when she cannot write anymore. She writes in order to postpone her imminent death and at the same time, she acknowledges the power of her writing: "Death may indeed be the last great foe of writing, but writing is also the foe of death" ([1998] 1990: 115-116).

2.   IN THE HEART OF THE COUNTRY

In the Heart of the Country is Coetzee's second novel and a very complex and experimental work. It is also a postmodern construction with references to Blake, Freud, Hegel, Lacan and Rousseau and, as Coetzee has stated, deeply influenced by *le nouveau roman français* and the film-makers' movement *la nouvelle vague* (1992: 60). While in the process of becoming published in South Africa, the national political situation deteriorated, especially owing to the Soweto uprisings, a student revolt that began because of a requirement that all schools conduct their lessons in English as well as in Afrikaans and where hundreds of black students were massacred. Coetzee had originally written the novel in Afrikaans and English, but he finally decided to translate the Afrikaans passages into English in case the novel would be censored and also to meet the demands of a more global readership (Wittenberg, 2008: 134). This decision also reflects, or is at least consistent with, the general anti-Afrikaans mood, which prevailed in the country after the Soweto uprisings against compulsory bilingual education (Wittenberg, 2008: 139). Coetzee finally published, almost simultaneously, a monolingual edition for the Anglophone market and a bilingual version in his own country, which is the only example of a Coetzee novel written and published in both languages. This is relevant in so far as it shows the importance of the language context Coetzee was immersed in at the time.

One of many of the novel's achievements is that *In the Heart of the Country* engages with many aspects of the *plaasroman*[4] from the perspective of a white woman who inhabits both the central part and the margin of her story, as she is both colonizer and colonized, and she provides a very powerful figure of Otherness. Coetzee has written on the *plaasroman*, the South African pastoral novel, in *White Writing: On the Culture of Letters in South Africa* (1988), his first non-fiction book, where he points out that the *plaasroman* exalts patriarchal values and uses a language full of gendered connotations*.* In this literary utopia, roles are unmovable: women are child bearers and devoted wives, blacks do not exist, except when they contribute to whites' existence and comfort.

It is difficult to summarize *In the Heart of the Country*'s plot owing to the unreliability of its narrator, Madga, an Afrikaner woman who tells her story in 266 numbered units of thought as if it were a dream. In her reveries she presents herself as an angry spinster who lives on a desolate Karoo farm together with her father and their servants. Magda starts the novel telling of her father's new wife and of her murder of the newlyweds, while they are in bed together. Without any explanation, her father comes back to life and the reader

---

[4] The novel follows this literary tradition and more specifically, Olive Schreiner's *A Story of an African Farm* (1883), a novel Coetzee has written about in *White Writing*.

wonders if Magda has dreamt about the previous events. On a different occasion, she commits parricide again after her father has seduced Klein-Anna, the wife of their servant Hendrik. She buries her father and tries to establish a rapport with Hendrik and Klein-Anna, but the relationship fails. According to Head, Magda may be interpreted as the "symbolic daughter of colonialism" (2009, 43), but I will analyse her as an allegorical representation of the rejection of patriarchy.

It is obvious that Magda tries to find her place outside the restraining traditional and patriarchal world she inhabits. In fact, although the novel has not received much literary attention to date,[5] most of the articles that deal with it focus on feminist issues.[6] Coetzee is aware of the subordinate place of women in the traditional pastoral novel, and mentions: "In the farm novel we find women, in effect, imprisoned in the farmhouse, confined to the breast function of giving food to men, cut off from the outdoors" (1988: 9). Magda is conscious about the role of women and speaks about her destiny to become the property of a man through marriage, but she knows she would be suffocated in this constraining role and rejects it. Although she is expected to become an obedient and dedicated *vrou en moeder*,[7] a feminine ideal that according to Stone "was used to both discipline the females of the culture and to promote masculine power and authority" (2003: 217), she does not accept her situation and there are several instances in the novel that she rebels against. Magda is a parody of the submissive Afrikaner *vrou en moeder*. Instead of fulfilling her destiny as a progenitor, she is a barren spinster. Moreover, she does not conform to the reiteration of the heterosexual norms that give stability to her Afrikaner community because she is not married and remains a "miserable black virgin" ([2004] 1977: 5). Therefore she is undervalued and dismissed by her father and their community.

3.   COETZEE AND IRIGARAY

Trapped in the masculine imaginary, Magda appropriates and uses phallocentric modes of thinking about women in order to subvert them. One example is how she echoes Lacan's

---

[5] Glenn mentions that it is "the least read and has had the least critical attention" (1996: 120).

[6] See for example: Briganti's "A Bored Spinster with a Locked Diary: The Politics of Hysteria in *In the Heart of the Country*", Onega's "Trauma, Madness, and the Ethics of Narration in J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country*", Robert's "Cinderella's Mothers: J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country*", Stone's "Good Housekeeping, Single Women and Global Feminism in J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country*" and Wright's "Displacing the Voice: South African Feminism and J.M. Coetzee's Female Narrators". There are also two book-length studies that analyse the novel: Dovey's *The Novels of J.M. Coetzee: Lacanian Allegories* and Graham's *The Use of the Female Voice in Three Novels by J.M. Coetzee*.

[7] The phrase means wife and mother in Afrikaans.

theory of sexual difference and, probably following Irigaray, she tries to dismantle it as well. We know Coetzee has read Irigaray because he quotes several sentences from her that are relevant to my interpretation of Magda:

> In Irigaray's view, women start in an impossible position. Women are in a position of exclusion...Man's discourse, inasmuch as it sets forth the law...[knows] what there is to know about the exclusion. The exclusion of women is "internal" to an order from which nothing escapes: the order of (man's) discourse. (1996: 27)

Lacan understands feminine sexuality, when compared with the masculine, as a void. Irigaray is a leading contributor to feminist theory and one of Lacan's most incisive critics; she asserts women need to be considered independently from men and denounces the idea that men are regarded as presence and women as absence:

> She functions as a hole-that is where we would place it at its point of greatest efficiency, even in its implications of phobia, for man too-in the elaboration of imaginary and symbolic processes. But this fault, this deficiency, this "hole," inevitably affords woman too few figurations, images, or representations by which to represent herself. It is not that she lacks some "master signifier" or that none is imposed upon her, but rather that access to a signifying economy, to the coining of signifiers, is difficult or even impossible for her because she remains an outsider, herself (a) subject to their norms. She borrows signifiers but cannot make her mark, or re-mark upon them. Which all surely keeps her deficient, empty, lacking, in a way that could be labeled "psychotic": a latent but not actual psychosis, for want of a practical signifying system. ([1985] 1974: 71)

Magda echoes this idea when she asserts: "If I am an O,[8] I am sometimes persuaded, it must be because I am a woman" ([2004] 1977: 44).[9] Another very relevant example is Magda's description of herself:

> I move through the world, not as a knifeblade cutting the wind, or as a tower with eyes, like my father, but as a hole, a hole with a body draped around it, the two spindly legs hanging loose at the bottom and the two bony arms flapping at the sides and the bid head lolling on top. I am a hole crying to be whole. ([2004] 1977: 44)

While Magda's father is a *knifeblade*, she is a *hole crying to be whole*, but before that she had already called attention to the arbitrariness of that definition when she pointed out

---

[8] Elizabeth Curren is also represented by this absence when she explains how she feels: "I am hollow, I am a shell" ([1998] 1990: 103).

[9] The "O" can also be traced to Coetzee's readings of the French feminist Monique Wittig, and more particularly to her work *Les Guérillères* (1969), which features O's as symbols of feminine excess, or that which logocentrism has relegated to a position outside representability. We know Coetzee has read Witting because he quotes her and mentions: "The O, the circle, the hole are symbols of that which male authoritarian language cannot appropriate" (1992: 404).

56

that it is her father who has constrained her in this role: "To my father I have been an absence all my life. Therefore instead of being the womanly warmth at the heart of this house I have been a zero, a null, a vacuum" ([2004] 1977: 2). Later in the novel, Magda, the virgin, also mentions: "I am not ignorant of my anatomy…not unaware that there is a hole between my legs that has never been filled" ([2004] 1977: 41). Coetzee engages with this supposedly feminine symbol of lack in order to challenge Lacan's theory and his articulation of the masculine phallic order based on purely sexual physical differences. Magda describes herself again and again as a black virgin, a suffering body craving to be heard and spoken to, as a woman crying out loud to be noticed. According to Coad, her main desire is "to claim right as an ontological subject, to transcend nothingness, and she sees this possible through filling the hole, that is substituting absence with presence" (online). She starts daydreaming about how her servant Hendrik talks to his wife about her need to become a sexually active subject:

> He tells her that I need a man, that I need to be covered, to be turned into a woman. I am a child, he tells her, despite my years, I am an old child, a sinister old child full of stale juices. Someone should make a woman of me, he tells her, someone should make a hole in me to let the old juices run out. ([2004] 1977: 94)

She then narrates how he rapes her and retells it in different units of thought.[10] Her wish for sexual contact is an attempt to become a sexually attractive object because she is aware of the power of such a representation. Apparently, she believes that this act can turn her into a woman and is later disappointed when she discovers that nothing has changed:

> Am I now a woman? Has this made me into a woman? So many tiny events, acts, movements one after another, muscles pulling bones this way and that, and their upshot is that I can say, I am finally a woman, or, Am I finally a woman? ([2004] 1977: 117)

Magda's wish to be "made a woman" can be analysed as a critique on Lacan's interpretation of women's sexuality. However, since she tells the story in an interior monologue and retells several fragments of the argument, we are never really sure of what happens between them.

---

[10] Since the subject of this article is language and its connotations, it is worth mentioning that Attwell notices that "Magda's appeals to Hendrik for tenderness after being raped have a quality of anguish in the Afrikaans that the English can't fully match" (2015: 51).

Similarly, Irigaray criticises that women are regarded in masculine terms and assimilated to the male order and claims:

> We can assume that any theory of the subject has always been appropriated by the "masculine." When she submits to (such a) theory, woman fails to realize that she is renouncing the specificity of her own relationship to the imaginary. ([1985] 1974: 133)

According to the feminist philosopher, the masculine imaginary is based on identity, rationality and philosophy. *In the Heart of the Country* tries to illustrate how women have been excluded from philosophy, culture and language. Magda echoes this idea when she mentions: "I am not a philosopher. Women are not philosophers and I am a woman" ([2004] 1977: 119), but Coetzee is, in fact, creating a philosophical character that quotes Hegel and Rousseau and denounces the fact that women's achievements are kept silent and made invisible by philosophy and history. Thus Magda comments: "With cunning and treachery, if necessary, I fight against becoming one of the forgotten ones of history" ([2004] 1977: 4).

While Irigaray tries to dismantle patriarchy in her writings and shows the dangers of linking men to culture and women to nature and motherhood, Magda is trapped in a dysfunctional family that represents the negative legacy of patriarchy. Her father is characterised as a servant of Eros,[11] like many of Coetzee's male characters;[12] he is a negative presence, "an ogre-like figure" (Onega, 2011: 114), but he is also characterised as a gentleman:

> My father has never ceased to be a gentleman. When he goes out riding he wears his riding boots, which I must help him off and which Anna must wax. On his inspection tour every second week he wears a coat and a tie. In a study box he keeps three collarstuds. Before meals he washes his hands with soap. He drinks his brandy ceremonially, by himself, from a brandy-glass, of which he has four, by lamplight, sitting in an armchair. ([2004] 1977: 24)

Magda's mother, on the other hand, is an absence because she died under her father's thumb when trying to bear their second child:

> My mother was a frail gentle loving woman who lived and died under her husband's thumb. Her husband never forgave her for failing to bear him a son. His relentless sexual demands led her to her death in childbirth. She was too frail and gentle to give birth to the rough rude boy-heir my father wanted, therefore she died. ([2004] 1977: 2)

---

[11] This phrase is used to characterise David Lurie (1999: 52).

[12] For example: the Magistrate in *Waiting for the Barbarians* (1980) and David Lurie in *Disgrace*.

Roberts quotes Irigaray in her article on the novel. She reminds us that Irigaray defines our culture as matricidal and that the relationship between a mother and her daughter is usually broken so that the girl can become a woman in the patriarchal sense and focus on her father/husband. The mother becomes silent, absent, as it is the case in so much Western literature (Roberts, 1992: 23) and as it is the case of Magda's mother:

> Magda has been deprived of the mother and verticality and is thus the "bitter vestal" of the father, "spoiled for life" (3). She belongs to the father/husband but in no mature womanly way: she remains a virgin, incapable of jouissance even in her fantasies. (Roberts, 1992: 24)

Irigaray also criticises that women are exchanged between men as a commodity. We also find an example of this in the novel in Hendrik's wife, Klein-Anna, when she becomes Magda's father's mistress in exchange of a bottle of brandy he gives their servant, Klein-Anna's husband. She is lured to him with a small packet of sweets and a silver coin, as if she were a child. However, we should remember that we are locked into Magda's narration and that she, as a colonizer, has no means to discover the complexity of Klein-Anna's thoughts.

Magda, who knows she is a character in a story, rebels and declines inhabiting such a novel, mainly for two reasons: the first one is her marginal position as a woman on the farm that prevents her from existing behind the sphere of the home and achieving an identity in a patriarchal society:

> Men's talk is so unruffled, serene, so full of common purpose. I should have been a man, I would not have been grown up so sour, I would have spent my days in the sun doing whatever it is that men do, digging holes, building fences, counting sheep. What is there for me in the kitchen? The patter of maids, gossip, ailments, babies, steam, foodsmells, catfur at the ankles – what kind of life can I make of these? ([2004] 1977: 22)

The second one is the inability of the social situation to reproduce a language of reciprocity. Magda's life is dictated by the contamination of colonialism and patriarchy, which demonstrates itself through the linguistic structures where she is imprisoned. She aims to dismantle the gender and racial discourses she lives in, but neither English —the language she uses to express her thoughts and links her to a cultural tradition that Coetzee has inherited—nor Afrikaans—which Coetzee uses for Magda's dialogues with their

servants and is, thus, a symbol of the power that the whites have over the native population—[13] allows her to do so.

Attwell has mentioned that most of what happens in *In the Heart of the Country* is "an act of language" (1993: 60) and I would like to add that its protagonist is a truly linguistic expert. Magda is not only well aware of the power of language when she mentions: "It is a world of words that creates a world of things" (Coetzee, [2004] 1977: 146), but she also symbolizes how difficult it is for a woman to bring the female imaginary into language. Coetzee deals with this as follows:

> It is futile to imagine that, from a pocket within man's discourse [...] women can substitute feminine power for masculine power [...] while seeming to be a reversal, this "phallic" seizure of power would leave women still "caught up in the economy of the same" (1996: 27)

While Irigaray has claimed that women need to be aware of their subordinate position in language, there are several examples in the novel that show that Magda acknowledges that she is using the language of patriarchy:

> The lips are tired, I explain to him, they want to rest, they are tired of all the articulating they have had to do since they were babies, since it was revealed to them that there was a law they could no longer simply part themselves to make way for the log aaaa which has always been enough for them... I am exhausted by obedience to this law, I try to say, whose mark lies on me in the spaces between the words, in the spaces between the pauses, and in the articulations that are set up the war of sounds. ([2004] 1977: 84)

Magda admits that what she says "comes from the realm of male interpretation and the male gaze, her father's disappointment that she is not a son" (Wright, 2008: 19). She would like to express herself outside this "law" and says: "My words are not the words such as men use to them" ([2004] 1977: 8), and complains with the following words: "I was born into a language of hierarchy, of distance and perspective" ([2004] 1977: 91).[14]

At a different level, Madga can be interpreted as a linguistic sign with a clear signifier, an unattractive body craving to be seen, heard and spoken to, but with no obvious signified. She says: "I signify something, but I do not know what" ([2004] 1977: 10). Her goal is to achieve recognition from her father, Hendrik or Klein-Anna, but she cannot succeed. Referring to her father she mentions: "Whatever it is he has been doing today (he never

---

[13] In the South African bilingual edition.
[14] This can refer to the language of patriarchy but also to Afrikaans, which she uses to speak to her servants in the bilingual edition and thus represents segregation.

says, I never ask)" ([2004] 1977: 34), and she demands that he talk to her: "Speak to me! Do I have to call on you in words of blood to make you speak?" ([2004] 1977: 78). Her relationship with Hendrik is also unproductive. She says to him: "Speak to me! Why do you never say anything?" ([2004] 1977: 118), and the problem with Klein-Anna is that she is only able to answer in monosyllables and cannot call her by her name: "I am just Magda, and you are just Anna. Can you say Magda? Come say Magda for me. No, miss. I can't" ([2004] 1977: 111). There is not one single example of exchange between them in the whole novel.

4. LANGUAGE

Several critics have noticed the importance of language in the novel. For example, according to Wright, "Magda's narrative is a narrative of desire, the specific desire for language, for sex, for connection, and for salvation, within a context that repeatedly negates those desires" (2008: 18). Magda craves to establish contact with other human beings, but ordinary spoken language fails as a means to communicate. She cannot escape the ideological matrix of language and, I believe, she tries to invent her own discourse in different ways. For the first one, I would like to go back to both Dovey's study of the novel as a Lacanian allegory and to Graham's and Canepari-Labib's interpretation of Madga as a hysterical character. It is obvious Coetzee was influenced by some of Freud's concepts regarding female hysteria and Lacan's definition of womanhood when he developed Magda as a character and this demands our full attention.

Graham and Canepari-Labib establish a comparison between Magda and Dora, Freud's most well-know hysterical patient. Graham gives a more accurate analysis of Magda as a subversive character and links her both to hysteria and the Lacanian allegory of the woman as a vacuum, what Irigaray precisely criticises in her work *Speculum*, as I have explained*.* Canepari-Labib interprets Madga's incestuous desires for her father with the help of Freud's *The Interpretation of Dreams* (1899) and also focuses on her search to communicate. Magda even subverts Freud's talking cure when she says: "There was a time when I imagined that if I talked long enough it would be revealed to me what it means to be an angry spinster in the heart of nowhere" ([2004] 1977: 4).

Graham points to a relevant symptom of her apparent mental disease, which is her difficulty to give a chronological account of what happens —or what she imagines in her stream of consciousness— and this is even more interesting to analyse. Showalter notices a parallel between hysterical patients' linguistic disorder and their rejection of the law of the father. She mentions, referring to one of Breuer's patients: "Anna O's rejection of the

patriarchal order became her rejection of the father language" (2014: 156). In the case of Magda, she asserts she was born into a "father-tongue" ([2004] 1977: 106), but she rejects it expressing: "I do not say it is the language my heart wants to speak" ([2004] 1977: 106). We can interpret that Magda's linguistic disorder, like that of Anna O's, is linked to her rejection of patriarchy, and one of the attempts she will undertake to create a new language. Unfortunately, her revolt against the law of the father is not efficient in terms of communication.

While Magda shows some of the symptoms of hysterical patients, I would like to mention that hysteria was associated with an uncontrolled or unfulfilled sexuality in Victorian terms, which was according to Showalter "the major, almost defining symptom of insanity in women" (2014: 74). Magda, the virgin,[15] seems to long for a sexual intercourse and this could be another symptom of her mental disease, but we should not forget Coetzee has advised us in *Doubling the Point* not to interpret her as a mad character.[16] Since Magda has acknowledged the impossibility for her to communicate through language when she says that "words alienate" (1997: 28) and expressed her deep desire for "a language such as lovers use" ([2004] 1977: 97), her need to reach communication assumes the form of sexual desire for the three characters she shares the novel with: her father, in form of an Oedipal infatuation, Hendrik and also Klein-Anna. Having been rejected by her father, she starts daydreaming about having a relationship with Hendrik. The rape she imagines, and retells, is also a way to search communication through her body because her need to interact with other human beings has failed on a verbal level. Unfortunately, all these attempts to achieve an identity fail.

5.   WRITING

Being aware of the difficulties imposed on her through spoken language, such as English or Afrikaans, I have mentioned Magda attempts sexual intercourse, another form of communication, to achieve contact with and recognition from another human being, but it also fails. In spite of this, Magda tries again to speak through her body on different occasions. She tries the sign language with the 12-year old postman who runs away from her when she makes indecent gestures with her hands, and another example of body language is when, knowing that her ugliness cannot seduce the aircrafts she interprets as

---

[15] Maagd means virgin in Afrikaans and Dutch.
[16] Coetzee says: "Magda is passionate in the way that one can be in fiction (I see no further point in calling her mad), and her passion is, I suppose, of the same species as the love I talked in the Jerusalem address—the love for South Africa (not just Africa the rocks and bushes and mountains and plains but the country and its people)" (1996: 61).

sky gods, she pretends to be more attractive and "depicts herself as a younger woman, her figure fuller and with legs parted" (Canepari-Labib, 2005: 190). At the end of the novel Magda abandons English and Afrikaans and tries what seems to be imperfect Spanish, or at least something similar, to communicate with the sky gods.[17] She also speaks to them by making a fire, dancing or writing sophisticated messages with stones that become real poems and are supposed to be read from the sky, but again this attempt to communicate does not succeed because the sky gods never answer back. Neither spoken nor body language help her achieve any recognition.

While her story is a continuous lament on her lack of communication in her own environment, she will, on the other hand, search for a path to communicate through her writing and this will evoke her alliance with other female narrators, what Cixous, K. Cohen and P. Cohen have called l'*écriture féminine* in "The Laugh of the Medusa" (1976).[18] The French feminist defends an alternative feminine practice of writing capable of allowing women to address their needs and claim their identities outside phallocentrism. This writing should be able to subvert structures of thought that relegate women to secondary positions:

> woman has never her turn to speak […] writing is precisely the very possibility of change, the space that can serve as a springboard for subversive thought, the precursory movement of a transformation of social and cultural structures. (Cixous et al., 1976: 879)

Magda is obviously the main character of the novel, but she also indicates, in the very first page, that she is also the narrator of her story when she mentions: "I am the one who stays in her room reading or *writing* or fighting migraines" ([2004] 1977: 1, italics mine). Magda has given us several examples that make it clear she is a female writer when she asserts: "I am simply sucking this story out of my thumb" ([2004] 1977: 50). She obviously invents her story as she writes and considers the plot and reinvents again and again, like Penelope undoes part of her shroud every night, what she believes is the story of her life. She probably does it to consider which part fits her story best and even mentions she has no time to change the plot:

---

[17] For Onega: "The fact that the messages are phrased in Spanish, rather than English, adds a specifically imperialist touch to them, since, for a Boer woman of Dutch origin, Spanish is the Ur-language of imperialism" (2011: 127).

[18] Although this link between Magda's necessity to write and Cixous's call out for women to write is still unexplored, Wright affirms: "Magda's voice is an attempt for Coetzee to imagine the ways that a white South African woman of a certain time period — a period that comprises at least a century— might attempt to write that body in Cixous's sense, to claim the body" (2008: 18).

> I thrust his memory farther and farther from me, til today it recurs to me with all the remoteness of a fairy-tale. End of story. There are inconsistencies in it, but I have not the time to track down and abolish them, there is something that tells me I must get out of this schoolhouse and back to my own room. ([2004] 1977: 52)

As the sole narrator of her story she reminds us that she is not necessarily presenting the truth to the readers. Moreover, Magda starts the novel mentioning she writes "in her room" ([2004] 1977: 1). The importance of having a room of one's own was materialised by Virginia Woolf in her essay *A Room of One's Own* (1929), a genuinely feminist text that addresses the limitations women face when they want to produce literature. One of Woolf's most well-known sentences is: "a woman must have money and a room if she is to write fiction" ([1989] 1929: 4) and it is surely not a coincidence that Magda uses a similar sentence on the first page of the novel.

If hysteria was the female malady *de la fin du siècle*, I believe schizophrenia suits Magda's passionate condition better. She shows most of the disease's symptoms: irritability, hallucinations, disorganised thinking, lack of emotion and suicidal thoughts. Showalter explains that "the schizophrenic woman has become as central a cultural figure for the twentieth century as the hysteric was for the nineteenth" (2014: 204). Some feminists believe that schizophrenia is the perfect metaphor for the female condition because it shows the split between women's vulnerability to cultural messages about femininity and their own expectations of developing themselves intellectually.[19] In many cases it is associated with female writers as we see in Perkins Gilman's *The Yellow Wallpaper* (1892) or in Plath's *The Bell Jar* (1963). In fact, the description Magda makes of her father when she says "My father is the one who paces the floorboards back and forth, back and forth with his slow black boots" ([2004] 1977: 1) reminds us of Plath's poem "Daddy" where the poet asserts her need to kill her father (Graham, 1996: 18). In this sense, Magda also reminds us of these protagonists in that she is not a conformist, has an incredible imagination, needs to break free from the oppressive structures of the society she finds herself in, but the difference is that Magda is not confused about her place in the private and public sphere and knows she needs to escape patriarchy. If she can be interpreted as a mad character, it is precisely because she is a metaphor of the insane ideology she cannot escape. Magda is imprisoned in boredom and a tedious existence. The prevailing social conditions at the time had the power to drive her, and in this sense she echoes many more

---

[19] See Showalter's chapter "Women and Psychiatric Modernism" (2014).

women writers such as Woolf, to a state of mind that could be close to madness. In fact, Magda's attempts to commit suicide also remind us of Woolf's and Plath's madness and link them to their role as writers.[20] She even mentions:

> Far down in the earth flow the underground rivers, through dark caverns dripping with crystalline water…I wade out in to the tepid dam looking for the sinkhole which in our dreams beckons from the deep and leads to the underground kingdom. My skirt billows and floats around my waist like a black flower…Of all adventures suicide is the most literary, more so even than murder. With the story coming to an end, all one's last bad poetry finds release. ([2004] 1977: 14)

In 1979, two years after *In the Heart of the Country* came out, Gilbert and Gubar published *The Madwoman in the Attic*, where they examined how 19th century female writers were trapped in the imaginary of an overwhelming male-dominated society that expected them to embody the Victorian idyllic "angel in the house", a term coined by Woolf in her famous essay:

> She was intensely sympathetic. She was immensely charming. She was utterly unselfish. She excelled in the difficult arts of family life. She sacrificed herself daily. If there was chicken, she took the leg; if there was a draught she sat in it — in short she was so constituted that she never had a mind or a wish of her own, but preferred to sympathize always with the minds and wishes of others. Above all — I need not say it — she was pure. Her purity was supposed to be her chief beauty — her blushes, her great grace. (Woolf, [1993] 1931: 3)

Magda's dialogue with Woolf is evident in the following lines:

> The Angel, that is how she is sometimes known. The Angel in Black who comes to save the children of the brown folk from their croups and fevers. All her household severity is transformed into an unremitting compassion when it comes to the care of the sick. Night after night she sits up with, whimpering children or women in labour, fighting off sleep. An angel from heaven! they say, their flatterers' eyes keen. Her heart sings. In war she would lighten the last hours of the wounded. They would die with smiles on their lips, gazing into her eyes, clasping her hand, her stores of compassion are boundless. She needs to be needed. With no one to need her she is baffled and bewildered. Does that not explain everything? ([2004] 1977: 5)

Magda is also a grotesque character that represents the rage and confusion experienced by a female author trying to assert herself and find a room of her own. In order to do so, she

---

[20] Graham mentions that her suicidal attempts also link her to the Afrikaans poet Ingrid Jonker (1996: 81).

has to kill her father, representative of patriarchy. While she manages to kill her father twice —and what her father represents—, she cannot liberate herself from the patriarchal sexual and social dominance and her father comes back to life again.

6. CONCLUSION

In the Heart of the Country's main character's search for identity makes this novel unique and re-interpretable at many levels. I have shown that Magda can be understood in Irigarian terms as a symbol of the female search for a new language. She has tried the language codes she was born into without success, because they reflect the racial and gender discourses that rule the farm and she wishes to find "the true language of the heart" ([2004] 1977: 145).

Despite her desire to liberate herself from patriarchal structures of power, her "father-tongue" ([2004] 1977: 106) does not allow her to reconfigure her identity as a free woman in South Africa because, as Graham says, "the language of the father is not only a *Père-version*, it is also a perversion" (1996: 90). Magda remains voiceless even after she has murdered her father because she acknowledges that "she inhabits the voice of authority when speaking to the servants" (Macaskill, 1994: 465). Similarly, in order to avoid the ideological matrix embedded in spoken language, she has tried to communicate through her body and elaborated her own disordered mad language, in an attempt to escape her tedious existence, but she has not achieved real communication either. Rather than being mad, Magda is a literary protest against patriarchy through a revision of ideas from Freud and Lacan she appropriates and subverts in a South African context, where "the female bodies that mattered in Afrikaner culture in the 1970s were the long-suffering obedient wife and the prodigiously fecund mother" (Stone, 2003: 214).

However, Magda, the writer, has fabricated her own story and turned it into an interior monologue, which reminds us of Woolf's stream of consciousness. Unlike Susan in *Foe*, who depends on a writer to tell the story of her life and exist as a character, Magda, as the writer of her own diary, has achieved a subject position in the first person of her narration. While Cixous et al. mention: "Woman must put herself into the text—as into the world and into history— by her own movement." (1976: 875), Magda has similarly told us: "I create myself in the words that create me" ([2004] 1977: 8). She is aware of the power of language to re-describe the world and, in an exercise of creativity, she has applied this lesson and, to a certain extent, invented herself and also her own imaginary world: "I have uttered my life in my own voice throughout (what a consolation that is), I have chosen at every moment my own destiny" (1997: 151). It is exactly through her writing and through

her alliance with some of the most remarkable feminist writers that she has challenged and deconstructed her role as an obedient Boer woman in South Africa and as a madwoman in the attic by positioning herself in the middle of the story of her life.

Magda is a feminine subversive consciousness. She tries to subvert patriarchy and Lacan's understanding of women, and emphasizes that our culture needs to accept alternate paradigms of womanhood. While both Cixous and Irigaray have been criticised for offering a representation of the female that does not show multiplicity, Magda has also proved that her signifier is not an exclusive and unmovable ontological position. She has demonstrated there is not just one way to read a story or to interpret a character. Magda signifies, like Dora, through her body and particularly through her speech, the protest her condition as a woman made unspeakable in words used in a patriarchal world and, above all, the search for a new language she has finally found in communication with us, her readers.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Attwell, D. "'The Labyrinth of my History': *Dusklands* and *In the Heart of the Country*." *J.M. Coetzee: South Africa and the Politics of Writing*. Berkley: University of California Press, 1993, 35-69.

__. *J.M. Coetzee and the Life of Writing*. New York: Penguin, 2015.

Canepari-Labib, M. *Old Myths – Modern Empires: Power, Language and Identity in J.M. Coetzee's Work*. Bern: Peter Lang, 2005.

Coad, D. "Where Nothing Is*: In the Heart of the Country*." *Les cahiers forell : formes et représentations en linguistique et littérature*.

http://09.edel.univ-poitiers.fr/lescahiersforell/index.php?id=124, 1 March 2017.

Cixous, H and K. Cohen and P. Cohen. "The Laugh of the Medusa." *Signs*. 1976, Vol. 1, No. 4, 875-893.

Coetzee, J.M. *In the Heart of the Country.* 1977. London: Vintage, 2004.

__. *Waiting for the Barbarians*. 1980. London: Vintage, 2004.

__. *Foe*. 1986. London: Penguin, 1987.

__. *White Writing: On the Culture of Letters in South Africa.* Nueva York: Yale University Press, 1988.

__. *Age of Iron*. 1990. London: Penguin, 1998.

_. *Doubling the Point: Essays and Interviews.* Ed. David Attwell. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992.

_. *Giving Offense: Essays on Censorship*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, 1996.

_. *Disgrace*. London: Vintage, 1999.

_. *Elizabeth Costello*. New York: Viking Penguin, 2003.

_. "Roads to Translation." *The Best Australian Essays 2006*. Ed. Drusilla Modjeska. Melbourne: Black, 2006, 213-225.

Coetzee ,J.M. and J. **Sévry**. "An Interview with J.M. Coetzee." *Commonwealth: Essays and Studies*. 1986, Vol. 9, No. 1, 1-7.

Gilbert, S. and S. **Gubar**. *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth Century Literary Imagination*. London: Yale University Press, 1979.

Glenn, I. "Game Hunting in *In the Heart of the Country*." *Critical Perspectives on J.M. Coetzee*. Ed. Graham Huggan and Stephen Watson. London and Hampshire: Macmillan, 1996, 120-137.

Graham, L. *The Use of the Female Voice in three Novels by J.M. Coetzee*, 1996. Web. 12 Sep 2016.

Head, D. "In the Heart of the Country." *The Cambridge Introduction to J.M. Coetzee*. Nueva York: Cambridge University Press, 2009, 43-47.

Irigaray, L. *Speculum of the Other Woman*. Trans. Gillian G Gill. 1974. New York: Cornell University, 1985.

Macaskill, B. "Charting J.M. Coetzee's Middle Voice." *Contemporary Literature. 1994,* Vol. 35, No. 3, 441-475.

Onega, S. "Trauma, Madness, and the Ethics of Narration in J.M. *Coetzee's In the Heart of the Country*." *The Splintered Glass: Facets of Trauma in the Post-Colony and Beyond. Cross/Cultures: Readings in Post/Colonial Literatures and Cultures in English*. Ed. M. Dolores Herrero and Sonia Baelo-Allué. New York: Rodopi, 2011, 101-133

Showalter, E. "Feminism and Hysteria: The Daughter's Disease." In *The Female Malady: Women, Madness and English Culture, 1830-1980*. 1987. London: Virago, 2014, 145-164.

Roberts, S. "Cinderella's Mothers: J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country*." *English in Africa*. 1992, Vol. 19, No. 1, 21-33.

Stone, K. "Good housekeeping: Single Women and Global Feminism in J.M. Coetzee's *In the Heart of the Country*." *Ariel*. 2003, Vol. 34, No. 2-3, 215-235

Wittenberg, H. "The Taint of the Censor: J.M. Coetzee and the Making of *In the Heart of the Country*." *English in Africa*. 2008, Vol. 35, No. 2, 133-150.

Woolf, V. *A Room of One's Own.* 1929. New York: Harcourt Brace and Co, 1989.

__. *Killing the Angel in the House: Seven Essays.* 1931. Penguin: London, 1993.

Wright, L. "Displacing the Voice: South African Feminism and J.M. Coetzee's Female Narrators." *African Studies.* 2008, Vol. 67, No. 2, 11-31.

"To be born again, first you have to die". Καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν πᾶν πρόσφατον ὑπὸ τὸν ἥλιον[1] or the hyped Salman Rushdies´ Satanic Verses

"Para volver a nacer, primero es necesario morir". Καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν πᾶν πρόσφατον ὑπὸ τὸν ἥλιον o los sobrepublicitados Versos Satánicos de Salman Rushdie

Álvaro Manzano Redondo
Universidad Camilo José Cela
alvaro.manzano@sek.es

Soles occidere et redire possunt
nobis, cum semel occidit brevis lux
nox est perpetua una dormienda.
Catulus

Resumen

Nuestro objetivo en este artículo es ofrecer un análisis innovador de la vigorosa estructura que ha ilustrado *Los versos satánicos* de Rushdie (1988) con el fin de hacer un enfoque diferente y, además, desacreditar falsos mitos que giran en torno a la novela universal de Rushdie. Más específicamente, me centraré en las influencias clásicas en *Los Versos satánicos* y haré un análisis comparativo de similitudes, conexiones y usos de la técnica literaria con otras obras maestras que me llevarán al mundo griego / latino: *El asno de oro* de Apuleyo (158/9 dC), o García Márquez, *Cien años de soledad* (1967), y *La metamorfosis* de Kafka (1915) para demostrar que Verses es un compendio de erudición portentosa pero a la vez carente de originalidad en términos de construcción literaria. Aunque en el libro de Rushdie su prosa está sustentada en pasajes prestigiosos de un impecable estilo delicioso, la construcción técnica se presenta en forma de trípode: referencias y metamorfosis clásicas/modernas, Ringkomposition y realismo mágico, no ofreciendo nada nuevo en cuestión de originalidad literaria.

---

[1] Ecclesiastes (1:9), nothing new under the sun (the canonical translation).

Abstract

In this paper, I aim to offer an innovative analysis of the vigorous structure which has illustrated Rushdie's *The Satanic Verses* (1988) in order to make a different approach and, in addition, to debunk false myths that revolve around Rushdie´s "universal novel." More specifically, I will focus on the *Verses* and make a comparative analysis of similarities, connections and literary technique usages with other masterpieces which will take me as back as to the Greek/Latin world: with Apuleius´ *The Golden Ass* (158/9 AD), García Marquez's *One Hundred Years of Solitude* (1967), and Kafka's *Metamorphosis* (1915) to demonstrate that *Verses* is a compendium of portentously erudition but devoid of originality. Even though in Rushdie´s book the narration is written thanks to a number of prestigious passages of impeccable style, the staple knowledge, the scaffolding construction is processed as a tripod: Classic/modern references and metamorphoses, *Ringkomposition* and magic realism not offering anything new in terms of creativity.

Keywords: Metamorphosis, Ringkomposition, magic realism, religion, classics.

1. INTRODUCCIÓN

Why human literature history has buried thousands of pages and has simply extoled a few is one of the most discussed topics since human critic literacy appeared. Ganapathy-Doré (2009: 10) writes: "but the discourse of the postcolonial readers situates Shakespeare at the starting point and Rushdie at the other end of the spectrum of great writers who have laid claims to universality."

If we examine the word "universality" more cautiously, we can see that the etymological origin of the term is the old French word *univers*, which in turn derives from the Latin word *universum*. The Latin word was used by Cicero and later Latin authors in a similar sense of the modern use of the English word[1]. "The Universe can be defined as everything that exists, everything that has existed, and everything that will exist"[2], so, if I attend to this definition, the universality of Shakespeare and Rushdie is a fallacy, a hyperbolic

---

[1] Cf. *The Compact Edition of the Oxford English Dictionary*, 1971, p. 3518.

[2] Paul Copan; William Lane Craig (2004). *Creation Out of Nothing: A Biblical, Philosophical, and Scientific Exploration.* Baker Academic. p. 220.

exaggeration and a hypostasis. In terms of literature, as Jesús G. Maestro explains,[3] I understand that these two authors are more a "product of English Cultural Colonialism" rather than a question of "universal authors."

Salman Rusdhie (1947), Indian-British author has engendered, universally, *urbi et orbi[4]*, together with the *Fatwa* of the Ayatollah Khomeini and his provocative out verbal public pose, the most controversial and hyped fiction written novel ever; on occasion of the celebration of its 30th anniversary, his accurate tongue and the Fatwa ill-advisedly also awards the book the authority to confront East and West once more in terms of religion *insigniae[5]*, understanding *insigniae* as the values over which a religion is built and new adepts find an explanation to the existence of the divine in it.

Orientalism, one of the greatest studies about the discussion of how Western culture constructs alien images of others in its discourses, written by Edward Said (1978), is present in Rushdie´s novel, contributing to the idea that identities are never unified and are increasingly fragmented and fractured. There is no post-multiculturalism because this is a nutopian idea. The heterotopia space of postmodernism becomes essential to post colonialism, while colonialism presents East and West as evil and good, satanic and angelic, post colonialism makes their integration possible (Said: 1978).

The first time the reader approaches *The Satanic Verses* a trembling shake invades his soul. It is like being invaded by those delicious worlds written in *Beowulf, Don Quixote, The Name of the Rose, The Aleph,* just to mention some examples. Classical references and metamorphoses, *Ringkomposition* or "Tale inside the Tale" (easy saying) and magic realism-Milesian tale, are the three main narrative "scaffolds" which sustain Salman Rushdie´s grandiose fiction. To my mind, the implications, the consequences and the results of this creative structure are quite palpable as it is analyzed below, but apart from his erudition and his command of a great narrative technique, Rushdie navigates in unfertile *aquae frigidae[6]*: *Nihil novum sub solem*, a key verse of our study (Ecc. 1:9) and attributed to King Salomon, and in Greek, firstly written, as almost everything which is untouchable: Καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν πᾶν πρόσφατον ὑπὸ τὸν ἥλιον[7].

---

[3] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=80ogZzp_ihc
http://www.academiaeditorial.com/web/colecciones/critica-de-la-razon-literaria/
[4] Cf. Ovide, Fastes, II, (683, 684): "*Gentibus est aliis tellus data limine certo; Romanae spatium est urbis et orbis idem*".
[5] *Fasces*.
[6] Tests to identify witches used by the Holy Inquisition: *judicium aquae frigidae*, which it was to put women into cold water to see if the Devil reacted.
[7] "Nothing new under the sun".

Throughout this essay, I will connect quotations, passages from the book to contextualize the analysis. In this way, the reader will be able to see that when the book is deprived of its ornaments, there is nothing more than a mere scholarly succession of references, so the plot is very simple and an imitation of Apuleius´ *The Golden Ass*.

2. CLASSICAL AND MODERN REFERENCES AND METAMORPHOSES

Salman Rushdie is, without doubt, one of the greatest 21st century intellectuals such as Umberto Eco. His books are full of references to the ancient world, and he has a perfect command of the Greek, Roman, Islamic, Indian and Christian traditions. *Verses* is a clear example of this. Below I will examine a number of references to reinforce what I have called the "*aquae frigidae* theory" in Rushdie's *Verses* when it comes to looking at Rushdie's creativity.[8]

Frits, I will look at Greek and Roman references. Then, I will examine Biblical and Quranic allusions, and modern literary references; and finally, I will study metamorphosis-related allusions. Through this methodology, I will attempt to prove that Rushdie is one of the greatest intellectuals nowadays who, however, does not offer anything new in *Verses* other than "flashing entertainment."

2.1. Greek and Roman references

"To be born… first you have to die" Rushdie (1998: 3) alludes to the Phoenix Myth.[9] The 5th century B.C. Greek historian Herodotus gives a somewhat skeptical account of the Phoenix:

> "[The Egyptians] have also another sacred bird called the phoenix… In order to bring him, they say, he first forms a ball of myrrh as big as he finds that he can carry; then he hollows out the ball, and puts his parent inside, after which he covers over the opening with fresh myrrh, and the ball is then of exactly the same weight as at first; so he brings it to Egypt, plastered over as I have said, and deposits it in the temple of the Sun. Such is the story they tell of the doings of this bird."[10]

The Death/Birth dichotomy: *"No, not death: birth"* Rushdie (1998: 87) plays a magnificent role in *Verses*. Both main characters fall from the plain, "the two of them were floating down to the Channel like scraps of paper in a breeze" (9), after the terrorist attack, die (metaphorically) on their way down to the sea and are born again transformed into new alive essences. This fact is one of the key pillars of the plot construction.

---

[8] Creare: In principio creavit Deus caelum et terram. (Colunga et Turrado, 1999)

[9] In Greek mythology, a phoenix (Ancient Greek: φοῖνιξ phoînix) is a long-lived bird that cyclically regenerates or is otherwise born again.

[10] Herodotus, The Histories, Book II Trans. G. Rawlinson (1858)

Reincarnation, for frenzied Gibreel, was a term beneath whose shield many notions gathered a-babeling: phoenix-from-ashes, the resurrection of Christ… *To be born again, first you have to die… "*The old must die, you get my message, or the new cannot be whatnot (84).

This allusion to all the religion explanation existence in the characters of Gibreel and Saladin is Rushdie's way to introduce the reader into the book's main theme.

> The narrator is acknowledging the connection between Gibreel and Saladin's fall from the exploding Bostan and Satan's fall from Heaven in Milton's Paradise Lost. Milton's epic poem begins with Satan in Hell, after "Him the Almighty Power / Hurled headlong flaming from the' ethereal sky / with hideous ruin and combustion down / to bottomless perdition…" Satan's appearance is changed by his fall, although not drastically at first, "he above the rest / in shape and gesture proudly eminent / Stood like a tow's; his form had yet not lost / All her original brightness." Satan is indeed a higher power, and the greatest of the fallen archangels; in his rebellion he fell the farthest. By claiming "In the matter of tumbles, I yield pride of place to no personage," the narrator of Rushdie's novel is slyly admitting that he is the Devil himself (84).

The allusion to Icarus in the words "close to the sun" is clear. Ancient Greek: *Ἴκαρος*, Etruscan: Vikare in Greek mythology, Icarus, who is the son of the master craftsman Daedalus, the creator of the Labyrinth. Icarus and his father attempt to escape from Crete by using wax wings made by his father. Icarus' father initially warns him about complacency and then about hubris *ὕβρις* means "arrogance" or "pride." Daedalus tells his son not to fly too low nor too high because the sea's dampness would not clog his wings and the sun's heat would melt them. Icarus ignores his father's instructions; when the wax in his wings melts, he plummets and falls into the sea where he drowns Pinsent (1982).

The next reference is an unblemished example of how in *Verses* every movement of the characters is an allusion to a previous masterpiece to create expectation. Another example is: "To get his mind off… he studied, becoming an omnivorous autodidact, devouring the metamorphic myths of Greece and Rome, the avatars of Jupiter, the boy who became a flower, the spider-woman, Circe everything… Rushdie, (1998: 23-24)." Here there are allusions to Narcissus, Arachnid, Jupiter transformed into golden rain, and a bull to have a sexual threat with Europe, or The Witch Circe *Κίρκη*, is a goddess of magic or sometimes a nymph, witch, enchantress or sorceress in Greek mythology. By most accounts, she was

the daughter of the sun titan Helios, and Persse, one of the three thousand Oceanid nymphs.[11]

Circe converts Odysseus´s warriors into animals until he makes love to her: "On winter nights he, who had never slept beneath more than a sheet, lay beneath mountains of wool and felt like a figure in an ancient myth condemned by the gods to have a boulder pressing down upon his chest... (43). Others major Greek figures present in Rushdie's work are Sisyphus[12] and Atlas... They are condemned by the Gods to carry a huge weight on them. The name of Sisyphus[13], etymologically, Sophos (σοφός, "wise"), and sisys (σίσυς, "a goat's skin"), points out not only to his intelligence but also to a rain-charm in which goats' skins were used. Finally, Atlas[14] is a Titan condemned to hold up the sky forever after the Titanomachy. Both mythological characters are used by Rushdie to shape Saladin, his protagonist. Saladin[15] *Verses* character´s name is based on the name of the first sultan of Egypt, connected with Egypt time and Bible.

Through these allusions, and many others not addressed here for reasons of space, I firmly believe that Rushdie is a scholarly, but not original writer. Every time the plot advances there are several references. Rushdie embellishes his plot, characters and style with hundreds of allusions due to his intellectuality with the intention to flash the reader and create the necessary expectation to prevent the reader from putting down the book.

2.2.   Bible-Quran allusions in Verses

Verses is plagued of Biblical Quran and Hinduism's – not mentioned in this work – allusions because I believe *Verses* is a religious book, an intention of holy written. Following – imitating Marquez, rather – I believe Rushdie tried to create a new Holly Book where there is more openness to Islam including also Hinduism, and Christianity, as Marquez created *One Hundred Years of Solitude* as a Colombian Bible[16] plagued of Biblical allusions.

Although Rushdie's approach to religion is ironic, he does not intend to offend Muslims.

---

[11] Bell, Robert, E. (1993). *Women of Classical Mythology: A Biographical Dictionary.* New York: Oxford University Press.

[12] Chisholm, Hugh, ed. (1911). Sisyphus". *Encyclopedia Britannica.* 25 (11th ed.). Cambridge University Press. p. 161.

[13] Sisyphus was the founder and first king of Ephyra (supposedly the original name of Corinth).

[14] *Graves, Robert (1992). The Greek Myths. Penguin Books. p. 27.*

[15] Humphreys, R. Stephen (1977). *From Saladin to the Mongols: The Ayyubids of Damascus, 1193–1260.* State University of New York Press.

[16] https://prezi.com/e9vjiqxhp9wv/100-years-of-solitude/ : Bible apparent in 100 Years of Solitude from hidden allusions and symbolisms such as Noah's Flood, the temptation of Knowledge, and the innocent Garden of Eden which are all utilized to chronicle the life and history of Human Legacy much like the Holy Bible.

"For over two years I have been trying to explain that *The Satanic Verses* was never intended as an insult; that the story of Gibreel is a parable of how a man can be destroyed by the loss of faith...[17]"

Khawaja (2005: 1) writes a reflection about humor in Islam where it is probably one of the most debated themes about literature and Muslim religion:

> Is There no room for humor and wit in Islam?... For indeed the questions themselves sparkle with wit and irony, the gift often (wrongly) attributed to the Enlightenment to which the modern world, in its marriage of science and humanism, and *ironically* its postmodernist sequel are so heavily indebted, and from which the Muslim world is seen to have been singularly exempt.

Some of the references we could find about religion in *Verses* are used to see how Rushdie constructs over very well-known sources:

> They say in Jahilia that this valley is the navel of the earth... Adam came here and saw a miracle: four emerald pillars bearing aloft a giant glowing ruby, and beneath this canopy a huge white stone, also glowing with its own light, like a vision of his soul... by the time of Mahound, three hundred and sixty stone gods clustered around God´s own stone Rushdie, (1998: 98-99).

Monotheism and polytheism are also one of the key themes in *Verses.* Rushdie creates all Gibreel dreams around references drawn upon the *Bible* and The *Quran.*

Adam, for example, is the first human on earth *Vulgate (*Genesis: 1.26) *"Et ait: Faciamus hominem ad imaginem nostrum et similitudienm nostrum…"* The entire Hahilia Tale is constructed on the basis on the previous history of *Quram.* The nain concern is whether the three goddesses should be accepted through submission to the new religion established by Mahound, dictated by Gibreel after having encounters with Allah in the sacred mountain.

Another crucial point to understand *Verses* is to comprehend that Rushdie wants to look down on Islam to the acceptance of those verses and facilitate women Goddesses' adoration. "'Have you thought upon Lat and Uzza and Manat, the third, the other?' And Mahound, with silenced eyes, recites: 'They are the exalted birds, and their intercessions is desired indeed'... 'Allahu Akbar'" (114). *Verses* refers to precisely the verses that accepted the goddesses as daughters of Allah, so they also could be venerated by new followers, but never told by Allah but by Satan dressed up as Gibreel *The Quran,* (2012; 534)[18].

---

[17]Salman Rushdie, The Times, 28/12/90, qtd. in La'Porte, 91.

[18] The Quran, (2012). Al-Muntada Al-Islami. UK. Birmingham. Abul-Qasim Publishing House.

> …the three best-beloved goddesses in Jahilia. They bow before all three: Uzza of the radiant visage, goddess of beauty and love; dark, obscure Manat, her face averted, her purposes mysterious, sifting sand between her fingers –she´s in charge of destiny- she´s Fate; and lastly the highest of the three, the mother-goddess, whom the Greeks called Lato. Ilat, they call her here, or more frequently, Al-Lat. *The goddess* Rushdie (1998: 99-100).

All these previous references are key to understand why Rushdie achieved The *Fatwa* from Ayatollah Khomeini, extensible to the Muslim World. In addition, the fourth part of the book is divided between two dreams of Gibreel, the first one is a standalone – isolated and told as a unit – dream where the Imam recruits Gibreel to help him regain control of his homeland Desh (Iran). The big fight of Gebreel with Al-Lat (Ayesha) and Gibreel will permit the Imam to have the power back.

> "Dow she tumbles, Al-Lat queen of the night; crashes upside-down to earth, crushing her head to bits; and lies, a headless black angel, with her wings ripped off, by a little wicked gate in the palace gardens, all in a crumpled heap. –And Gibreel looking away from her in horror, sees the Iman grow monstrous, lying in the palace forecourt with his mouth yawning open at the gates; as the people march through the gates he swallows them whole (215)

After looking at a number of Quranic references, where the intention of Rushdie, I intuit, is to plant the doubt about whether Goddesses should have been included in the Quran as demanded religion idols, we would like to *conferetur* the Biblical allusions in *Verses*. I intent not only to catalog the quotations, but also to show how Rushdie embellishes his work in terms of construction writing technique. He departs from a basic line plot and adds as much as necessary to flash the reader with a *capitation benevolentia* purpose.

Moises, Mûsâ ibn ʿImran – known as Moses in the Hebrew Bible – considered a prophet, messenger, and leader in Islam, is the most frequently mentioned individual in The *Quran*[19] states that Moses was sent by God to the Pharaoh of Egypt and the Israelites for guidance and warning. As we read in *Verses*: "Ayesa (Moises) had begun to walk towards the water, and Mishal was being dragged along by her two helpers… Within minutes the entire village was in the water, splashing about the horizon, never looking back… In moments, every one of the Ayesha Pilgrims had sunk out of sight" (502-503). In my opinion, that this conclusion of Gibreel's dreams is a replica of *The Vulgate (Exodus* 14.21)

---

[19] Quran, sura 19 (Maryam), ayat 51–53.

"Cumque extendisset Moyses manum super mare, abstulit illud Dominus flante vento vehementi et urente tota nocte, et vertit in siccum: divisa est aquam."

2.3.   References to modern and contemporary literature

Verses is full of modern references the author has used to construct his plot. By modern references, I mean those references that have not been included in classical references so – i.e. Greek, Latin and Holy Literature. To my awareness, some of the allusions are out of place and could have been omitted, unless the intention of the author is, as I firmly believe, to be closer to every reader, understanding reader as an decipher entity, but also a target. Authors such as Cervantes o Lewis Carroll path the road for Rushdie's allusions with Salman´s intention to illustrate his vision. Firstly, I will catalog the references to show that Rushdie somehow abuses them to embellish his work with a flashing reader intention and *captatio* as explained above. All the quotes come from Rushdie (1989):

"…went to Wonderland: while pushing their way out of the white came a succession of cloud forms, ceaselessly metamorphosing, god into bulls, women into spiders, men into wolves" (6).

Worderland refers to the famous Lewis Carrol novel (1865) written by the English author Charles Lutwidge Dodgson under the pseudonym Lewis Carroll. It tells the story of a girl named Alice who falls down a rabbit hole and ends up in a fantasy world populated by peculiar anthropomorphic creatures.

> At once a latticework of blood oozed up through the cracked surface of the stranger´s body, and when Chamcha tried to pick off the broken shards the other began to scream, because chunks of his flesh were coming away with the glass (34).

In this passage, Rushdie is alluding to Cervantes's crystal character   in *El licenciado vidriera* "The Lawyer of Glass" (1613), which is one of the several conceal references Rushdie has in *Verses*, not openly mention the author, neither he doesn´t remember nor he doesn´t want to. *Verses* has been influences by Cervantes´ works[20]

"After all, '*les acteurs ne sont pas de gens*', as the great ham Frederick has explained in *Les enfants du Paradis* (1945). Masks beneath masks until suddenly the bare bloodless skull" (34). Marcel Carné described his greatest work, *Les enfants du paradis*, as a "tribute to the theatre," and the story breathes with the very life and soul of French theatrical tradition[21].

---

[20] J. A. Garrido J. A. *The Cervanrean Heritage: Reception and Influence of Cervantes in Britain.* (2009)
[21] http://www.filmreference.com/Films-Dr-Ex/Les-Enfants-du-Paradis.html

Rushdie uses this technique constantly in *Verses*. I would say that Salman Rushdie, deeply influenced by the cinema, uses a lot of actors and movies to flourish the book.

> On the shelf of Changez Chamchawala´s teak-lined study… translation of the *Arabian Nights*... there stood a magic lamp, a brightly polished copper-and-brass avatar of Aladdin´s very own genie-container: a lamp begging to be rubbed… 'One day', he assured the boy, 'you´ll have it for yourself' (36).

The magic lamp[22] is one of the symbols in *Verses*. The reason why Saladin comes back to India when his father is sick is because he wants the lamp as he was promised. By rubbing the magic lamp, a person's desires can come true. Saladin wants a new opportunity to live. Rushdie uses this type of allusions to include magic realism in his plot constructions: "Gibreel took the lid off the wonderful lamp of Changez Chamchawala and let it fall clattering to the floor… Gibreel rubbed his hand along the side of the magic lamp: once, twice, thrice… A fearsome jinnee of monstrous stature appeared" (546).

"…like in the movies, when Charlton Hesston stretched out his staff, so that we could, across the ocean-floor, it never happened, couldn´t have, but if not then how, or did we in some way underwater…" (132). This allusion to Charlton Heston connects with one of the aforementioned Biblical references. Rushdie is talking about the great and famous movie *The Ten Commandments*[23], it is a 1956 American Biblical epic film produced, directed, and narrated by Cecil B. DeMille. He also mentions Orson Welles (338), François Truffaut[24], the French film maker, screenwriter, producer, actor, and film critic, as well as one of the founders of the French New Wave is mentioned to refer to his work *Lárgent de poche*. In (518) Rushdie alludes to Malcolm X´s oratory. He used him before in one of Gebreel´s dreams when he is talking about "the bearded and turbaned Iman (205)", when he says "the American convert[25], formerly a successful singer, now known as Bilal X (207). Malcolm X was one of the most important figures of the Black Civil Rights Movement. There is another reference to a political figure "Ms. Torture" (338), Margaret Thatcher[26], a very unpopular figure due to her social reforms. Rushdie pokes fun at her by converting her into a caricature. He also mentions *Love Story* and *The Magnificent Seven*[27] (89), *Potemkin, Kane, Otto e Mezzo, The Seven Samurais, Alphaville, and El Ángel Exterminador*, as

---

[22] Mahdi, Muhsin (1994). *The Thousand and One Nights,* Part 3. Brill. pp. 51–71.

[23] "The Ten Commandments." Turner Classic Movies. Atlanta: Turner Broadcasting System (Time Warner). Retrieved November 13, 2016.

[24] François Truffaut: film author 1932–1984 – Robert Ingram, Paul Duncan. Google Books. Retrieved 6 February 2012.

[25] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5sYTqmPD3jI

[26] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yoIZdEBf9Wk

[27] https://www.filmaffinity.com/es/film306209.html

"All this Western art-house crap" (439) and Blade Runner (340). He also mentions Schwarzenegger (340) and known bandits such as Dick Turpin, Ned Kelly, Poland Devi and Billy the Kid (334).

Throughout *Verses,* Rushdie mentions several great theories which have contributed to construct science: Lamarck Theories, Darwin's *Origin of the Species* (1859), "The evolutionary heresy of Mr. Charles Darwin" (75), Annie Besant´s Theosophy (39), James Joyce's Avant-guard novel *Finnegans Wake* (1939)[28]…, whose experimental style turns it into one of the most difficult works of fiction in the English language[29].

As explained above, as part of f the erudition technique he uses, he constantly flourishes the text with many references in order to embellish a very simple plot, which tries to emulate that of *The Golden Ass,* which is: humans after suffering an impacting experience became other entities (Ass, Angel, Demon), and they perambulate through in between worlds until they find a reason to became normal again but as Phoenix completely renovated.

2.4.   Metamorphosis references

One of the ideas I will attempt to prove is the major role that the concept of "metamorphosis" plays in Rushie's *Verses*. Not only because he anticipates the idea years before in one of his works (Rushdie, 1991), but because the transformation, the migration is the postcolonial theory to interpret the book on the basis of the crisis identity which this theory sustains.

Rushdie (1998) alludes several times to *The Golden Ass*: "Lucius Apuleius of Madaura, Moroccan priest, AD 120-180 approx., colonial of an earlier Empire… in his career he had been transformed, by witchcraft into… an ass" (243). A few pages later, Rushdie also writes: "Lucretius*… De rerun natura… quodqumque suis mutatum finibus exit, continuo hoc mors est illius quod fuid ante…* Lucretius holds, 'by doing so brings immediate death to its old self'… Ovidio in the *Metamorphoses* takes diametrical opposed view… Our spirits! Our immortal essences! –'Are still the same forever, but adopt in their migrations ever-varying forms'… 'For me it is always Ovid over Lucretius' (276-277). The two main characters in

---

[28] What Art is: The Esthetic Theory of Ayn Rand, p 245, Louis Torres, Michelle Marder Kamhi, Open Court Publishing, (2000).

[29] Other references to modern literature include "George Bernard Shaw (70)", (1856-1950), and his The Millionairess , is the play Saladin represents when he comes back to Bombay after he left India. "Thackery (263)", says Rushdie, writes Vanity Fair that is an English novel which follows the lives of Becky Sharp and Emmy Sedley amid their friends and families during and after the Napoleonic Wars during his instance in London. "Hamlet… Ghare-Baire… Tagore (292)", "Percy Westerman, G. A. Henty and Dornford Yates (293)", "Lucius Apuleius… The Golden Ass (310)", "Othello (316)", Lucretius… De rerun natura… Ovid… Metamorphosis (351)", "Herbert… Milosz… Baranczak (378)", "Isaias… Blake (403)", "Camus (522)", "Frankenstein (440)", "Niccolò Machiavelli… *Il Principe*… *Discorsi* (504)", "*Fausto* (522)", "Crusoe (528), Tamerlane… Marlowe (652).

The Satanic Verses, Saladin and Gibreel, undergo an altering form from the beginning of the book to predetermine two classical concepts over which so many books have built their plots, Good and Evil[30], as is the case with Goethe's *Faust* (1832), William Golding´s *Lord of the Flies* (1954), Shakespeare´s *Hamlet* (1601*)* among others. Rushdie establishes the dichotomy to sphere metamorphosis appearance and, in this way, to draw the reader's attention by moving the protagonist and the antagonist from Heaven to Hell.

To better understand how Rushdie uses metamorphosis is indispensable to remember where the origin of the concept comes from and how it has been used in Rushdie's fiction. The *Metamorphoseon libri,* Ovid´s book, is a compilation of 250 myths about alterations orally maintained since the Greek times. The *Heteroioumena* of Nicander of Colophon, 21 stories treated in *Metamorphoses,* was probably the first reference to later Hellenistic writers. Some of the myths like Io, where Zeus transforms himself into a bull to lure Io, in *Book* I comes from the 5th century BC. Ovid, the Latin poet, (43 BC-17 AD) was the first *Kollektivgedicht* as an *epyllion*, an illustration, and a narrative difficult to categorize (García Gual, 1998; Rodríguez Adrados 1995).

"In nova fert animus mutatas dicere formas/corpora" (Ovid, 2004) are the opening words in Ovid's *Metamorphosis* meaning that, *"*I intent to speak of forms changed into new entities."[31] Those transformations may occur in many different ways: from humans to objects, constellations, animals from other animals and fungi to humans, transformations of sex and color. I have conferred *anima* aversion to the transmutations – transformations was the title in English of Kafka´s *Die Verwandlung* – of the formal corps to alter animas since early times Kafka's Gregor Samsa transformation into an insect at the outset of the narrative: "Gregor Samsa… changed into a monstrous verminous bug."[32] This alludes to the German term *Vermandelt* – "verminous" – from the Latin *vermis* which means "worm" is more a psychological state alluding to a human being degradation as Borges[33] advocated. Rushdie uses the transformation motif as a psychological –i.e. mental – state following Kafka´s idea of human corruption and degradation. Magic Realism is just another way to combine real and unreal elements to create a strange atmosphere, just as a form of *captatio benevolentiae* Gual (2004).

Ovid´s book has influenced a great variety of authors of all times; Geoffrey Chaucer in *The Canterbury Tales*; William Shakespeare is influenced by the story of *Pyramus and Thisbe*

---

[30] According to a homiletic teaching in the Talmud, two angels accompany people on their way back home from synagogue on Friday night—a good angel and an evil angel.

[31] William S. Anderson, ed. (1998). Ovid's Metamorphoses.

[32] http://johnstoniatexts.x10host.com/kafka/metamorphosishtml.html

[33] https://elpais.com/diario/1999/09/28/cultura/938469602_850215.html

(1590) on his *Romeo and Juliet (*1597*), A Midsummer Night´s Dream* (1595) *, Venus and Adonis* (1554) *or Titus Andronicus (*1593*)*. There are also quite a few books using metamorphosis as part of the plot in different centuries and contexts: *Metamorphosis* (1905) by Frank Kafka, *The Odyssey* by Homer, *Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde* (1886) by Robert Louis Stevenson, and *The Golden Ass* by Apuleius, just to mention some examples.

After giving a deeper explanation of the meaning of Metamorphosis, we would like to add just a few brush-strokes about the construction writing technique which Rushdie has used in *Verses* to strengthen our purpose of saying that there is no originality in Rushdie but on the contrary a lot of intellectuality and writing technique.

3. CONSTRUCTION WRITING TECHNIQUE

Rushdie explores two clear techniques between others in *Verses* to maintain the *captatio benevolentia* in the readers. These are Ringkomposition and Magic Realism.

3.1. Ringkomposition

The inner structure of Rushdie's *Satanic Verses* is a circular composition which contains another circle inside. In other words, the reader faces a *Ringkomposition* structure: the main character circle, which takes place during the whole book, and the circle constructed by the hallucinations of Gibreel´s *Satanic Verses.*

Rushdie uses *Ringkomposition* because he intends to create a Biblical book for future generations Douglas (2007). A paradigmatic example of chiastic structures, which is the classical designation to Ringkomposition, could be *Genesis Flood Narrative* from *The Book of Genesis[34]* analyzed by Gordon Wenham (1978) and we believe Rushdie has on mind:

A: Noah and his sons (Gen 6:10)

    B: All life on earth (6:13:a)

    C: Curse on earth (6:13:b)

        D: Flood announced (6:7)

        E: Ark (6:14-16)

            F: All living creatures (6:17–20)

            G: Food (6:21)

    H: Animals in man's hands (7:2–3)

        I: Entering the Ark (7:13–16)

        J: Waters increase (7:17–20)

        X: God remembers Noah (8:1)

            J: Waters decrease (8:13–14)

---

[34] From the Latin *Vulgate,* in turn borrowed or transliterated from Greek γένεσις, meaning "Origin."

I': Exiting the Ark (8:15–19)

   H': Animals (9:2,3)

  G': Food (9:3,4)

    F': All living creatures (9:10a)

    E': Ark (9:10b)

   D´: No flood in future (9:11)

  C': Blessing on earth (9:12–17)

  B': All life on earth (9:16)

A: Noah and his sons (9:18,19a)

The Psyche and Cupid Tale, for example, in Apuleius´ *The Golden Ass*, has been analyzed from a feminist perspective as a paradigm of how the gender unity of women is disintegrated through rivalry and envy by replacing the bonds of sisterhood with an ideal of heterosexual love.

As previously mentioned, in *The Golden Ass*, we find the Milesian tales incrusted. There is a tale about Psyche, a beautiful mortal woman, who is isolated from her family when a prophecy says that she will marry a winged monster, a devil. The wind Zephyr takes her from the top of a mountain into a valley and a splendid home where he lives. He falls in love with her even though his mother Venus is deathly jealous of the girl's beauty, and Psyche falls in love with him, too.

By using this technique, Rushdie creates similar parallel plots, as Apuleius´ to connect with religion and open fantasy assorted to reality. In both books, there is a surface line and a deeper line a plot and a subplot where lectors jump from real world to unreal world, considering the real world also a fantasy lived by metamorphosis creatures. Gibreel has several elaborate visions. These visions introduce the Jahilia subplot, which is a revisionist retelling of the early history of Islam. Mahound, a businessperson who starts a new religion called Submission in the pagan city of Jahilia. Submission is the translation of Islam. The religion is special for being monotheistic in a polytheistic culture. Mahound finds opposition from the authorities especially from Abu Simbel, the city´s Grandee. Abu Simbel hires Baal, a poet, to write verses attacking Mahound, Abu Simbel remains restless about the growing sect and allows Mahound and his followers to be persecuted. One day Abu Simbel decides to give protection to Mahound´s sects if he acknowledges three of Jahilia´s most important goddess apart from Allah. Mahound climbs a mountain to consult with archangel Gibreel who reveals to him the word of God. Gibreel seems to affirm Abu Simbel´s request, so Mahound publicly acknowledges the existence of Allah´s daughters.

Soon he says that the revelation comes from Satan, not God. Mahound and the rest of the adherents to Submission flee to the more tolerant city of Yathrib.

Similarly, Gibreel's delirium, in *The Satanic Verses*, is conceived of as Ringkomposition clearly differentiated from the main plot at first, but as the book grows far, frequently they interact into the main plot. These hallucinations account for Rushdie's Fatwa by Ayatollah Khomeini. Palimpsest is used by Salman Rushdie to get into a particular interpretation of the Coran.

3.2.   Magic realism

Once asked about the book he would have loved to write, Rushdie's answer was Garcia Marquez's *Hundred Years of Solitude*[35], which confirms my theory that Salman Rushdie is not a fresh writer in *The Satanic Verses* but rather a bricklike, cementing a megalomaniac literature structure using literature bricks already used.

It is relevant to know that for years Rushdie has been classified by identity studies as the successor of García Marquez´s magic realism[36] (Tsoneva, 2008). Magic realism derives from Latin *fabulae*. *Fabulae*, fables, myths and allegory, defined by Matthe Strecher (1999), as "what happens when a highly detailed, realism setting is invaded by something too strange to believe" (263).

Originally, magic realism was a way to express the realistic American mentality and create an autonomous literary style. Yet, magic realism is not confined to Latin American literature alone, for many Latin American writers have influenced writers around the world, such as Indian writer Salman Rushdie and Nigerian poet and novelist Ben Okri, *The Famished Road*, (1991).

If we take the above into consideration, we can affirm that the first magic realism could be found in the Milesian Tales. Gual in his work *The origins of the novel* (1995) explains that the *fabula milesiaca* is usually a short story, folktale a fable which features love and adventure surrounded by erotic or titillating nature. The Milesian Tales could be found in examples such as *Satyricon* of Petronius[37], *"At ego tibi sermone itso Milesio varias fabulas conseram",* "but let me join together different stories in that Milesian style" from *The Golden Ass*, the *Gesta Romanorum*, Boccaccio's *Decameron* or *Heptameron* of Marguerite of Navarre. The Milesian Tale comes from the Milisiaka of Aristides of Miletus, translated into Latin by Lucius Cornelius Sisenna under the title of *Milesiae Fabulae*, Milesian Fables. The

---

[35] As he assured in Indian Today (2017). "*Embracing Islam Was A Mistake": Salman Rushdie On The Couch With Koel:* https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DDGV2RUvzwc.

[36] The term "magical realism" was first introduced by Franz Roh, a German art critic, who considered magical realism an art category. First appeared in 1955.

[37] http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/petronius1.html

only Milesian Tale conserved is *Cupid and Psyche*. Chaucer, *The Miller´s Tale* is much into the Aristide´s tradition, to mention a more recent influence.

In Apuleius *The Golden Ass* (158/9 AD), magic realism is present from the beginning of the book. For example:"My dear Socrates", I said, "these are certainly very wonderful and terrible stories… when the wound in his throat opened wide and the sponge dropped out into the water, followed by a small trickled of blood (28-30).

In *One Hundred Years of Solitude,* García Marquez incorporates many supernatural motifs like levitation and flying carpets. Marquez also creates, in the tradition of the grotesque carnival and supernatural realism, the character of Melquíades, who is an overweight gypsy with supernatural powers. His novel contains powerful images of paradoxical bodily disgust and celebration, ambivalent celebration and laughter, and the reconstruction of human shapes, all of which exemplify characteristics of magic realism.

In *Verses* there are three sequences related to magic realism. One of these sequences contains most of the elements that have been criticized as offensive to Muslims. It is an altered re-writing of the life of Muhammad, called "Mahound" or "the Messenger" in the novel, in Mecca "Jahiliyyah". At its center, we can find the episode of the so-called *satanic verses*, in which the prophet first proclaims a revelation in favor of the old polytheistic deities, but later renounces this as an error induced by the Devil. There are also two opponents of the "Messenger": a demonic heathen priestess, Hind bint Utbah, and an irreverent skeptic and satirical poet, Baal. When the prophet returns to the city in triumph, Baal goes into hiding in an underground brothel, where the prostitutes assume the identities of the prophet's wives. Also, one of the prophet's companions claims that he, who questions the authenticity of the "Messenger," has subtly altered portions of the Quran as they were dictated to him.

The second relevant sequence in order to remark the connection between Rushdie's use of magic realism and blasphemy is the story of Ayesha, an Indian peasant girl who claims to be receiving revelations from the Archangel Gibreel. She entices all her village community to embark on a foot pilgrimage to Mecca, claiming that they will be able to walk across the Arabian Sea. The pilgrimage ends in a catastrophic climax as the believers all walk into the water and disappear, amid disturbingly conflicting testimonies from observers about whether they just drowned or were in fact miraculously able to cross the sea.

A third dream sequence presents the figure of a fanatic expatriate religious leader, the "Imam", in a late-20th-century setting. This figure is a transparent allusion to the life of Ruhollah Khomeini in his Parisian exile, but it is also linked through several recurrent narrative motifs to the figure of the "Messenger".

So far, we have exposed how the reader can find examples of the tripod construction techniques, Metamorphosis, *Ringkomposition* and magic realism in *Verses*. Salman Rushdie considers Metamorphosis, as the glue to adjust characters to the *Verses* plot. It would have been impossible to construct the Verses´ edifice taking away metamorphosis and *Ringkomposition* maintaining the façade as solid as it has been built. It is our opinion that without these two remarkable features, The *Satanic Verses* or, more properly, the meaning, the relevance and the repercussion of Rushdie's pages would have been minimized. Because of this, I believe that *The Satanic Verses* are apparently original, however, as explained throughout this essay, originality is not one of the strengths of this novel.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Due to the influence received by the Post colonialism studies, Rushdie seems to have developed the main plot of the *Verses* over the transformation of the characters into oppositions, Good/Evil, Quran/Bible, Men/Women – I understand Saladin becomes more "womanized" at the end of the book – a very deconstructive way of writing and presenting moderns stories.

Definitely, the plot in *The Satanic Verses* is more complicated than that and not so lineal, on account of the frequent *Ringkomposition* structure the author resorts to. In short, the jumbo jet Bostan explodes over the English Channel. Two passengers fall down to the water and miraculously they survive; Gibreel Farishta, is a famous Bollywood actor, and Saladin Chamcha is an obscure voice actor who lives in London. Gibreel and Saladin undergo a curious transformation during their fall; they take on the personalities and physical characteristics of the archangel Gabriel and Satan, in a goat form, respectively. Since that moment, their lives take different paths: while Gabriel enjoys triumph, Saladin suffers rejection. At this point, Lucius and Saladin are the same.

However, I clearly see two ways of interpreting metamorphosis in *The Satanic Verses* anyway. On the one hand, a way of transcending physical chains, a way of liberation, the beginning of a new life, and this one also would concord with the one that is explained in *The Golden Ass*. On the other, we always have an alternative of living life in a different way, as in a virtual world, very commonly done nowadays on the Internet in virtual World conceptions, closer to *One Hundred Years of Solitude* Tsoneva (2008).

From my point of view, Gibreel is Salman Rushdie in disguised. We could easily see Augustus-Rushdie transforming Rome from brick to marble. The flying position of Gibreel through the streets of London seeing its habitants as zombies – another interesting case of transmutation – could be interpreted as a Nero-Salman watching Rome on flames from his

palace playing the lira while reciting verses from his own poems. The classical idea of soul migration has been interpreted as a psychological state of personal alienation, moral incoherence and emptiness Tsoneva (2008). Gibreel is empty due to his alienation. Gibreel through his metamorphosis is simply assimilating the colonial identity, he is a colonized, and his way of seeing others is with an "evil eye", using a Homi Bhabha´s[38] term.

I have analyzed the novel in light of magic realism. There are similarities with Kafka´s transformation in a cockroach. Tales, as internal rings, permit the plot to be broken to travel on time and limits. The Tilipur subplot seems like the Liliputians in Jonathan Swift's *Gulliver´s travels* (1726)*.* A traveler goes to a fictional world and after promising to be good, he is liberated. The narration is a satiric critique to the European religious conflicts of the moment.

To my knowledge, Rushdie could never be considered a creator in Stefan Zweig's[39] idea. In my opinion, there are two types of writers, the ones that really create something original such us Apuleius, Kafka, Marquez, Joyce or Mishima, just to mention some of them, and those who use what has been already said and transform that into a new version majestically done. This is the case with Rushdie, Murakami, Coetzee and Pamuk, among others. Throughout this paper, I have tried to demonstrate that *The Satanic Verses* is also a hybrid novel. Hybridity is a mechanism of attuning dissonances and finding the common grain of life buried under layers of disparities. The novel could be a search for what is lost and (re)gained. This is a postcolonial assertion. Angels and demons, the eternal dichotomy Good/Evil, Me/the Other, God/Satan, Orient/Occident, *occidere* means to "to die" in Latin, Live/Death. The originality of Rushdie is undisputable but not in terms of the narrative constructive technique and originality. His prose is as beautiful as a smelling flower land, adorned with hundred or classic and modern references, but his architecture writing construction is not new, he uses ring compositions so often that sometimes distract.

To conclude, I would like to add, apart from the previous critic conclusion that *The Satanic Verses* has not been understood yet in terms of religion and I open a door for future investigations to assert that it could have been conceived as a Bible. Maybe in a future this art-piece will be read as the tour de force of amusement it is without radicalism involved. I find *Verses* has been built on beauty and fertile imagination, just for the pleasure, indispensable ingredient for a genuine art piece and desired in rereading it over and over again.

---

[38] Homi K. Bhabha. *The location of culture*. (1949).
[39] https://stefanandlotteinparadise.wordpress.com/article/

Whatever the case is, what is clear is that *Verses*: Καὶ οὐκ ἔστιν πᾶν πρόσφατον ὑπὸ τὸν ἥλιον*: Nihil novum sub solem*. *Valete*

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Abigail, L. Classic Notes: *The Satanic Verses.* Boston: GradeSaver LLC. Kindle Edition, 2005.

Adrados, F. *Sociedad, amor y poesía en la Grecia antigua.* Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1995.

Apuleyo, L. *El asno de oro.* Tr. Lisardo Rubio Fernández. Madrid: Gredos, 1987.

Apuleius, L. Tr. Robert Graves. *The Golden Ass.* United Kingdom: Penguin Classics, 1976.

Bhabha, H. *The location of culture.* London: Routdlege, 1994.

Barry, P. *Beginning Theory. An Introduction to Literary and Cultural Theory.* Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2017.

Colonga, A. et **Turrado**, L. *Vulgatam Clementinam.* Matriti: Graecorum et Romanorum scriptores, 1999.

Douglas, M. *Thinking in Circles: an essay on ring composition.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2007.

Edwards, L. "The Labors of Psyche: Toward a Theory of Female Heroism". *Critical Inquiry,* 1976, *6* (1), 33-49. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/1343084

Wenham, G. "The Coherence of the Flood Narrative" *Vetus Testamentum.* 1978, 28, 336–348.

Ganapathy-Doré, G. Shakespeare in Rushdie/Shakespearean Rushdie. ATLANTIS. *Journal of the Spanish Association of Anglo-American Studies.* 2009, 31, (2), 9-22.

García Gual, C. *Los orígenes de la novela.* Madrid: Itsmo, 1998.

Indian Today. "*Embracing Islam Was a Mistake": Salman Rushdie On The Couch With Koel:* (2017). https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DDGV2RUvzwc

Kafka, F. Tr. R. Kruger. *La Metamorfosis. La Condena.* Madrid: Edaf, 1982.

Khwaja, W. "What Upsets Muslims about Satanic Verses", *South Asian Review*, 2005, Vol. 25, No. 2.

Lind, A. *The Satanic Verses. Salman Rushdie.* USA: GradeSaver LLC, 2013.

García Márquez, G. *Cien años de soledad.* Madrid: Cátedra, 1986.

Matthew C. S. "Magical Realism and the Search for Identity in the Fiction of Murakami Haruki", *Journal of Japanese Studies.* 1999, Volume 25, Number 2, pp. 263-298.

Morgan, K. *Myth and Philoosphy from the Presocratics to Plato.* Cambridge: University Press, 2000.

Nabokov, V. *Lectures on Don Quixote*. NY: A Harvest/HBJ Book, 1983.

Osborne-Bartucca, K. *The Golden Ass. Apuleius*. USA: GradeSaver LLC, 2016.

Ovidio, N. *Metamorfosis.* Tr. Consuelo Álvarez & Rosa Mª Iglesias. Madrid: Cátedra, 2004.

Pinsent, J. *Greek Mythology*. New York: Peter Bedrick Books, 1982.

Rodríguez, J. *Géneros literarios y mundos posibles*. Madrid: Eneida, 2008.

Rushdie, S. *Los versos satánicos*. London: Penguin Random House, 1998.

Rushdie, S. *Los versos satánicos*. Barcelona: Penguin Random House, 2017.

Rushdie, S. *(1991). Imaginary Homelands. Essays and Criticism 1981-1991.* London: Granta Books, 1991.

Said, E. *Orientalism*. New York: Random House, 1978.

Siddiqui, A. Gods into bulls, men into wolves, women into spiders: classical metamorphosis in *The Satanic Verses*, *Classical Receptions Journal*. 2014, Volume 6, Issue 3, 1 Pages 426–445, https://doi.org/10.1093/crj/clt026

Tadié, A. "La littérature classique selon Salman Rushdie". *Revue de littérature comparée*. 2014, (4), 429-440. https://www.cairn.info/revue-de-litterature-comparee-2012-4-page-429.htm.

Tsoneva, P. "Metamorphosis and identity construction in Salman Rushdie´s The Satanic Verses", *University of Bucharest Review.* 2008*.* Vol. X, no. 1.

.

The Ebony Tower: Mythical Women and Powerful Men[1]

The Ebony Tower: Mujeres míticas y hombres poderosos

Esther Muñoz-González
Universidad de Zaragoza
emunoz@unizar.es

Resumen

The Ebony Tower (1975) es una novela corta deliberada en su artificialidad que constituye un perfecto ejemplo de la permanente reformulación de temas que John Fowles lleva a cabo a lo largo de toda su obra—como los pares opuestos de creadores vs coleccionistas, cómo el nacimiento y la clase social marcan la diferencia de oportunidades en la vida, la dificultad para comunicarse—, elementos míticos y una perspectiva existencialista. Teniendo en cuenta que la novela corta sigue escrupulosamente los pasos del "viaje del héroe" (Campbell, 1993: 245), el propósito de este artículo es, primeramente, debatir los elementos míticos en el texto de Fowles y cómo los personajes coinciden y divergen de sus arquetipos míticos. Y, en segundo lugar, probar que esos roles míticos podrían ser patriarcales y estar contribuyendo a mantener posiciones de subyugación para las mujeres ya como musas, colaboradoras o simplemente como objetos sexuales del deseo y para procrear.

Palabras clave: Mito, Arquetipo, Roles sexuales, Postmodernismo.

Abstract

The Ebony Tower (1975) is a self-conscious novella that constitutes a perfect example of John Fowles's consistent reformulation, throughout his work, of themes—such as the oppositional pair creator versus collector, how birth and social class grant different opportunities in life, the difficulty to communicate—, mythical elements and the existentialist perspective. Considering that the novella follows scrupulously each stage in

---

"the hero's quest" (Campbell, 1993: 245), the purpose of this article is, firstly, to discuss the mythical elements in the novella and how the characters coincide on and depart from what can be expected from their mythical archetypes. And secondly, to prove that these mythical roles could have a patriarchal shape and may contribute to maintaining subjugated positions for the women whether as muses, collaborators or simply as sexual objects of desire and procreation.

Keywords: Myth, Archetypes, Gender Roles, Postmodernism.

1. INTRODUCTION

John Fowles is considered to be a key figure in the development of literary postmodernism in England, one of those first writers who were concerned with "the renewal of the novel form while preserving its intelligibility and the old humanist values of classic realism" (Onega, 2002:142). The American writer and critic John Barth included John Fowles in the list of main postmodernist writers in his 'manifesto of postmodernism' "The Literature of Replenishment" originally published in 1980 (1984:195). In this list of the fathers of the movement, John Fowles was the only British writer among Americans and continental Europeans. It is almost impossible to try and define postmodernist literature in a few words, but it could be said that it is a trend characterized by "the impulse to absorb and transcend not just one 'exhausted' form but two: classic realism and modernism" (Onega, 2002:143). Fowles was already a very well-known writer after the publication of three key works, *The Collector* (1963), *The Magus* (1966) and *The French Lieutenant's Woman* (1969). These three novels and the short story collection *The Ebony Tower* (1975) have recurrent elements that appear once and again in Fowles's works. The working title of *The Ebony Tower* was *Variations*, and as Kerry MacSeeny has pointed out, "the fictions do present variations on the themes, motifs, dramatic situations, and narrative techniques of the three preceding novels" (qtd. in Holmes, 1985: 21). Fowles's self-conscious writings have been studied attending to many different elements and perspectives, due precisely to this consistent reformulation, throughout his work, of themes and/or character types, such as the oppositional pair creator versus/collector, which is directly related to the opposition between science and art; opportunities in life depending on birth and social class; difficulties in communication related to language; mythical elements; and the existentialist perspective (See Holmes 1985; Onega, 2001; Onega, 2002). Nevertheless, according to Lenz, the novella *The Ebony Tower* is a transitional work that departs from a previous model of "authorial control and manipulation to a model that accepts uncertainty and multiple perspectives" (2008: 43). Furthermore, Fowles's evolution, in terms of

philosophy, was also evident when he affirmed in 1979—five years after the publication of *The Ebony Tower*— that "he had come to consider existentialism . . . as only 'a kind of literary metaphor, a wish fulfillment' (Wilson, 2006: 140), and by 1988 he declared himself "no longer an existentialist" (Wilson, 2006: 140).

The Ebony Tower is the novella which gives title to the collection of short stories published by John Fowles in 1975. This novella narrates the story of a young painter and critic, David Williams, who travels to Coëtminais (France) to interview a famous British painter, Henry Breasley, in order to prepare the biographical introduction to a book on his paintings. The fact that the old painter cohabites with two young women, Diana—alias "the mouse" (Fowles, 1975: 8)—and Anne—"alias the freak" (Fowles,1975:19)—, contrasts with the conventional life that David has built in London. The novella reflects David's thoughts and reactions after discovering the peculiar universe which Breasley has created in Coëtminais and his enormously different way of understanding life and art. As Frederick M. Holmes points out, *The Ebony Tower* consciously reveals its fictional character within a surface of formal realism. The influence of previous writings such as *Eliduc* by Marie De France or *The Magus* by Fowles himself is willingly displayed (Holmes, 1985: 24). The purpose of this paper is, firstly, to discuss the mythical elements in the novella and how the characters coincide on and depart from what can be expected from their mythical archetypes. And secondly, to prove that these mythical roles could have a patriarchal shape and may contribute to maintaining subjugated positions for the two women whether as muses, collaborators or simply as sexual objects of desire and procreation. This working hypothesis will be developed and tested through the analysis of the portrayal of Diana, Anne, and the off screen Beth, as well as of the relationship of these three women with the two men in the story.

2. THE HERO'S QUEST

It seems to be a general agreement among scholars who have analysed Fowles's fictional works in that they "share a single unifying topos: that of the young hero's quest for maturation and cosmic integration, usually carried out simultaneously in its archetypal, psychological and existentialist versions" (Holmes, 1985: 39). Still, the *male* hero in this quest motif almost always "pursues the mysterious, inspirational, and ultimately unattainable female . . . while she is relegated to a marginal existence as catalyst for the hero's quest" (Lenz, 2008: 7-8). *The Ebony Tower* contains what Joseph Campbell called "the keys" (1993: 245) in the hero's quest. David Williams is "called to adventure" (Campbell, 1993:245), that is, he is asked to travel and interview Breasley and, in order to

92

do so, he undertakes a journey to Coëtminais, —located in the mythically charged, Celtic Brittany—and has to cross a land "exhaling a spent fertility" (Fowles, 1975:3). Chance, another important element in mythical terms, also intervenes in that David Williams is travelling alone, without his wife Beth, because their daughter has fallen ill with chicken-pox, thus provoking a "last-minute crisis" (Fowles, 1975:7). Until this moment, David had been living in the ordinary world of "common day" (Campbell, 1993: 245) outside the mythical land. When he steps over the threshold "of adventure" (Campbell, 1993:245), or, in other words, the frontier separating the real and ordinary world from the archetypal world "of wonder" (Campbell, 1993:245), and enters the manoir of Coëtminais, he encounters unfamiliar rules and values. In this mythical land, the hero meets tests, allies and enemies and, what is more significant, he gets in contact with wild nature, which is the "real" world according to Fowles:

> Well, the real in the general sense, the real for me does not lie where we are now, in other words, in cities. It lies for me very much in the countryside and in the wild. They had a phrase in medieval art, the "hortus conclusus", that is, the garden surrounded by a wall. Very often the Virgin Mary and the Unicorn would be inside this wall and, you see it in medieval painting, everything outside the pretty little walled garden is chaos. (Onega, 1988:70)

This garden has also been interpreted as a metaphorical Eden to which "a questing Adam character [is] guided out of Christianity both by mesmerizing Eve characters and sometimes also by mentors enacting the part as quasi-divine serpents" (Hyving, 2007: 8).

2.1. Diana and Anne: The Helpers

There are two naked girls in this *hortus conclusus*: Diana and Anne. Diana represents the self-sacrificing and devoted Virgin Mary and the archetypal white lily, as the narrator suggests: "there was something preternaturally grave about her, almost Victorian" (Fowles, 1975: 8). Innocent, almost always wearing white, Diana is the promising and skilful girl who puts her own aspirations and desires in the background. Henry Breasley, in his first conversation with David Williams, clearly establishes what for him is Diana's role in his life: "Thinks she's Lizzie Siddal.[1] Which makes me that ghastly little Italian fudger damn" (Fowles, 1975:18). Breasley's comparison between Diana and Lizzie suggests that

---

[1] Elizabeth Eleanor Siddal Rossetti (1829-1862) was an English poet and artist who acted as a model for many pre-Raphaelite painters, mainly for her husband, Dante Gabriel Rossetti. Although Lizzie had her own artistic aspirations, they were subordinated to those of whom eventually became her husband although the latter's artistic productivity was directly related to the time they spent together, Bradley (1992:137-87)

his own production is linked to the presence of his muse while, at the same time, he diminishes the importance of Diana's artistic talents: "I let her help" (23). By classifying Diana as a helper, Breasley subordinates her talent to his own creative work, even though he recognizes his dependence on her: "Couldn't do without her, really", Fowles (1975:23). In other words, as Lenz argues, Fowles's heroines are "ultimately muses . . . [who] along with their need, desires and concerns, fade into the background or the male quest for enlightenment" (2008: 8). As Lenz goes on to say, even if Fowles's female characters at their best are talented, intuitive and mysterious and "represent progression, vitality, creativity, independence, and authenticity" (2008: 7), they are still trapped within a conventional understanding of gender difference that attaches to men all the virtues related to reason and to women all the emotional and 'irrational' ones, that is, a very essentialist view of gender difference.

Diana is not alone in the garden. Anne, alias the Freak, is with her. While Diana is the sexually innocent white lily, at first sight, Anne embodies Eve, the sexually experienced red rose, the other side of the Jungian archetype of the anima (Jung, 1981:175-78) —even her name, 'Anne', is phonetically included within the name 'Diane'. According to Frazer, in agricultural societies, goddesses sometimes appeared as two versions of the same divinity, such as Demeter and Persephone (2015: Chapter XLIV, 10), or even as three, what Robert Powell calls the *Trinosophia,* the Divine feminine "picturing the three aspects of woman: virgin, mother, crone" (2000:10). Anne is less conventional and moderate than Diana; she has a lower social class origin but is very supporting of her friend Diana. She fears that she has been a negative sexual model for Diana: "She thinks it's either like it is with Henry or the way I used to go on. She doesn't know what it's about" (Fowles, 1975:78). Anne believes this is the reason why Diana is scared to face the external world. She remains in the mythical manoir as an eternal virgin in the enclosed garden because the old king is unable to have real sex with her. Moreover Diana, in the fullness of youth, cannot truly create a fulfilling man-woman relationship with such an elderly man as Breasley.

2.2. The 'Old King': Breasley

Breasley openly confesses that he needs women around him as a source of inspiration because he sees sex as source of life, vitality and energy: "can't love, can't paint" (Fowles, 1975:43). In *The Golden Bough*, Sir James Frazer explained that, in Roman mythology, Diana was worshiped as a goddess of fertility in addition to being a goddess of the woodlands. Diana, the mouse/muse, in her mythical dimension, is the goddess of fertility not for the land but for artistic creation. The old and famous painter is supposed to be teaching Diana, and he lets her do "the donkey work" in his painting (Fowles, 1975:23),

but the reality is that he cannot create without her help. He is sucking up her life, her energy, and impeding her own realization. As Frazer points out, a goddess of fertility was also expected to be fertile herself and this is why she must be married, to propitiate the fertility of the people and the land (2015: Chapter XII, 3), but a "sacred marriage" with and old man incapable of creating by himself cannot be fertile. Diana is in a mythical sense a princess trapped by a dragon waiting for the hero to save her, as she herself confides to David: "I'm under a spell" (Fowles, 1975:83). She is unable to have full sexual intercourse with Breasley, and what is more, she does not love him: "I can't love him physically" (Fowles, 1975: 82). This self-imposed sexual inability suggests that she embodies the virgin archetype and still feels like a virgin. Furthermore, Diana is perfectly aware that if she leaves the old artist, he will not be able to paint any more. Breasley has always needed art as a way of communicating. Moreover, this is the only way for him now in his old age, since his speech is hardly understandable. Diana, who has become his muse/helper/translator is a prisoner in a world that seems to be out of time, waiting for her valiant prince to save her. But to be saved is not the role expected from the muse, she has to inspire the artist. Fowles's admiration for 'female' archetypes adorned with innate characteristics is "in fact an enthusiasm for a very old and very conventional idealization of women (Lenz, 2008: 9). Diana has to 'save the prince' first, and only then she will achieve her own personal and artistic freedom: "Women must liberate men from their misconceptions so that they can liberate women in practice. It is a dialectic that gives men almost unlimited power and imprisons women in liberating rather than liberated roles" (González-Gati, 1993: 15).

2.3. The Hero and 'Mythical' Women

If Breasley were the King of the Wood, who has to be replaced by a new king in order to restore fertility to the land (Frazer, 2015: Chapter I, 2), then David would be the aspirant, the young priest/king and consequently the main hero in this archetypal hero's quest. *The Ebony Tower* intertwines two myths, as often happens in fiction, according to Laurence Coupe. As this critic eloquently explains, in some fictional narratives arising out of the move "from sacred ceremony (Ritual) to secular literature (Romance)" (1997:28-29), there is often a link between Frazer's King of the Wood and Campbell's hero's quest unifying both myths. David had been chosen—the 'call to adventure'—by Breasley to write his autobiography because he was "reasonably near the truth" (Fowles, 1975:63); that is, David could understand Breasly's way of living and what for the old painter is living art, both inextricably related. Breasly speaks through his art because from Fowles's point of view: "what is irreplaceable in any object or art is never, in the final analysis, its technique

95

or craft, but the personality of the artist, the expression of his or her unique and individual feeling" (Neary, 1992: 91). When David meets Diana, he becomes aware that: "for the first time in his life he knew more than the fact of being; but the passion to exist" (Fowles, 1975:95). Up to this moment David had been living a reasonable and logically projected life within society's norms. He has only known an ordinary average existence, not heroic at all, a life without room for strong passions and imagination. He rejects the opportunity to be with a woman who physically and psychologically inspires him because he feels terror "of destroying what one had so carefully built" (Fowles, 1975:91). David is a narcissistic man "flattered by his own influence on Diana's work, and stirred by Diana's modesty and uncertainty in her abilities (Lenz, 2008: 144). He idealizes Diana's intelligence, mystery and even sexuality whereas by contrast thinks of Beth—his wife—as "disappointingly real" (Lenz, 2008: 146). David has created a happy, stable and domestic family life, and suddenly, all his personal convictions are at risk. He experiences, a terrible fear "of losing that certainty" (Fowles, 1975:90). Conjugal fidelity would not originate the conflict, because both of them, Beth and he, are not against sexual liberation, but only "in other people, in some of their friends" (Fowles, 1975:90). What David finds hardly tolerable is the idea of losing the security that no other man will be in bed with his wife, a genuine patriarchal thought, simply related to "taste" (Fowles, 1975:91) in David's claim, but in fact indicating a subtle possessiveness, ownership. Furthermore, Jabbar develops a Freudian interpretation—which also subordinates both women to David's character—of the triangle formed by Diana, Beth and David, and identifies Diana with a "predatory id" (2014: n.p.) embodying David's ego repressed desires, whereas Beth/super-ego "becomes inadvertently an enactment of the role of the conscience" (2014: n.p.).

In the first encounters with Anne, the Freak, David is only able to see a sexualized woman and by comparison he immediately establishes a sharp distinction between Anne and Diana. After their first meeting, Diana is endowed with all kind of virtues in his thoughts, whereas Anne is deprived of positive characteristics: "She seemed so much a mere parasite on the other girl's poise and honesty; her only apparent virtue, that she was tolerated" (Fowles, 1975:56). Initially, David despises the Freak, and describes her as "preposterous", as having "the look of a rag doll, a neurotic golliwog" (Fowles, 1975:19). She is ridiculed and sexualized as an object, not even a human being, following the sharp division in a patriarchal vision of women that divide women into 'good' and 'bad' and makes the first worthy of men's love, adoration and respect and transforms the latter into objects of desire and repulsion at the same time. If Diana is the virgin, Anne must be the whore. But as Phillips underlines, it is Diane "who is sexually involved with Breasley,

rather than Anne" (2009: 136), subverting this way the archetype and the expected 'purity' of the Virgin Mary/muse. Moreover, Anne is decisive not only in helping David see Diana's worth but also in encouraging him to confront Breasley: "The Freak's hand had reached along beneath the table, apparently to give him courage" (Fowles, 1975:38). She is an unselfish lover/nurse with Breasley and the only support to Diana, as she herself explains: "I feel she's my last hold on... the real world?" (Fowles, 1975:85). Furthermore, Anne is the clairvoyant inhabitant of the manoir, able to understand and recognize the aims and motivations of the others; she sees their failures, and at the end of the novella, she reproaches the hero his cowardice: "you should have made it, David. Just once" (Fowles, 1975:97). For all this, it is Diana who eventually teaches the purblind hero the most important lesson: to appreciate and respect her by learning that the archetypes of good and evil are not the exclusive patrimony of any single woman. *The Ebony Tower* does not send a monolithic message. On the contrary, it is rather ambiguous and emphasizes the impossibility of achieving "full and coherent understanding of others or of a text" (Lenz, 2008: 133). Furthermore, as Neary remarks: "Jung, I think, merely provide Fowles with archetypes to play with and deconstruct" (1992: 183).

2.4. The Hero and The Angel in the House

David Williams lives with the 'angel in the house': Beth, a woman who has learnt to be happy by taking care of their children and doing minor artistic works after a brief period of rebellion against "constant motherhood" (Fowles, 1975:15). Beth represents certainty, reasons and fact and by contrast, Diana excites David's animal instinctual side. After seeing Diana naked, swimming in the pond, David becomes aware of "a brutality totally alien to his nature" (Fowles, 1975:69). This knowledge takes him far from logic and reason and nearer the way Henry Breasley understands life and art, as passion, creativity. Still, David is caught in "the trap of marriage, when the physical has turned to affection, familiar postures, familiar games, a safe mutual art and science" (Fowles, 1975:93). He is a disappointing hero; In spite of the fact of possessing all the features of a true hero/artist, and of having been helped by both girls, Anne and Diana, he fails the test because he does not dare to risk his old life style, as he himself acknowledges: "one killed all risk, one refused all challenge, and so one became an artificial man" (Fowles, 1975:103). David is tempted by what is human freedom according to Fowles: "a craving to escape from the facts imposed on us" (Onega, 2001:162). To David, Diana and Coëtminais represent passion, sexuality in the Freudian sense of the term, that is, as a human activity far beyond biological need: "the concept of 'sexuality' and at the same time of the sexual instinct, had,

it is true, to be extended so as to cover many things which could not be classed under the reproductive function" (Freud, 1961:61).

David already has an ordered, reasonable sexuality with his wife. He even plans how to make Beth pregnant again (Fowles, 1975: 57). David does not take into account Beth as an artist. He only values her fecundity—as a woman not as an artist—and the predictive security and stability of his life with her. Eventually, he chooses routine, security and facts. At the end of the novella, David returns home, but as Onega convincingly explains, without "the knowledge of the arcana that would transform him into an artist/magus with the shamanistic power to heal the split between self and world" (2001:170). In other words, he returns to the world of common day without 'the grail' because he is not going to change either in terms of painting, or in terms of living. He is very conscious of his role and what can be expected of him as the mythical hero of this quest/journey, and he recognizes his failure: "He had failed both in the contemporary and the medieval sense" (Fowles, 1975:100). As Lenz claims, David's failure condemns him "to an extremely resigned view of Beth, the mother of his children and an artist in her own right … [instead of] the mystery and vitality he might have seen in her had he embraced not Diana, but the alternative way of being she embodies" (2008:148).

3. MYTHICAL WOMEN AND FEMINISM

Anne wants Diana to be saved by the hero, because she knows that without help from the external world Diana will waste her life and talent, trapped by her generosity, innocence and sense of responsibility. Anne is compared with a doll twice, "an absurd sex-doll on the sofa" (Fowles, 1975:19; 30). Dolls have been related to regeneration, reproduction, the sexual aspect of the woman/goddess archetype of seasonal myth (Frazer, 2015: Chapter XII, 4; Chapter XLV, 4). In Breasley's laconic terms: "I have to have women round me. Sense of timing. Bleeding and all that." (Fowles, 1975:23). This remark associates both women with the cyclical time of myth in the Manoir. But in a much more contemporary and patriarchal sense, a "sex-doll" could be only an object of pleasure for men. Not in vane do some feminist critics such as Monique Wittig consider the very idea of being a woman a social creation, a "mythic construction". In her essay "One Is Not Born a Woman" Wittig, echoing Simone de Beauvoir, contends that matriarchy and patriarchy are both equally "oppressive because equally heterosexist" (1993:104). Writing from a lesbian perspective, Wittig is very critical of the division of humanity attending only to the idea of biological differences based on the capacity or incapacity to give birth. Moreover, as Giezen affirms:

> We are not only men and women. The relationships between gender and identity are more complicated than the mythical binary opposition male/female. What we are or want to be is determined by a complex intersection of other identity forming categories as well, such as ethnicity and class. This is a story that myths do not tell. (2005: 23)

Myth seems to be insufficient to conceptualize gender relationships and identities since mythical story patterns are usually "based on conflicts that arise within the familiar framework of the patriarchal family and of a wider society in which authority and property are still distributed on patriarchal lines" (Doherty, 2003: 10).

Why should a young woman, such as Diana, need a hero to be saved in the twentieth Century? It could be argued that the white lily that Diana embodies is a patriarchal archetype that is always subordinated to man, a very chauvinistic model in a world in which, as Wittig claims, "it is debilitating to be any woman in a society where women are warned that if they do not behave like angels they must be monsters" (1993:104). Furthermore, Diana has neither sexual nor artistic plenitude. She wants to be a painter, not a wife; but she does not trust her own value as an artist. In the novella, art is presented as the highest and most perfect medium to communicate, to express and acquire knowledge. As Onega concludes: "collecting and creating are the metaphors for expressing what he [Fowles] considers to be two basic ways of relating self and world" (2002:144). As artists, both writers and painters are creators and can be equated with each other. Sandra Gilbert and Susan Gubar famously argued that women suffer a different process of anxiety regarding their works in comparison with their male colleagues. Male writers suffer from "anxiety of influence", the fear of being so influenced by their strong predecessors that they will not be able to create original works. In the case of women, they do not have predecessors, the canon is made by male artists/writers who represent the patriarchal model and have the authority to typify woman either as an angel or a monster. Therefore, the female writer fears "that she cannot create" (Gilbert and Gubar, 1984:46-49). This "anxiety of authorship" (46) is experienced by Diana as an artist who acts as Henry Breasley's muse and helper but does not trust her own value. As Anne, the person who better knows her, says: "She's stupid. The way clever girls are sometimes […] the person she can't see through is herself" (Fowles, 1975:67).

Furthermore, it is not only Diana who is critical with her own work; even David after watching her paintings is condescending. He appreciates in them "an analogy with his own development; in a more feminine, decorative kind of way", Fowles (1975:81). This apparent recognition of femininity applied to everything that a woman does, could be in

contradiction to contemporary feminist thought, although even the author, Fowles was very conscious of this disagreement:

> I am not a feminist in the fiercely active political sense it is usually used in England and America nowadays, but I have sympathy for the general "anima", the feminine spirit, the feminine intelligence, and I think that all male judgements of the way women go about life are so biased that they are virtually worthless. Man is really being a very prejudiced judge of his own case and of course when judging against women. It is counted very bad taste in England now to talk favourably of women's intuition. The real feminists in England do not like this sentimental talk of female intuition. I am afraid I still have some faith in that. Women cannot, I think, sometimes think as logically or rationally as men can, but thinking logically or rationally often leads you into error. (Onega, 1988:71)

Fowles acknowledged the differences between his ideological position and contemporary feminism. As Lenz rightly argues: "his enthusiasm for feminism was in fact and enthusiasm for a very old and very conventional idealization of women" (2008:9). Still, it is surprising that while "feminists have criticized Fowles for his attitude toward women, for example, many women readers seem to have appreciated his apparently genuine fascination with an archetypal characterization of women" (Lenz: 2008: 16). Thus, Fowles's novels in general are read, on the one hand, as "texts of phallic reinforcement" (González-Gatti, 1993, 21) and, on the other hand, *The Ebony Tower* in particular could be read as a text marking an evolution in Fowles's texts. According to Lenz it could be interpreted by using a "standpoint approach" that would emphasize its ambiguity and multiple possible perspectives. This would allow the feminist critic to "interrogate not only her own various perspectives but also Fowles's various perspectives as they inhabit and emerge from his texts" (Lenz: 2008, 19).

4. CONCLUSION

In summary, the most obvious finding to emerge from the analysis is that Diana and Anne, the twin "goddesses" in the fertility myth, perfectly fulfil the archetype of the anima/muse that motivates both men, Henry Breasley and David Williams to create. Their sexuality provides the two men with creative impulse and force, while Beth has accommodated herself to the role of angel in the house in what for David is a land of certainty, common sense and lack of risk. From the point of view of contemporary women, this role, although impregnated with the ancient power of reproduction, can be seen as totally subordinated to the male role and, therefore, as a way of perpetuating gender inequalities. On the other hand, following the mythical pattern and expectations, David fails the hero's quest, he returns without having changed, and totally aware of the choice he has made. What is

surprising is that he does make a choice, even though what he opts for is the wrong path in existential terms, whereas Diana and Anne remain passive, dependent and incapable of making any progress. From a feminist perspective it seems, in my opinion, very difficult to reconcile their attitudes with any message empowering women. From an existentialist perspective all of them fail, except Henry, who is the only one who remains faithful to his art and philosophy of life. It is a realistic but not a happy ending, perhaps because, as Fowles thought "life is hell, it is absurd, it is tragic, there are no happy endings" (Onega, 1988:64). This is why, in the end of the novella, the consolatory completion of medieval myth disappears in order to give way to real life of our angst-ridden age.

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Barth, J. *Friday Book: Essays and Other Non-Fiction*. London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1984.

Bradley, L. "Elizabeth Siddal: Drawn into the Pre-Raphaelite Circle*". Art Institute of Chicago Museum Studies.* 1992, Vol., 18, Num. 2, 137-187.

Campbell, J. *The Hero with a Thousand Faces*. London: Fontana Press, 1993.

Coupe, L. *Myth the New Critical Idiom*. London and New York: Routledge, 1997.

Doherty, L.E*. Gender and the Interpretation of Classical Myth*. London: Bloomsbury, 2003.

Fowles, J. *The Collector*. New York: Dell Books, 1963.

_. *The Magus*. New York: Dell Books, 1966.

_. *The French Lieutenant's Woman*. London: Random House, 1969.

_. *The Ebony Tower*. London and New York: Signet, 1975.

Frazer, Sir J. G. *The Golden Bough. A Study in Magic and Religion. Great Books Online*. http://www.bartleby.com/196/.

Freud, S. *Beyond the Pleasure Principle*. 1920. Ed. James Strachey. London and New York: Norton, 1961.

Giezen, T. "Gender, Myth, and Mythmaking". *The Newsletter* 2005, Vol., 37, 22-23.

Gilbert, S. M and S. **Gubar**. *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Imagination*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1984.

González-Gati, M. M. *Feminism in John Fowles's The Collector and a Maggot*. Texas: Texas Tech University, 1993.

Holmes, F. M. "Fictional Self-Conciousness in John Fowles's '*The Ebony Tower*'". *ARIEL*: *A Review of International English Literature* 1985, Vol., 16, Num., 3*,* 21-38.

Hyving, C. "John Fowles's Theory of The Garden of Eden Master Thesis". *AllDocs*. Luleå: Luleå University of Technology, 2007.

Jabbar, W.K.A. "A Freudian Reading of John Fowles's *The Ebony Tower*. *Psy-Art* January 17,2014.
http://psyartjournal.com/article/show/abdul_jabbara_freudian_reading_of_john_fowles_the_eb.

Jung, C.G. "A Psychological Approach to the Dogma of the Trinity". 1948. *Psychology and Religion: East and West. The Collection Works* XI. Trans. R.F.C. Hull. Sir Herbert Read *et al.*,(eds.). London and Henley: Routledge and Kegan Paul,1981, 107-200.

Lenz, B. *John Fowles Visionary and Voyeur*. New York and Amsterdam: Rodopy, 2008.

Neary, J. *Something and Nothingness. The Fiction of John Updike & John Fowles*. Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1992.

Onega, S. "Fowles on Fowles". Susana Onega (coor.), *Actas del X Congreso Nacional de AEDEAN*. (Zaragoza 1986). Zaragoza: Librería General, 1988, 57-76.

Onega, S. "Art, Nature and Whole Sight in John Fowles' *The Collector* and *The Ebony Tower*". *Literature and the Visual Arts*. Daniela Carpi, (ed.), Bologna: Re Enzo Editrice, 2001, 161-81.

Onega, S. "John Fowles". *Postmodernism: The Key Figures*. Hans Bertens and Joseph Natoli. Malden (eds.), Mass. and Oxford: Blackwell, 2002, 141-48.

Phillips, Michelle. *Metafiction, Historiography, and Mythopoeia in the Novels of John Fowles*. Brunei: Brunel University School of Arts PhD Theses, 2009. http://bura.brunel.ac.uk/bitstream/2438/6558/1/FullTextThesis.pdf.

Powel, R. *The Most Holy Trinosophia and the New Revelation of the Divine Feminine*. Great Barrington, Massachusetts: SteinerBooks, 2000.

Wilson, T. *The Recurrent Green Universe of John Fowles*. Amsterdam and New York: Rodopy, 2006

Wittig, M. "One Is Not Born a Woman". *The Lesbian and Gay Studies Reader*. Henry Abelove, Michele Aina Barale and David M. Halperin (eds.), London and New York: Routledge, 1993, 103-109.

Trashing the Myth of the "Old South": White Trash Identity-Seeking in Dorothy Allison's *A Bastard Out of Carolina*

Desechando el mito del "viejo sur": la basura blanca y la búsqueda de identidad en la novela de Dorothy Allison, *A Bastard Out of Carolina*

Concepción Parrondo Carretero
Universidad de Málaga
conchipc@uma.es

Resumen

La realidad de los blancos pobres del sur de los Estados Unidos no ha sido reflejada con justicia en la tradición literaria americana del sur hasta hace algunas décadas, cuando autores como Dorothy Allison, nacidos en el seno de la pobreza, han comenzado a hablar con claridad en nombre de los suyos. Al derribar el mito literario del "viejo sur", Allison deja al descubierto la situación social de los blancos pobres o basura blanca a la vez que propone una alternativa al estigma, consiguiendo que sus personajes busquen una identidad en la cual dicha etiqueta social deja de ser insultante o despectiva. Este artículo analiza los mecanismos por los cuales Dorothy Allison derriba representaciones literarias del "viejo sur" así como su enfoque de "la búsqueda de la identidad de la basura blanca" en su novela *A Bastard Out of Carolina*. Para ello, se ofrece una introducción a la literatura de la clase trabajadora, a la que Allison se encuentra vinculada, seguida de un análisis de los recursos literarios de Dorothy Allison en la desmitificación de la noción del "viejo sur" de camino hacia la construcción de la identidad. Una breve reflexión sobre la importancia del trabajo de Dorothy Allison para que otros autores de literatura "basura blanca" sigan sus pasos concluye este artículo.

Palabras clave: basura blanca, búsqueda de la identidad, estigma, el "viejo sur".

Abstract

The reality of the poor whites in the South of the United States had not been properly represented within American southern literary tradition until a few decades ago, when authors born in poverty, like Dorothy Allison, started to speak out on behalf of their class. Upon taking down the literary myth of the "Old South," Allison exposes the social situation of the poor whites/white trash while proposing an alternative to society's stigmatizing, upon having her characters seek an identity in which the social label is no longer insulting or derogatory. This article aims to analyze Dorothy Allison's mechanisms to dismantle the literary representations of the "Old South," as well as her approach to "white trash identity-seeking" in her novel, *A Bastard Out of Carolina.* In so doing, an introduction to the working-class literature, with which Allison has been identified, is being offered, followed by an analysis of Allison's own literary devices to demystify the notion of the "Old South" on the road to identity building. A brief reflection upon the significance of Allison's work for other contemporary "white trash" literature authors to follow suit concludes this article.

Keywords white trash, identity-seeking, stigmatizing, the "Old South."

1. A BRIEF HISTORY OF LITERARY REPRESENTATIONS OF POOR WHITES IN THE SOUTH

Since the colonial period, poverty has been a concern for many sectors of society as revealed by the testimony of travel accounts, land surveys, essays, studies and research of the time period. Gradually, the representation of poor whites in American written fiction left an imprint in magazines and journals whose short stories and comic strips depicted poor white characters either as laughable subjects, capable of outsmarting the superior whites, or as repositories of social degeneracy.[1] At the turn of the nineteenth century, authors such as William Dean Howell (1837-1920), Henry James (1843-1916) and Mark Twain (1835-1910) started to point out the unpreparedness of rural folks in a new society where business and industrialization began to flourish. The realists related their concerns about the social issues of the time: the effects of the new business economy on individual lives and the identification of white supremacy after the Civil War started to become recurrent themes in their writing (Lauter, 2006: 9-10).

---

[1] Such are the examples of Yellow-legs in J.J. Hooper's *Some Adventures of Captain Simon Suggs(*1845), or Sut Lovingood, created by George Washington Harris in *Sut Lovingood:Yarns Spun by a "Natural Born Durn'd Fool* (1866), among others.

The first half of the twentieth century gave birth to authors such as Erskine Caldwell (1903-1987) and William Faulkner (1897-1962) with unique approaches on the South; the former embraced the older stereotypes, resulting in portraying the poor as shiftless, dull-witted degenerates[2] while the latter drew characters beyond the poor white stereotype of "something more than a primitive" to transform them into people whose individual consciousness needed to be examined (Flynt, 2004: 77). Meanwhile, other writers, such as Margaret Mitchell (1900-1949) in *Gone with the Wind* (1936), displayed nostalgia for the "Old South." Mitchell's depiction of the "Old South" would be, in this day and age, very difficult to fathom. Moreover, the old slave-based plantation economy, in which masters and mistresses displayed paternalistic and patronizing attitudes towards domestic servitude and plantation slaves, might feel fallacious to the contemporary reader. Similarly, the slaves' loyalty towards their masters in *Gone with the Wind* seems to belong in a fairytale rather than in a not-so-distant past. As for white poverty, the novel did not contribute to expose the reality of poor whites, but rather it showed their contemptible side through characters such as Emma Slattery, a white trash young woman living in the swamps nearby Tara, looked down upon by the richer neighbors.

The first half of the twentieth century also became witness to the emergence of a framework of a specifically "southern" literary consciousness, as writers reached into their past for material (Guinn, 2000: xvii). Southern modernists wrote about the Civil War and the Agrarian tradition as part of their inherited past. In so doing, these authors left the traditional literary myth of the "Old South" in favor of a mythology built by their own style, mixed in with colorful elements intrinsically southern.[3] Matthew Guinn states that scholars such as Bethany Johnson and Simpson Lewis have identified the Southern Agrarians as a group of writers who believed in returning to a "simpler life" represented by the past rural culture of the South, but who also ignored slavery and denounced progress, moved by a nostalgic feeling for the past (2). The Agrarian Pastoral became one of the defining characteristics of southern modernism, as many southern writers adopted its creed to oppose the impingement of modernity. If Faulkner had his doubts about the grandiosity and supremacy of rural culture, "the Agrarians did not; they perceived the southern farm as an oasis of order and stability in an otherwise decadent culture" (Ibid). They also envisioned a "conception of rural or semi-rural life enriched by tradition,

---

[2] According to Wayne Flynt (2004: 75), Caldwell's poor in *Tobacco Road* (1932), *God's Little Acre* (1933) and *Trouble in July* (1940) came across as a comic, contemptible sub-specie of the tenant farmer.

[3] Such writers also searched for themes attaining the universal, concentrating on dialect and local customs.

religion, stable and predictable social behavior, and feelings of individual worth" (Lawson, 1984:12), for they viewed life in the urban areas as disordered and chaotic. The Agrarian literary framework has remained in the minds of many southern writers long after its collection of essays *I'll Take My Stand: The South and the Agrarian Tradition* (1930) was published.[4]

Despite their creed, however, skepticism about the Agrarians' reconstructed myth of the "Old South" grew larger in the decades following the nineteen sixties, challenging the very essence of the elements of their modernist theoretical construct. Writers started to question the prevailing assumptions of the South's bourgeoisie and upper class. In the nineteen eighties, a new generation of white writers —born in poverty— began to speak out about the reality of the South, each from a unique perspective. Though not considered a large enough group to constitute a literary movement, contemporary southern poor white writers, such as Harry Crews, Dorothy Allison, Dennis Covington, Tim McLaurin, Chris Offut, Pat Conroy, Rick Bragg, Larry Brown and Amy Greene, to name a few, seem to have attracted the attention of a broad readership. Educated, yet raised in poor white families, these authors rely not only on fiction, but also on biographies, essays, conferences and personal interviews to uncover a reality of the cultural myth of the South never been told before.

In this regard, Dorothy Allison has been placed among the first to unveil the issue of class in southern literature.[5] One cannot deny that Allison's South has nothing to do with that of previous writers. In the words of Matthew Guinn, Allison's South:

> …is impoverished, benighted and repressive—a sort of Third World antithesis to the pastoral plenty of Agrarian conceptions. In venturing to tell her own stories unflinchingly … Allison has … made room in southern literature for other stories, other perspectives, in a literature that had previously taken no notice of them. (2000: 6)

Allison grew up within a southern, dirt-poor family whose members would do anything and everything to live off the system. The men in such family would pass the time drinking, gambling, or collecting welfare checks; the women were not any different, as they would marry young and get pregnant immediately to qualify for a somewhat steady income to live on. A very grim picture of what an "American" family is thought to be like. In her collections of essays*, Skin: Talking about Sex, Class and Literature* (1994), Allison

---

[4] The Agrarian ideology still persists in today's American society. See http://southernagrarian.org/, or http://www.southernagrarian.com/, for example.
[5] See Nancy Isenberg (2016: 295).

draws an accurate image of her people and herself: she is her mama's daughter, brought up with a feeling of unity and loyalty to her "tribe," but with a sense of low self-esteem, ready to take in the damage caused by society's labeling them as poor white trash, a social category[6] that one could either ignore or be proud of. Acknowledging the damage that America's white society has done to its own kind is an act of exposing and denouncing the invisibility of inferior classes —such as poor whites/white trash— so as to commence a process of subjectivity formation. Her first novel, *A Bastard Out of Carolina*, disparages the traditionally constructed literary myths of the "Old South" in an effort to draw the reader closer to the social juncture of white trash, while pointing to identity-seeking.

2. TRASHING THE MYTH OF THE "OLD SOUTH": A BASTARD OUT OF CAROLINA

In her writing, Allison makes an honest attempt to "humanize" the notion of white trash identity. Danielle Docka states that "Allison hopes that her fiction will force her audience to replace prevailing stereotypical and distorted images of 'white trash' with sincere identities that speak the harsh truth about economic inequality" (2002). With this goal in mind, Allison takes down the lyricism built around a "reconstructed mythical South" by presenting the reader, instead, with the reality of southern white poverty. The following excerpt of *A Bastard Out of Carolina*, henceforth *Bastard*, goes against the Agrarian's creed that a southern rural life is better, simpler and, above all, enriched by feelings of self-worth:

> Greenville, South Carolina, in 1955, was the most beautiful place in the world. Black walnut trees dropped their green-black fuzzy bulbs on Aunt Ruth's matted lawn, past where their knotty roots rose up out of the ground like the elbows and knees of dirty children suntanned dark and covered with scars. Weeping willows marched across the yard, following every wandering stream and ditch. Their long whiplike fronds making tents that sheltered sweet-smelling beds of clover … But at Aunt Alma's, over near the Eutis Highway, the landlord had locked down the spigots so that the kids wouldn't cost him a fortune in water bills. Without the relief of a sprinkler or a hose the heat had burned up the grass, and the combined efforts of dogs and boys had reduced the narrow yard to a smoldering expanse of baked dirt and scattered rocks. (Bastard 17-18)

The highly lyrical tone of this passage quickly fades at the crude existence of those of low economic means. A run-down fenced yard, barren and dirt-like, does not hint at feelings of

---

[6] According to Matt Wray and Annalee Newitz (1997), the term "white trash" defines itself as a social category, which both connects and separates race and social class.

self-worth, but rather signals the abandonment of poor southern rural folks. Furthermore, juxtaposing evocative, traditionally-conceived, southern scenes with less-than-desirable living conditions serves the purpose to set the stage on which to bring up class conflict. Despite such a realistic description of her South, nonetheless, Bone, the child-protagonist narrator of the story, considers this rural land hers, as she feels she belongs in it. The sense of belonging, so deeply ingrained in the protagonist's mind, especially in her childhood years, alters the southern literary perspective on the rural landscape, viewed upon as a land to be enjoyed by an allegedly superior type of whites; a land in which white trash have no place. The following paragraph relates the protagonist's reminiscing —in a quasi-bucolic style— the summer days back at home when she felt safe:

> When I think of that summer—sleeping over at my aunts' houses as easily as at home, the smell of Mama's neck as she bent over to hug us in the dark, the sound of Little Earle's giggle or Granny's spit thudding onto the dry ground, and that country music playing low everywhere, as much a part of the evening as crickets and moonlight—I always feel safe again. No place has ever seemed so sweet and quiet, no place so much like home. (22)

Appropriating the quietness and sweetness of southern rural living strips the traditional "Old South" of its elitist entitlement, thus granting visibility to the rural low class. Moreover, that an uneducated, poor white girl might evoke her happy childhood memories in such a lyrical tone dismantles the Agrarian belief that "education of the university sort, not professional or technical, is suited to a small number only."[7] In such a manner, "the simpler life of the Agrarian South has turned 'complicated' upon the narrative introducing the presence of an economically inferior, landless class" (Guinn, 2000: 26).

Alongside delegitimizing the Agrarian notion of the "Old South," the narrative ventures out into uncharted territory, as far as poor whites' literary representations are concerned. Through the eyes of Bone Boatwright, *Bastard* scratches beneath the surface of a mythical South to bring to the table social stereotyping and stigmatizing of white poverty, never approached from within in literary tradition. The deconstruction of the traditional South, combined with the exposure of poor white/white trash's social ostracism, is Allison's device to initiate Bone into a process of subjectivity formation by which the protagonist may ultimately feel at ease. Bone, however is still far from the final stages of identity-seeking. One evening, perusing through the pages of a copy of *Gone with the Wind*, illustrated with the pictures of the film, Bone comes to the realization that her "type" would never be the "heroine type" depicted in written fiction:

---

[7] See essay by Stark Young in I'll *Take My Stand: The South and The Agrarian Tradition* (2006).

> … I looked up from Vivien Leigh's pink cheeks to see Mama coming in from work with her hair darkened from sweat and her uniform stained. A sharp flash went through me. Emma Slattery, I thought. That's who I'd be, that's who we were. Not Scarlett, with her baking-powder cheeks. I was part of the trash down in the mud-stained cabins, fighting with the darkies and stealing ungratefully from our betters, stupid, coarse, born to shame and death. I shook with fear and indignation. (206)

The lines quoted above are not directed to the Agrarian concept of elitist southern rural life, but rather they refer to the notion of a genteel, slave-owning South. Juxtaposing the construct of a mythical South —portrayed in the Plantation Novel genre, for instance— with the reality of the poor whites allows Allison to make an indelible impression on Bone, as she finally comprehends with stupor to which of the two classes she and her family must belong. Becoming cognizant of one's position of inferiority towards others signals the beginning of a growing-up process in which the feelings of rage and hatred will play a decisive role. In a later passage, the concepts of beauty and ugliness resurfaced, once again juxtaposed, this time in the perception that Bone has got of her herself:

> My chin was pink and dimpled, my neck pale underneath, so that I could see the blue lines of my veins threading up to my ears. I put my palms flat on my cheeks, pushed back and slanted my eyes. My face remained unreadable, my eyes blank and silvery. My face told nothing. It was scary, stern and empty … All of me was ugly, pasty and numb—nothing like Uncle James's girls in their white nylon crinolines and blue satin ribbons. They were the kind of little girls. No part of me was that worshipful, dreamy-eyed story book girlchild, no part of me was beautiful. (208)

The idea of beauty, embodied in Bone's cousins' physical appearance, is sharply contrasted against Bone's own looks. Examining her face in the mirror, Bone is now certain she belongs to the inferior whites for, in her mind, her ugliness, pastiness and numbness leave no room for error. In this regard, Nancy Isenberg points out that in the nineteenth century "observers looked beyond dirty faces and feet and highlighted the ghostly, yellowish white tinge to the poor white's skin —a color they called 'tallow'" (2016: 136). In addition, strips and vignettes, published in installments in comic magazines of the time period, highlighted physical and mental "inherited traits," such as inbreeding, clay-eating, physical deformity and low intelligence, as intrinsic to poor white trash (Wray, 2006: 40).[8]

---

[8] Illustrative of this is the character created by August Baldwin Longstreet (1790-1870), Ransy Sniffle, who made his first appearance in his collection of stories, *Georgia Scenes*, published in 1835.

The low-life condition "assigned" to the protagonist and her family had already been suggested in the first pages of the novel, though. A single mother, Anney Boatwright delivers Bone at the hospital in a state of semi-consciousness. Of unknown father and absent mother, Bone would be "certified a bastard by the state of Carolina" (*Bastard* 3). Bone's illegitimate status serves to reaffirm her position as white trash. As Vivyan Adair states: "the poor are imagined—and then as result punished and disciplined—as single mothers, who are marked by race, lack of male authority and values, make poor choices, and are a threat to our nation and indeed our children (2008: 591). Bone is a member of the social class that is illegitimate in the eyes of those who would perpetuate the aristocratic and Arcadian myth of the South (Guinn, 2000: 28).

Coupled with the realization of her undignified social condition, Bone feels in the need to connect with an "honorable" past. What lie beneath are Allison's intentions to challenge the aristocratic belief that the "whites" living in the South must be repositories of untainted, pure white blood lineage. The idea of Anglo-Saxon blood purity first surfaced in the antebellum period when intellectual currents in the nation started to develop an ideological framework preaching the future greatness of America: "those of 'Anglo-Saxon descent, impregnated with its sturdy qualities of heart and brain,' would put Great Britain and the United States on a course of global dominance, 'as representatives of this advancing stock'" (Isenberg, 2016: 138). The obsession over an-all-pure Anglo-Saxon blood lineage has since dominated, with different degrees of intensity, the many spheres of American society, resulting in labeling the poor with inherited "bad blood" traits such as laziness, mental insanity and moral degeneracy.[9]

Bone manages to find her blood lineage within the purest of all: the blood of Native Americans:

> Every third family in Greenville might have little Cherokee, but I had been born with a full head of black hair. I've got my great-granddaddy's blood in me, I told myself. I am night's own daughter, my great-grandfather's warrior child. I pushed my hair up high on my head and searched my pupils for the red highlights that sparked in the depths, dark shiny red like rubies or fresh bright blood. Dangerous, I told myself. I could be dangerous, oh yes, I could be dangerous. (207-208)

---

[9] Barely hundred years ago (1914), white social degeneracy became subject of heated debates between the medical doctors of the Rockefeller Sanitary Commission and eugenicists, on the account of the hookworm epidemic. While the former believed that poverty was the result of dire living conditions, the latter insisted that it was their inherited tainted blood what kept them poor. See Matthew Wray (2006: 97-132).

Having found her "dignified" blood lineage entitles Bone to erase the boundaries existing between her and those who hold her down, the whites of pure Anglo-Saxon descent. Furthermore, being hers a blood lineage of Cherokee origins vindicates her social position as well as that of other minority groups, such as American Indians. In addition, the anger and bravery of her Indian blood enables the protagonist to act upon her condition of white trash. Thinking herself "dangerous," Bone is well aware of the fact that she might be of equal or higher status than her white counterparts of pure Anglo-Saxon descent and can, therefore, attain subjectivity within her own class status.

As the narrative disassociates Bone from her socially stigmatized condition, the "Old South's" prejudice against her kind would also be torn down upon the deconstruction of the label "white trash" twofold: firstly, white trash is made to appear as subversive against the establishment. In this manner, "trash" does not equate poor white people, disease-ridden and contemptible, but rather it contains, if left alone, the potential to grow and develop:

> "Trash rises," Aunt Raylene joked the first afternoon I spent with her. "Out there where no one can mess with it, trash rises all the time." … "I like to watch things pass," she told me in her lazy whiskery drawl. "Time and men and trash out on the river. I just like to watch it all go around the bend." (180)

Aunt Raylene, Bone's mentor, deemed contemptible by others, lives isolated from society by choice: her outlook on life differs much from that of the common townsfolk. She is a mysterious white trash lesbian whose life choices led her to leave town, but who came back determined to live life in her own terms. Allison assigns this character the role to "normalize" the term white trash, upon Raylene's considering it as another fact of life. White trash transpires in this text simply as an economic condition one may be able to overcome and not as a social location from which it is impossible to escape.

Secondly, white trash unfolds as a stigma dependent upon the notion of the "other." Having come to the realization her type does not belong among the beautiful and socially accepted, Bone becomes acutely receptive of how "others" perceive her. On an early morning at Aunt Raylene's, while watching the cars pass by, the young protagonist feels the sharp stubbing of hateful looks from children on a school bus. Her thoughts are of anger and indignation, "They piss honey?" she declares; "shit morning glory?" she further thinks to herself (262). Bone's hatred towards those watching her will immediately be challenged by Aunt Raylene's response:

> "They look at you the way you look at them," she [Aunt Raylene] told me bluntly "You don't know who those children are. Maybe they're nasty and silly and hateful. Maybe not. You don't know what happens to them when they go home … You think because they wear different clothes than you and go by so fast, they're rich and cruel and thinking terrible things about you. Could be they're looking at you sitting up here eating blackberries and looking at them like they're spit on a stove—could be they they're jealous of you, hungry for what you got, afraid of what you would do if they ever stepped in the yard." … "Look at it from the other side for a while." (Bastard 262)

Being watched by the children on the bus deeply hurts Bone, as she feels like "the thing observed," the "other" who is not; a rare species to look at. As Matt Wray explains:

> …white trash exhibits the general features shared by symbolic markers of stigma and dishonor. Primary among these features are effects of symbolic distancing and social exclusion through moral disapproval, resulting in 'us/them' dichotomies that both enable and enact different forms of inequality, prejudice and discrimination. (2006: 134)

In the fictional reality of the novel, such "us/them" dichotomy becomes blurred as Aunt Raylene's response to Bone's anger leaves the door open for understanding: realizing that perceptions may be deceiving and, as such, must be reconfigured within a bidirectional approach. The image of the bus seems to suggest that social positions may not be interpreted as fixed, "shiftless," or unchangeable. Under this light, one's perception of others' reality becomes fluid, to be considered as subjective within a broader look on life. In the two quotes above-analyzed, Allison vindicates the notion of white trash through Aunt Raylene's words who, despite her white trash condition, unfolds before the reader as wise and open-minded; a non-sequitur, indeed, of the previous popular and literary representations of white trash. Her words are spoken by a person who, according to the stereotype, should have been deemed ignorant, lazy, dirty, social degenerate, poor and contemptible.

Aunt Raylene, though, serves a higher purpose in the novel: along with her condition of white trash, like Bone's, Raylene also represents a social threat to the white American patriarchal community. As the course of the events evolves, the reader positively knows that, in the end, Aunt Raylene, the poor white lesbian admired by her family and despised by the community, will guide Bone on her quest to self-identification. Such an act shakes the very foundation on which the concept of American family rests, while "trashing," once again, "true white American values." As Bone struggles to come to terms with the preconceived ideas imposed upon her and her people through lived personal

experiences,[10] she is offered an out-of-the-norm role model to follow. In this regard, Katrina Irving's theoretical constructs prove insightful: "since 'the lesbian' is only one of the negative positions created by the institutions of patriarchy, embracing that position is the precursor toward recognizing one's kinship with a whole series of other marginalized groups" (Irving, 1998:97-98). As seen earlier,[11] Allison's scope of exposure of the "marginalized" is not limited to the social category of white trash; but, on the contrary, it extends, once more, to reach other ostracized minorities, this time those of "deviated" sexual orientation.

In time, Bone's anger is redirected against her mother Anney, a poor white woman incapable of stopping her husband from physically and sexually abusing her daughter. Anney's helplessness translates into defenselessness, as she would rather abandon her daughter than leave her abusive husband. The last beating Bone got from her stepfather reflects Bone's anger at her mother:

> I could see her fingers on Glen's shoulder, see the white knuckles holding him tight. My mouth closed over the shout I would not let go. Rage burned in my belly and came up my throat. I'd said I could never hate her, but I hated her now for the way she held him, the way she stood there crying over him. Could she love me and still hold him like that? I let my head fall back. I did not want to see this … I want everything to stop, the world to end, anything, but not to lie bleeding while she held him and cried. (291)

Anger is also the thrust needed for Bone to escape her stepfather's physical and sexual abuse. In so doing, Bone is putting a stop to her white trash stigma which, at this point in the narrative, begins to bear close resemblance to Allison's own stigma. Considered as semi-autobiographical, *Bastard*'s story could also be looked upon, in part, as Allison's story. Anney, Bone's mother, shares many similarities with Allison's own mother: both worked long hours and were physically and emotionally abused by their husbands. Allison, like Bone in the novel, was many times physically and sexually abused by her stepfather who was always unemployed, living on welfare and wanted by the law. Such behavior was very common in working-class and poor families under constant financial stress (Tokarczyk, 2008: 150).

Retaking the interpretation of the above-quoted lines, Bone's mother opts for "loving" her husband more than her daughter and decides to go away with him. This act is the only recourse for her survival, however, as poor white women do not have the choice to get out

---

[10] Her position of bastard, her disillusionment with romantic notions of the "Old South" and her refusal to be considered inferior, different and "other," to name some.
[11] Bone finds her "dignified blood" within her own Cherokee lineage.

of a toxic relationship; on the contrary, their precarious economic situation tethers them to abuse, yet a better alternative to starvation. In the end, lacking the economic means to support her children and herself, Anney leaves town with her husband while delegating on Aunt Raylene the task of raising Bone. In running away, Allison's mother repeats the strategy of crackers[12] a century earlier: to flee and start over somewhere else, thus perpetuating traditionally misconstrued notions of white trash (Isenberg, 2016: 295). Yet, Anney's abandonment directed at Bone turns the narrative in an act of feminist vindication as well. In Vincent King's words: "*Bastard* may be described as feminist because it exposes and seeks to counter the physical, emotional, and economic domination that women suffer within a patriarchal system" (King, 2000: 124). The inevitability for a woman to be deemed inferior in a patriarchal system, regardless of class, is conveyed in the narrative through Anney's only choice to survive.

On her process to identity building, the feelings of hatred and anger that Bone experiences will help her reach acceptance of her mother's actions, of her social position and of herself, just as Aunt Raylene's advice, pages earlier, made her come to an understanding of the subjective nature of the "other." For we cannot begin to accept our own perception of reality unless we admit the existence of the reality of others. As Vincent King states: "Bone cannot rid herself of the hatred that threatens to consume her at the end of the novel until she learns that we are also shaped by who we pretend *others* to be" (King, 2000: 125). Resigned to the idea that her mother will never be what she dreamed her to be, Bone's anger will gradually fade away letting acceptance take its place:

> When Raylene came to me, I let her touch my shoulder, let my head tilt to lean against her, trusting her arm and her love. I was who I was going to be, someone like her, like Mama, a Boatwright woman. I wrapped my fingers in Raylene's and watched the night close in around us. (Bastard 309)

The lines quoted above indicate Bone's final understanding that she belongs to a family marked by social labeling, yet they also point to an absence of hatred towards such a fact. Bone accepts her family lineage as part of her own identity upon depositing all her trust in Aunt Raylene, her kin. Lastly, the fact that Anney, after repeated visits to the courthouse, manages to get Bone's birth certificate corrected provides Bone's identity building with a fresh start. The text reads: "folded into thirds was a certificate. RUTH ANNE BOAT WRIGHT. Mother: ANNEY BOATWRIGHT. Father: UNKNOWN … I had never seen it before,

---

[12] In the nineteenth century, crackers were defined as those wandering poor whites, living on the fringes of the law, incapable of leading a stable life. See Jim Goad in *The Red Manifesto* (1997: 74-101).

but had heard all about it. I unfolded the bottom third. It was blank, unmarked, unstamped" (309). Having the word "Bastard" erased from Bone's certificate and leaving a blank in its place instead, indicates that it will be up to Bone to fill in the empty spaces of her identity.

In summary, *A Bastard Out of Carolina*, offers manifold approaches on the deconstruction and demystification of the myth of the "Old South." Its highly lyrical passages of an idyllic South serve, in several instances, as the backdrop against the crude reality of poor whites. Elitist and aristocratic conceptions of the rural South such as self-worthiness, beauty, gentility, and purity in blood lineage, to name a few, are contrasted with the helplessness, ugliness, genetically inferiority and "tainted" blood of white trash. In addition, the novel intelligently and eloquently voices the concern of poor whites, drawing on Allison's childhood experiences (Guinn, 30). The novel also posits the growing-up process of a poor white thirteen-year-old girl who becomes aware of the world around her, while gradually acquiring a better understanding of her condition of class. In such fashion, Bone awakens to the outside world in a state of rage and anger, which allow her to "rebel" against her imposed-upon social status. In the last lines of the text, Bone learns to accept others' realities, an opportunity to start reconstructing her own subjectivity.

In telling Bone's story, Allison manages to draw the reader closer to the juncture of the poor whites —and that of other minority groups— by showing their humanness, thus equating them to society in general. To get this accomplished, Allison takes down, honestly and straightforwardly, the misrepresentations of the poor in American southern literature, as in the case of Emma Slattery, the "white other" in *Gone with the Wind* living "dangerously close" to her richer neighbors. For Allison's goal is "to write about the notion of white trash as real people and not caricatures" (Dietzel, 2012: 44). In so doing, the poor white characters depicted in the novel appear as sensible and human, with virtues and flaws and not at all ugly, or dumb-witted, as the stereotype would have called for. Lastly, by debasing the literary myth of the "Old South" and everything it represents, Allison has also pointed the way towards poor white identity building. Though the protagonist will have to learn from future experiences, the realization of her situation —triggering, first, anger and rage while, later, acceptance of others' realities— signals the initial stages for self-definition and identification.

3. A FINAL WORD

Allison's first novel, *A Bastard Out of Carolina,* showcases her ability to instill empathy and relatedness in readers while pointing to the multiple aspects behind her characters' social

junctures. Aspects such as knowing oneself inferior, or being considered the "other" in society, to name a few, signal the white trash conflict in need of resolution. This may be the reason why Allison is so adamant on "trashing" the myth of the "Old South" of southern literary tradition. Furthermore, Allison debunks, demystifies and calls into question mainstream whites' constructions of white poverty by having her characters feel rage and indignation; feelings that, in the end, will set them free within their own class condition. As in any growing-up process, gradual understanding and acceptance of one's own situation in society will provide the basis on which to start anew on the process of subjectivity formation.

Dorothy Allison's writing for and about poor whites/white trash has been considered by scholars as pioneering in providing a different reading to the representations of white poverty in American southern literary tradition. In spite of the efforts of some authors, such as Mark Twain and William Faulkner, to shed light onto southern white poverty, none had managed to draw before a picture of southern poor whites as Allison has. She writes from within the stigma, knowing what being born white and poor means. Her questioning the region's precarious class ideology and defiance towards literary notions of the "Old South" have laid the groundwork for subsequent literary engagements within the region's social structure (Guinn, 2000: 34), as many other poor white writers have started to write about class stratification within whites in the South.

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Adair, V. "Class Absences*: Cutting Class in Feminism" Feminist Studies.* Fall 2005, Vol. 31, no.3, 575-603.

Allison, D. *A Bastard Out of Carolina*. New York: Penguin Books, 1993.

__. *Skin: Talking about Sex, Class & Literature* Ithaca: Firebrand Books, 1994.

Caldwell, Er. *Tobacco Road*. Athens : University of Georgia Press, 1995.

__. *Trouble in July*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1940.

__. *God's Little Acre*. Mark Bryant (ed.). London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1998.

Dietzel, S. "An Interview with Dorothy Allison." Mae Miller Claxton, ed., *Conversations with Dorothy Allison*. Jackson: UP Mississippi, 2012, 40-52.

Docka, D. "The Cultural Mythology of 'White Trash.'"

http://departments.knox.edu/catch/2002sp/docka.htm

Flynt, J. W. *Dixie's Forgotten People*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004.

Goad, J. *The Redneck Manifesto*. New York: Simon & Schuster Paperbacks, 1997.

Guinn, M. *After Southern Modernism. Fiction of the Contemporary* South. Jackson: UP of Mississippi, 2000.

Harris, G Washington. *Sut Lovingood. Yarn Spun by a Nat'ral Born Durn'd Fool*. New York: Dick & Fitzgerald Publishers, 1867.

Hooper, J J. *Adventures of Captain Simon Suggs.* Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1993.

Irving, K. "'Writing it down so That It Would Be Real': Narrative Strategies in Dorothy Allison's 'Bastard Out of Carolina'." *College Literature.* 1998, Vol.25, no. 2, 94-107. JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/25112380 [accessed 20 March, 2018].

Isenberg, N. *White Trash: The 400-Year Untold History of Class in America.* London: Atlantic Books, 2016.

King, V. "Hopeful Grief: The Prospect of a Postmodernist feminism in Allison's *Bastard Out of Carolina.*" *The Southern Literary Journal.* 2000, Vol. 33, no.1, 122-140.

Lauter, P. "Late Nineteenth Century," *Heath Anthology of American Literature*, Vol. C. Suzanne Phelps Weir, ed. Boston: Houghton Miffling Company, 2006, 09-14.

Lawson, L A. *Another Generation: Southern Fiction since World War II. Jackson*: UP of Mississippi, 1984.

Longstreet, A B. *Georgia Scenes: Characters and Incidents in the First Half of the Republic.* New York: Harper & Brothers Publishers, 1870.

Rubin, L A. *I'll Take My Stand: the South and the Agrarian Literary Tradition*. (75th Anniversary Edition) Baton Rouge: LSU Press, 2006.

Southern Agrarian Society. http://southernagrarian.org/ &
http://www.southernagrarian.com/

Tokarczyk, M, ed. *Class Definitions*. *On the Lives and writings of Maxime Hong Kingston, Sandra Cisneros, and Dorothy Allison.* Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2008.

Wray, M and Annalee Newitz, eds. *White Trash*. *Race and Class in America*. New York: Routledge, 1997.

__.*Not Quite White. White Trash and the Boundaries of Whiteness.* Durham: Duke University Press: 2006.

Young, S. *I'll Take My Stand: the South and the Agrarian Literary Tradition*, Baton Rouge: LSU Press, 2006.

Recodificación del género a través de la heroína distópica: Análisis de *Divergente* (2014)

A Recodification of Gender through the Figure of the Dystopian Heroine: Analysis of *Divergent* (2014)

Rocío Riestra-Camacho
Universidad de Oviedo
rocioriestra23@gmail.com

Resumen

El objetivo de este artículo es el de analizar, siguiendo una teorización poststructuralista, en qué medida la película *Divergente* (2014) deconstruye binarismos de género a través de la representación agentiva de su protagonista, Beatrice Prior. Este análisis deconstructivo propone que es necesario diferenciar entre un análisis de género a nivel espacial, orientado a identificar elementos estereotipados de género en las denominadas 'facciones', de un análisis de género a nivel identitario. Se investiga el filme de acuerdo a técnicas analíticas cinematográficas y de hermenéutica textual. Así, a nivel identitario, las conductas y rasgos de la heroína de *Divergente* pueden ser entendidas como características *humanas*, rompiendo la caracterización dialéctica de rasgos masculinos / femeninos. La agentividad que se desprende de tal entendimiento contribuye a una identificación del público con la protagonista como heroína, si bien esto no se traduce en una lectura feminista.

Palabras clave: *Divergente*, distopía, género, corporeidad, agencia.

Abstract

The aim of this article is to analyze through poststructuralism to what extent the film *Divergent* (2014) deconstructs gender binarisms through the agentic representation of its heroine, Beatrice Prior. This analysis contends that it is necessary to distinguish between two levels of gender analysis. On the one hand, conducting a spatial analysis of the so-called 'Factions' in the film can lead to an over simplistic identification of gender stereotypes in them. A gender analysis conducted on an identitarian basis, on the other,

helps to complexify such panorama. At this level of analysis, the heroine's comportment and characteristics can be understood as *human* traits, canceling a dialectic understanding of them as either masculine or feminine. The resulting agentic characterization aids audiences to identify with the protagonist as a heroine, though not to a feminist reading of the film.

Key words: *Divergent,* dystopia, gender, corporality, agency.

"I moved my lips and wondered how the rain
would taste if my tongue were made of stone.
And wished it was. And whispered so that no one
could hear it but him: *make me a heroine.*"

Eavan Boland, "Heroic"

1. INTRODUCCIÓN

En el cine o en la literatura, ser una de las protagonistas no equivale a ser la heroína. Ni siquiera ser la protagonista *principal* lo garantiza. Un rápido recorrido por la filmografía occidental comercial de acción de los últimos lustros ha reiterado una realidad bien diferente a través de sus actrices estrella. El personaje de Lara Croft (Angelina Jolie), uno de los ejemplos más estudiados, se acercó a las puertas de convertirse en superheroína. Sus comportamientos a veces maniqueamente construidos la acercan más, sin embargo, a la figura del hombre de acción, como el guerrero o el soldado. Desde el punto de vista escénico, uno de los mayores obstáculos ha sido la hipersexualización de la actriz. En ese sentido, Brown insiste en que características primarias de estos, como el uso de la fuerza, se subordinan en ella a una feminidad fetichizada (2011: 245). A través de escenas con vistas fragmentadas de su cuerpo, focalizado como sexualmente deseable y pasivo, Croft reiteradamente ha sido representada para una 'mirada masculina' (Mulvey, 1988). Incluso el propio contenido argumental ha contribuido a ello, pues los romances que tantas veces acompañan a su misión no hacen sino reforzar la conclusión de que esta protagonista de acción se ha construido, ante todo, como objeto de deseo de un espectador hombre. Alicia Vikander, la actriz que actualmente da vida a Lara Croft, permanece inexplorada en este sentido.

Protagonistas asimismo más recientes, especialmente en el cine de acción distópico, tienden hoy a aunar cualidades de ambos géneros; siendo presentadas como personajes guerreros a la par que racionales que no tienen por qué dejar de lado su feminidad o únicamente adoptar una performatividad masculina. La literatura coincide en que la

119

distopía es efectivamente un espacio dúctil donde reinscribir el género. Para Vargas (2015: 116) la mezcla de convención e invención de la tipología distópica es una forma de presentar cómo la realidad futura podría cambiar en los nuevos términos que demanda el presente, incluyendo a los de género. También en *Declaration of Independence: Empowered Girls in Young Adult Literature, 1990-2001* se defiende esta primacía de las películas y literatura distópicas como reinscriptoras del sistema sexo/género, ya que sus autoras coinciden en que precisamente a través de la creación del mundo antiutópico las protagonistas consiguen su oportunidad de autorrealizarse y empoderarse como heroínas fuera de los cánones de feminidad (Brown y St. Clair, 2002: 129). Este sería el caso de la protagonista de la saga cinematográfica de *Los juegos del hambre* (2012). Popularmente se ha analizado a Katniss Everdeen (Jennifer Lawrence) como la definitiva heroína de acción, y en el terreno académico los análisis leen "una heroína radical" o "la heroína contemporánea del cine de acción" (Kirby, 2015). Tales lecturas posfeministas celebratorias de esta genealogía del *girl power* son problemáticas por varios motivos. Para Woloshyn y Lane "[they] situate girls as powerful, no longer marginalized" (2012: 3).[1] Específicamente en el caso de la adaptación para el cine de la trilogía, estos análisis se dejan en el tintero, además, cómo la heroicidad de Katniss sigue operando en términos binarios y performativos del género. De facto, Katniss Everdeen supone un personaje simultáneamente masculinizado y feminizado frente a Beatrice Prior, la heroína de *Divergente* (2014) que este artículo se propone analizar. Beatrice se puede analizar como una heroína cuya divergencia identitaria indica un rechazo a un único itinerario vital que le correspondería según un género también unitario. El nivel de agencia que consigue de esta manera y el tipo de heroína que representa resultan más eficaces que en Katniss, tanto que para Lopez-da Silva "when comparing the agency of female protagonists in contemporary dystopian YA [Young Adult] literature that have adapted for the silver screen, Tris Prior of the *Divergent* series is the exact antithesis of Katniss Everdeen" (2016: 23).[2] Para llevar a cabo este análisis he dividido el estudio de la película, el cual abordo en el apartado tercero, en dos partes. Por un lado, examinaré la codificación en términos de género de la sociedad presentada a través del sistema de facciones en el filme, tratando de demostrar sus limitaciones. Después, estudiaré cómo se representa la capacidad agentiva de Beatrice mediante determinadas técnicas argumentales y escenográficas. Finalizaré en

---

[1] Todas las traducciones han sido elaboradas por la autora.
 "Se presenta a las adolescentes no ya marginalizadas sino empoderadas".
[2] "Al comparar la agencia de protagonistas femeninas en la literatura distópica juvenil actual que han sido adaptadas al cine, Tris Prior de la saga *Divergente* es la antítesis exacta de Katniss Everdeen".

un último apartado con la síntesis de las contribuciones obtenidas para aportar una conclusión al artículo.

2. BREVE RESUMEN DE LA PELÍCULA Y DATOS TÉCNICOS

Divergente es una película dirigida por Neil Burger en 2014 y ha sido producida en los Estados Unidos como la primera parte de la saga de igual denominación. Está basada en la trilogía literaria homónima escrita por Veronica Roth y publicada entre 2011 y 2013. La historia se sitúa durante un futuro no especificado en la ciudad de Chicago, que ha sido devastada tras un conflicto bélico. Su organización social posterior responde a una división en distintos grupos o facciones, que incluyen a Abnegación, Cordialidad, Verdad, Osadía y Erudición, categorías cada una de las cuales favorece un ideario de valores y ocupaciones concretas. Beatrice Prior, interpretada por Shailene Woodley, da nombre a la protagonista de la ficción. Junto con su hermano Caleb (Ansel Elgort) y sus padres, Andrew (Tony Goldwyn) y Natalie (Ashley Judd), Beatrice pertenece a Abnegación, donde priman valores como el altruismo y la humildad. Sin embargo, tras el test de aptitud que todo adolescente ha de pasar en la ciudad al cumplir los dieciséis años, pasará a formar parte por su propia elección de Osadía, la facción guerrera. Su decisión contrasta con el resultado del examen, que fue inconcluso para Beatrice, dando resultados dispares e inabarcables por una única facción. Su personalidad responde, en realidad, a tres facciones simultáneamente (Abnegación, Osadía y Erudición). Este hecho resulta clave para el fondo argumental, ya que esta divergencia la convierte automáticamente en una amenaza para el gobierno dado que supone un desbarajuste del sistema de facción única y, por tanto, del orden público. Además, provoca en Beatrice un conflicto identitario de no-pertenencia a ninguna de estas categorías sociales. Estas son las razones básicas por la que Beatrice lucha por integrarse en Osadía como su nueva facción. A través de un duro autoentrenamiento de su fisionomía consigue asegurar su puesto en los tests físicos de Osadía. Su divergencia le confiere la facilidad para superar las posteriores pruebas mentales pero es también la que, una vez descubierta, la sitúe en peligro de ser eliminada por el gobierno. De todas formas, esta diferencia será la que igualmente le permita abortar tal misión y completar sus propios planes.

3. ANÁLISIS FÍLMICO DE *DIVERGENTE* (2014) EN CLAVE DE GÉNERO

3.1. ¿Una facción por persona?

Muchas de las sinopsis, ya sean de páginas de crítica de cine o de publicaciones académicas, hablan de cinco facciones (las arriba indicadas) que estructuran el Chicago de

121

la saga *Divergente*. Algunas hablan de seis, puesto que incluyen a la de las 'gentes sin facción' (*'the factionless'* en la versión en inglés). En un primer nivel, la existencia de estas facciones, sean cinco o seis, responde a la tradición noseológica occidental que tiende a encasillar a las personas en función de cierta(s) característica(s) en nuestra sociedad actual, como el sexo/género y la edad, o la "raza" en algunos contextos. Cinematográficamente, esto habría sido representado con anterioridad en películas tan populares como la saga *Harry Potter*, con su sistema de 'Casas', que resultó muy influyente por sus resultados identificatorios y performativos producidos entre el público (Hintz, Basu y Broad, 2013: 22). Criticando el reduccionismo social que implica, estos autores indican que el sistema en *Harry Potter* representa la rigidez de un régimen clasificatorio que solo a veces aparece ligeramente 'problematizado'. En el caso de que "a character's complexity is discovered to be inadequately represented by his House allegiance" (Hintz, Basu y Broad, 2013: 22) esta rigidez se desmorona, dando pie a lecturas más inclusivas.[3] Retomo esta idea para mi análisis de las facciones de *Divergente* como recodificadoras del sistema sexo/género a través de su protagonista, que no encaja definitivamente en ninguna y sería también por tanto un sistema clasificatorio posibilitador, concretamente en términos de género.

En la literatura, el análisis más completo sobre la construcción a través del género de las facciones de *Divergente* es el elaborado por Hanna Smith en "Permission to Diverge: Gender in Young Adult Dystopian Literature". La autora argumenta que los rasgos definitorios de cada una de las facciones se hallan codificados en términos binarios de género porque pueden ser asociados a "qualities stereotypically valued by different genders" (Smith, 2014: 7).[4] Para la autora, cualidades como la lógica, la fuerza, la resolutividad, la autonomía, la valentía y el control emocional son clave en las facciones de Osadía, Erudición y Verdad (2014: 9). La capacidad de compasión, la entrega desinteresada, la emoción, la intuición, el compromiso y la vulnerabilidad serían características propias de Abnegación y Cordialidad. Según Smith (2014: 7), las primeras corresponderían a estereotipos del género masculino y las segundas a las del femenino. El aspecto cuestionable de este análisis es, como han destacado Ames y Burcon, que serían estereotipos concretamente asociados al *entorno* de la acción: "She [Smith] reads the setting itself [...] as gendered" (2016: 53).[5] Es pues en términos de espacio donde puede defenderse que la película secunda ciertos estereotipos de género. Pero no tan fácilmente

---

[3] "La complejidad de un personaje no se corresponde con una representación de su adscripción a una casa correspondiente".

[4] "Cualidades valoradas estereotípicamente por los diferentes géneros".

[5] "Interpreta el propio escenario de la acción en términos de género".

en términos identitarios. El elemento subversivo más evidente en este sentido, aunque parezca una obviedad, es que en todas las facciones conviven personas independientemente de su género. Es decir, una facción feminizada como Abnegación no está solo formada por mujeres –su dirigente es un hombre, por ejemplo. Sería necesario poseer una formación académica universitaria en un área como 'espacialidad y género' para asimilar la sutileza que implica que el *setting* de la película ha sido codificado siguiendo parcialmente tipologías de masculinidad/feminidad tradicionales. Se podría defender por el contrario que para el espectador o espectadora medio, generalmente adolescente, los comportamientos de los protagonistas, como nivel de identificación más accesible (Hintz, Basu y Broad, 2013: 1), no se perciben como asociados al sistema sexo/género. De esta manera la legitimización de estereotipos binarios de género que denuncia Smith pierde terreno.

Según este análisis desde el punto de vista de lo personal por encima de lo espacial, la facción a la que Beatrice entra a formar parte cobra especial relevancia. Osadía, el grupo guerrero, aparece representado de manera similar a un ejército de la sociedad actual. La existencia de mujeres en la facción no es un reflejo distinto a la realidad; paulatinamente estas van accediendo a distintos puestos del ejército de manera cada vez más normalizada. Sigue siendo importante, no obstante, su representación en la pantalla porque contribuye a forjar el hecho de que las mujeres ya no necesitan que las rescaten sino que ellas mismas son también "salvadoras". Como indica Yuval-Davis "la participación de las mujeres en las fuerzas armadas puede erosionar una de las construcciones culturales más poderosas de las colectividades nacionales: aquella según la cual "mujeres-e-hijos" ("*womenandchildren*") son la causa por la que los hombres van a la guerra" (1998: 169). La película muestra, no obstante, diferencias cruciales al género respecto al ejército. Por una parte, la cantidad de mujeres en Osadía frente a la de hombres está equilibrada, algo que aún no ha ocurrido en la actualidad. La paridad, además, no es solo cuantitativa sino cualitativa. Es trascendental que en Osadía no existen diferencias de tratamiento o promoción según el sexo. Hay una frase que explicita este tratamiento igualitario, referida a una segregación por la *experiencia* en la facción: "you [transfers] will train separately from the Dauntless-born, but we will rank you together" (34'27''-34'31'').[6] Las tareas o trabajos a desempeñar en Osadía, "leadership, guarding the fence or keeping the factions

---

[6] "En el caso de los transferidos entrenaréis separados de los nacidos en Osadía, pero os calificaremos a todos juntos".

from killing each other" (34'37''-34'40''), dependen asimismo del ránking.[7] Para Hodge esto enfatiza que la habilidad y el estatus social en *Divergente* son independientes del sexo: "In this society gender is based on ability, not genitalia" (2014: 5).[8] Por lo tanto la apuesta resulta en su representación de la facción guerrera subversiva del argumento biologicista por el que las mujeres son físicamente menos capaces que los hombres e implica de manera más general un posicionamiento efectivo frente a los estereotipos de género en el trabajo.

3.2. Beatrice Prior: técnicas argumentales y escénicas agentivas

Varias publicaciones han destacado que el primer paso para una adecuada representación de la capacidad agentiva de Beatrice es su resolutividad en la ceremonia de elección de facciones (López da Silva, 2016: 30; Day, Green-Barteet y Montz, 2014: 60-61). En primera instancia señala de nuevo un desafío al compartimento estanco de la biología como destino, puesto que su traspaso a Osadía supone "rebel[ling] against her *natal* faction of Abnegation" (Day, Green-Barteet y Montz, 2014: 61, énfasis añadido).[9] En términos más generales, es un relevante acto de agencia dado que implica la introducción por parte de Beatrice del componente de su propia subjetividad en dos niveles sociales. En un primer nivel indica que está dispuesta a alejarse de la institución de nacimiento, la familia. Además, y esto sería clave como elemento de subversión en el género distópico, rechaza la institución cultural-gubernamental del sistema de facciones. Como indican Day, Green-Barteet y Montz el sistema de facciones obliga a sus miembros a integrarse como *objetos* de una sociedad represiva, a aceptar "their position as powerless subordinates" en aras de obtener una supuesta seguridad (2014: 36).[10] La mayoría de los ciudadanos secunda las expectativas del sistema, renegando así de parte de su propia individualidad. En contraste, Tris reclama su subjetividad "claim[ing] agency as [she] learns power exists only in action" (2014: 37).[11] La representación escénica del momento de decisión para Beatrice en la ceremonia colabora con su empoderamiento. Durante el acto, los dos primeros chicos que eligen escogen su facción de nacimiento, pero el tercero, de Erudición, se trasvasa a Cordialidad. En estos momentos la cámara establece un contraste en la percepción del instante para Beatrice. Un primer plano destaca cómo al escucharle elegir ella abre los ojos resuelta, enfatizando su epifanía personal.

---

[7] "Tareas de liderazgo, de proteger la valla o de evitar que las facciones se enfrenten y maten entre ellas".

[8] "En esta sociedad el género se basa en consideraciones de habilidad, no de genitales".

[9] "Una rebelión ante Abnegación, su facción *de nacimiento*".

[10] "Su posición como subordinados desprovistos de poder".

[11] "Reclamando su agencia al entender que el poder únicamente existe en la acción".

 Cuando le corresponde a ella misma escoger, la cámara ofrece un *p.o.v shot* o plano cenital de las vasijas sobre las que ha de verter su sangre a modo de juramento por la facción electa, junto a un posterior plano de contrapicado de su rostro. Según Hui "[this] low angle shot establishes how *she* is in control of what faction she will join" (2015: énfasis en original).[12] Con estos dos tipos de plano se dota de gravedad a la reflexión y autodeterminación de Beatrice. Cuando la cámara se detiene finalmente en la de Osadía, la cámara aumenta la velocidad, dando intensidad a la resolutividad de Beatrice, quien rectifica la posición de su mano sobre esta vasija, y ofrece finalmente un simbólico plano detalle de la sangre hirviendo al contacto de las brasas, emblema de la facción guerrera. Inmediatamente pasa a un primer plano centrado en el rostro semi-sonriente y satisfecho de la protagonista, con un fondo distorsionado del público, haciendo uso de la técnica de 'profundidad de campo'. Justo después ofrece el plano inverso, su rostro queda desdibujado y la cámara reconstituye la nitidez del fondo, donde aparece el público contrariado y sus padres sorprendidos. Esto contribuye a reforzar el individualismo de su decisión.

A partir de su entrada en Osadía, Beatrice toma varias decisiones que contribuyen a forjar su propia identidad, confiriéndole agencia. El primer paso es autobautizarse como Tris. Más adelante, la mayoría de las resoluciones que adopta son referentes a su corporeidad. Es destacable que uno de los motivos por los que Tris elige la facción guerrera es porque esta no condena el cuidado de la apariencia física, mientras que Abnegación sí, al considerarlo una actitud vanidosa. Beatrice decide no renunciar a su cuidado porque desea (re)conocer su propio cuerpo. Una de las primeras escenas del filme así lo expresa, pues muestra a la protagonista tras recibir un corte de cabello contemplándose en el espejo, lo cual es censurado por su madre ya que supera el tiempo permitido por las normas de Abnegación. No es casualidad que su estrategia para superar las pruebas mentales en Osadía consista en contemplar su reflejo en diferentes superficies. El autoconocimiento le sirve a Tris para reconocer que lo que está viviendo es una simulación. Se podría defender que esto supone una deconstrucción de la visión negativa que existe en la sociedad acerca de la autocontemplación a la que las mujeres someten sus cuerpos, entendida como vanidad, pero que en la película se recodifica como una necesidad de la subjetividad humana necesaria al desarrollo de una identidad completa.

Paulatinamente, Tris irá moldeando su identidad a través de una modificación de su musculatura. Una de las escenas de la película comienza en el dormitorio de Osadía, en plena noche, con Tris escabulléndose a la zona de entrenamiento. Hay un momento en el

---

[12] "El plano cenital enfatiza cómo es *ella misma* quien controla la facción a la que se unirá".

que la cámara ofrece un plano detalle de sus puños ensangrentados de golpear su saco. A partir de entonces se inicia una canción: 'My blood' (2012) (Mi sangre), de Ellie Goulding. Las escenas de Tris progresando en las pruebas físicas de los días siguientes van pasando deprisa al tiempo que se eleva el volumen de la canción. El propio director ha comentado sobre la canción y la cantante que fueron elegidas como representativas de la "inner voice of our heroine Tris" (Wikipedia, 2014).[13] Su uso sería un ejemplo de 'identification music' (música para empatizar), aquella que "can create a dynamic subjective bond between the action onscreen and the viewer, which moves between them and the emotions of the characters, externalizing them from the narrative and unifying the emotions of the audience" (Rothwell, 2007: 18).[14] Es decir, con esta elección musical y la superposición *in allegro* de múltiples escenas se consigue que el público sienta el progreso de Tris; en esencia, que se identifique con el empoderamiento que está viviendo la protagonista.

Este tipo de preparación física de un personaje femenino en el cine ha supuesto tradicionalmente un seguimiento del problemático "postfeminist spirit of agency and empowerment via preparation of the body in anticipation of the male gaze" (Dubrofsky y Wood, 2015: 99).[15] En la película, este principio queda parcialmente subvertido. La mirada masculina para la que iría dirigido el nuevo cuerpo de Beatrice no se produce. La observación de Tobías (alias Cuatro, el *lead* romántico de Beatrice en la película) se neutraliza mediante la elisión de las típicas escenas de fragmentación corporal de la protagonista. Al contrario, no obstante, Tris sí desarrolla una mirada femenina sobre el cuerpo sexuado de Tobías: "it is her that gazes, while the object she is looking at is the male protagonist Tobias […] because of her desire for him, which means that she is driven by a scopophilic instinct" (Oberhuber, 2015: 41).[16]

Tales cambios en el cuerpo de Tris son también percibidos por otros compañeros en Osadía. Ante el peligro que supone su progreso en los ránkings, tres de ellos deciden eliminar a Tris arrojándola desde una pared al 'hoyo' –como se denomina a la zona de entrenamiento. Es relevante destacar que en el libro la escena se desarrolla además como una tentativa de violación, mientras que en la película se presenta exclusivamente como un intento de asesinato. En ambos es Tobías quien la salva, apareciendo como un *deus ex*

---

[13] "La voz interior de nuestra heroína Tris".

[14] "Capaz de crear una relación subjetiva y dinámica entre la acción en pantalla y el espectador, la cual conecta las emociones entre la audiencia y los personajes, externalizándolas y homogeneizando las emociones del público".

[15] "Espíritu agentivo y empoderador del posteminismo a través de una preparación del cuerpo que se anticipa a una mirada masculina".

[16] "Es ella quien observa, mientras que el objeto al cual observa es Tobías, el protagonista masculino, a quien desea, lo cual apunta a que ella se mueve por un instinto escopofílico".

machina que rescata a la 'damisela en apuros'. Considero que para subvertir esta posible lectura de la escena, el director introduce otro cambio respecto al libro.[17] En las pruebas mentales se presenta como miedo añadido de Tris a ser coercionada sexualmente por Tobías, a pesar de que se hallan en una relación de pareja y del propio deseo sexual de Beatrice hacia él. El miedo a la violación por desconocidos en espacios públicos es, relativamente, uno culturalmente inducido, ya que estudios sobre la violencia sexual a las mujeres demuestran la gran frecuencia con la que esta se produce ciertamente dentro de este contexto de la pareja o de las citas, al contrario de por terceras personas (Fontanil y Alcedo, 2013: 65). Añadir esta escena facilita la representación de Tris con capacidad agentiva para decidir sobre el consentimiento de un encuentro sexual en el noviazgo y que sea reconocido públicamente como tal, ya que el 'no' de Beatrice equivale a finalizar la última prueba mental en Osadía con éxito y entre aplausos (National Network to End Domestic Violence, 2017: 3). Asimismo, se podría argumentar que para contradecir el estereotipo de que (el temor a) las violencias es asunto de un solo género, *Divergente* muestra un caso similar para Tobías, cuyo miedo más profundo es precisamente a la violencia doméstica ejercida por su padre, Markus.

Cierta sutileza con la que se representan los temores de Tris contribuye igualmente al empoderamiento de la protagonista y es que estos nunca se presentan como un obstáculo ante sus decisiones altruistas. En el test de aptitud es la aparición de una niña a la que salvar la que conduce a Beatrice a correr detrás de un perro de raza peligrosa, cuando no lo hizo para salvar su propia vida. En otra escena, durante los entrenamientos de Osadía, toma su decisión de colocarse delante de la pared de lanzamiento de cuchillos por ayudar a un amigo. A pesar de que en un primer momento podría aparecer este último como un comportamiento temerario, las técnicas de sonido empleadas bloquean esta lectura. En concreto, se añaden sonidos diegéticos "of her deep breath which shows how nervous she is" junto a no diegéticos "as the knives reach the target [...] to amplify the power of danger" (Anderson, 2016).[18] Además, destaca la importancia de estos comportamientos para una recodificación de las actitudes estereotipadas de género. Como concluye Oberhuber la abnegación, concretamente, si bien se asocia tradicionalmente a la feminidad como se ha expuesto más arriba, en Tris "selflessness is strongly linked to her strength and bravery,

---

[17] Megan S. McDonough (2017) en "From Damsel in Distress to Active Agent: Female Agency in Children's and Young Adult Fiction" respalda, de hecho, la idea de que en adaptaciones cinematográficas de novelas juveniles las protagonistas reconstituyen su agencia de damisela en apuros de manera diferente a como lo hacen en la novela, llegando a cancelar este rol y acercándose a una visión agentiva postfeminista.

[18] "De su respiración profunda para indicar lo nerviosa que está" "mientras los cuchillos van alcanzando el objetivo, aumentando la sensación de peligro".

which makes both, femininity as well as masculinity, significant aspects that can coexist and complement each other" (2015: 42).[19]

Por consideraciones temáticas este artículo no se centra en la relación romántica con Tobías que se desarrolla en la película. No obstante, hay dos escenas del final que resultan relevantes al respecto para la representación agentiva de Tris. Cuatro, Markus y Caleb, quienes han colaborado junto a ella para tumbar los planes del gobierno, aparecen subidos en tren, dirigiéndose a las afueras de la ciudad. Para unirse a ellos, Beatrice está corriendo para asirse a este tren, el cual ya ha tenido que alcanzar en otras dos escenas anteriores (la primera vez de su entrada en Osadía y la noche en la que se escapa del hospital para hacer el juego de atrapa la bandera). En todas ellas Cuatro la ayuda a subirse. La diferencia es que en esta escena Tris ya no necesita que él la impulse, pues ahora ella tiene la suficiente fuerza para hacerlo sola. El diálogo que intercambian ("–I got it" "–I know you do", 120'10'') deja claro esto.[20] El gesto, como destaca Lopez-da Silva (2016: 3), aparece como una muestra de afecto, pero se bloquea su identificación como práctica cultural performativa. Es decir, se impide que sea interpretado como los tópicos de género de la caballerosidad del hombre y la mujer inválida, no restándole de esta forma agencia a la protagonista. Posteriormente aparecen Tris y Cuatro abrazándose en el compartimento del tren mientras hablan del futuro incierto que les espera. A pesar de que se trata de una escena sentimental se evita el empleo de la canción de la pareja, 'Come Alive' (2007) (Vuelve con vida) de Foo Fighters y por el contrario se utiliza de nuevo la voz de Ellie Goulding para que el público concluya el visionado de la película identificándose con la heroína, no con el más secundario romance. Esta vez suena 'Beating Heart' (2012) (Corazón que late) y la parte de la letra que se reproduce son los dos versos que, significativamente, hablan sobre el *I,* el yo (no aquellos que hablan sobre un *we,* un nosotros):

"And I don't know where I'm going but I know it's gonna be a long time / And I'll be leaving in the morning come to the white wine bitter sunlight".[21]

4. CONCLUSIONES

Se ha precipitado, en ocasiones, la conclusión de que la película *Divergente* rompe todo molde de género (Lopez-da Silva, 2016: 2). El estudio realizado a lo largo de este artículo

---

[19] "El altruismo está íntimamente relacionado con su fuerza y bravura, lo cual permite que su feminidad y masculinidad se conviertan en aspectos relevantes que pueden coexistir y complementarse".

[20] "-Puedo sola", "-Lo sé".

[21] "Y no sé hacia dónde iré, pero sé que será por un largo tiempo / Y me alejaré cuando llegue la mañana hacia la luz del sol blanca, amarga como el vino".

128

muestra que esta sería una visión que resultaría, por simplista, parcial. La propuesta general ha sido que el filme sí constituye un paso adelante en la representación de la capacidad agentiva de un personaje mujer. Su encarnación de valores no ya femeninos o masculinos, sino complejamente humanos, forja su epitomización como protagonista que desafía los roles de género y el binarismo del propio sistema sexo/género. Como indica Amber "*The Divergent* series help expose the fabrication of gender performance […] and […] emphasizes that no one should choose between Abnegation, Amity, Candor, Dauntless, and Erudite; rather, society most benefits from individuals who *embody* all of those characteristics" (2014: 8, énfasis en original).[22] Esta visión revelaría así los avances logrados en una sociedad hoy más igualitaria en valores de género, a la par que demostrar los progresos que todavía quedan por hacer ya que con *Divergente* aún no podemos hablar de la deseable realidad de una heroína de acción o utopía estrictamente feministas. Necesitaría aún que el género penetrase no solo en las individualidades de los personajes sino en el completo sistema de valores incorporados en pantalla –como desafiar la heteronormatividad. Aun así, destaca su acierto en presentar a una protagonista que desde su divergencia vive una relación romántica, sí, pero desenraizada de la performatividad, empleándola como un sitio de crecimiento individual y colaboración societal a un fin superior. *Divergente* proporciona así un patrón efectivo para otras películas y sobre todo otras heroínas de acción, gracias a su inclusión de un modelo efectivo de protagonista con la que el público se identifica y junto al que se puede empoderar, pues tal como insiste Geena Davis (2016) "if they can see it, they can be it".[23]

REFERENCIAS BIBLIOGRÁFICAS

Ames, M. y S. **Burcon**. *How Pop Culture Shapes the Stages of a Woman's Life: from Todlers-in-tiaras to Cougars-on-the-Prowl*, London: Palgrave, 2016.

Anderson, S. "Divergent Scene Analysis". *Vimeo.* 2016. Disponible en: https://vimeo.com/148812882 .

Brown, J. y N. **St Clair**. *Declarations of independence: Empowered girls in young adult literature, 1990-2001*, Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 2002.

Brown, J. *Dangerous Curves: Action Heroines, Gender, Fetishism, and Popular Culture*, Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2011.

---

[22] "La saga *Divergente* contribuye a exponer que la performatividad de género es una construcción […] y […] enfatiza que nadie debería elegir entre Abnegación, Cordialidad, Verdad, Osadía y Erudición, de hecho, la sociedad se beneficia en mayor medida a través de personas que pueden *encarnar* todas esas características".
[23] "Cuando ellas pueden verlo, también pueden serlo".

Davis, G. "Want a Female President? Put Them Onscreen First". *Hollywoodreporter*, 12 de julio, 2016.

Day, S., M. **Green-Barteet** y A. **Montz**. *Female Rebellion in Young Adult Dystopian Fiction*, Farnham: Ashgate, 2014.

Divergente. Dir. Neil Burger. *Summit Entertainment y Red Wagon Productions,* 139 min, 2014.

Dubrofsky, R. y M. **Wood**. "Gender, Race, and Authenticity: Celebrity Women Tweeting for the Gaze". Rachel E. Dubrofsky y Shoshana Amielle Magnet (eds.), *Feminist Surveillance Studies.* Durham: Duke University Press, 2015, Págs. 93-106.

Fontanil, Y. y Mª Á. **Alcedo**. *Análisis interdisciplinar de la violencia de género*, Oviedo: KRK ediciones, 2013.

Hintz, C., B. **Balaka** y K. **Broad**. *Contemporary dystopian fiction for young adults: Brave new teenagers*, Nueva York: Routledge, 2013.

Hodge, A. '"We Should Look the Part": Performing Masculinity in Divergent and The Hunger Games". *Text in Context: A Graduate Student Journal.* 2014, Vol.1, Págs.10-14.

Hui, J. "Divergent scene analysis". *EMAZE,* 2015. Disponible en: https://www.emaze.com/@ALCTRIWI/ .

Kirby, P. "The Girl on Fire: The Hunger Games, Feminist Geopolitics and the Contemporary Female Action Hero". *Geopolitics.* 2015, Vol.20, Núm.2, Págs. 460-478.

Lopez-da Silva, J. "Convention and Defiance: The Female Hero's Performance of Gender Roles in the Hunger Games and the Divergent series". Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, 2016.

Los juegos del hambre. Dir. Gary Ross. *Lionsgate*, 142 min, 2012.

McDonough, M. S. "From Damsel in Distress to Active Agent : Female Agency in Children's and Young Adult Fiction". Universidad de Louisville, 2017.

Mulvey, L. "Placer visual y cine narrativo". Valencia: Fundación Instituto Shakespeare/Instituto de Cine y RTV, 1988.

National Network to End Domestic Violence. "Discussion Questions for Divergent". *Goodreads*, 2017. Disponible en:
 http://nnedv.org/downloads/Other/Goodreads/Divergent_Feb-Mar2014.pdf .

Oberhuber, K. "Gender and Other Issues in Young Adult Dystopian Fiction: Veronica Roth's *Divergent* and Katie Kacvinsky's *Awaken*". Universidad de Viena, 2015.

Roth, V. *Divergente***,** Londres: Harper Collins Publishers, 2011.

Rothwell, S. "Detection and Analysis of Emotional Highlights in Film". Dublin: Dublin City University, 2007.

Smith, H. "Permission to Diverge: Gender in Young Adult Dystopian Literature". *Gender Studies Research Papers*. 2014, Paper 1.

Vargas, S. "El cine distópico como legitimización del orden vigente". *Philologica Urcitana*. 2015, Vól.13, Págs. 113-122.

Wikipedia. "*Divergent:* Original Motion Picture Soundtrack*". Wikipedia*, 2014.

Woloshyn, V. y L. **Lane**. "'She's More Like a Guy' and 'He's More Like a Teddy Bear': Girls' Perception of Violence and Gender in *The Hunger Games*". *Journal of Youth Studies.* 2012*.* Vol.16, Núm.8, Págs. 1022-1037.

Yuval-Davis, N. "Género y nación: articulaciones del origen, la cultura y la ciudadanía". *Página Abierta*. 1998 (1996), Vol.86, Págs. 1-8.

Implicaciones de la censura en el desarrollo de los lenguajes del cuerpo: de la palabra al cuerpo en la escena española de los setenta.

Implications of the censorship in the development of the languages of the body: from the word to the body in the Spanish scene of the seventies.

Mariángeles Rodríguez Alonso
Universidad de Murcia
ma.rodriguezalonso@um.es

Resumen

El presente trabajo focaliza su atención en el viraje que se produce en el horizonte de la vanguardia escénica de los setenta desde la palabra hacia el cuerpo. A través de las poéticas dramatúrgicas y escénicas del teatro independiente se funda un nuevo sentido de la teatralidad en el que la palabra ya no ostenta el lugar central. Asistimos al abandono progresivo del textocentrismo en pos de una escena de mayor sensorialidad y fisicidad. El artículo se detiene en primer lugar en el dibujo de este desplazamiento para analizar después algunas de las implicaciones estéticas y políticas de la censura en la conformación de las poéticas teatrales del momento. Cuando la palabra es censurada deviene necesario hacer decir al cuerpo, de este modo, la censura interviene en el desarrollo de los lenguajes del cuerpo.

Palabras clave: vanguardia, teatro, censura, cuerpo, poéticas escénicas.

Abstract

The present work focus on the change from the word to the body which takes place in the theatrical avant-garde of the seventies. The stage and dramatic poetics of the Independent Theatre establish a new sense of theatricality where the word is not anymore in the central place. We attend the progressive withdrawal of the textcentrism in pursuit of more

sensorial and physical scene. The article studies, in first place, the draw of this shift, and afterwards, it analyses certain aesthetic and political implications of the censorship in the configuration of theatrical poetics of the moment. When the word is censored, it becomes necessary the body talks, in this way, censorship takes part in the development of the languages of the body.

Keywords: avant-gard, theatre, censorship, body, stage poetics word.

1. EL PROBLEMÁTICO BINOMIO TEXTUALIDAD / TEATRALIDAD, PALABRA/ CUERPO

Uno de los rasgos esenciales que dota de especifidad genérica al teatro es precisamente su doble naturaleza textual y espectacular. El teatro es un género literario pero al tiempo excede los límites convencionales del resto de los géneros. Es, juntamente, manifestación literaria, práctica artística, hecho escénico y acontecimiento sociocultural. A lo largo de los siglos ha oscilado la balanza que determinara el mayor o menor protagonismo del aspecto textual o literario frente al espectacular o escénico. Sánchez Montes señala cómo "los orígenes del teatro se forjan en relación con el espectáculo y no con la escritura ni con la literatura" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 17) siendo su aproximación a lo verbal, primero, y a lo textual, después, posterior en el tiempo. El cuerpo tiene una función decisiva en el surgimiento de lo teatral mientras que la palabra es un elemento de más tardía incorporación. Sin embargo, -apunta asimismo- "el desarrollo de la historia del teatro se ha llevado a cabo preferentemente desde los textos dramáticos, lo que en muchos casos ha dado como resultado una historia sesgada de los hechos acontecidos en el ámbito escénico" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 18). Considera Sánchez Montes que el cambio fundamental que generará "la definitiva identificación entre teatro y texto dramático se produce a partir del S. XVIII, precisamente en relación con la relectura de las ideas aristotélicas" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 20). Esta concepción no solo establece una unión indivisible entre teatro y literatura dramática sino también la clara subordinación del primero respecto a la segunda: la recuperación de la poética aristotélica había traído consigo en primer lugar, el establecimiento de la vinculación entre espectáculo teatral y texto dramático- cuyo planteamiento ha de tener sus referentes inmediatos en la realidad- como universal y natural con lo que el logos de ese modo quedaba realzado y en consecuencia el propio drama; y por otro lado, el privilegio de la comprensión racional del espectáculo en detrimento de la experiencia dirigida a los sentidos, así como la posibilidad de que la recepción del mismo se produjera en la esfera de lo irracional, debido a la creencia en que la experiencia o el placer estético iba dirigido al intelecto.

Vemos cómo la concepción teatral que privilegia el texto, la razón, y con ella, la palabra dramática que reclama una relación ordenada con la realidad exterior se impone en el siglo XVIII frente a otra concepción más ancestral vinculada a lo sensorial, lo irracional y lo escénico que queda relegada a partir de este momento histórico[1]. Sánchez Montes argumenta en *El cuerpo como signo* (2004) cómo la crisis de los realismos de finales del XIX y principios del XX así como las corrientes renovadoras que nacen en tal horizonte trasladan la atención desde el texto al espectáculo, desde la palabra hacia el cuerpo, sustituyendo en cierta medida una concepción teatral por la otra. Explica así la conexión de las poéticas de los grandes renovadores de la teoría y la práctica teatral europea con ideologías y corrientes de pensamiento del momento. Señala como factores condicionantes de la recuperación de la atención por el cuerpo y la escena: la crisis del lenguaje y su incapacidad comunicativa[2], las ideas nietzscheanas que evidencian el error que constituye el lugar privilegiado otorgado a la razón frente a la emoción así como su concepción de un lenguaje ya enfermo y agotado, y el cuestionamiento de la burguesía que nos hace ya dudar de sus promesas así como de sus formas de representación[3].

Nuestra tarea en el presente trabajo consistirá en mostrar, a través del análisis crítico del discurso teórico del momento –y por tanto de las poéticas que se infieran del mismo-, cómo a partir de la década de los sesenta se produce en el panorama teatral español un impulso renovador de semejantes características. Tiene lugar así un paralelo desplazamiento de la atención -desde el texto hacia el espectáculo, desde la palabra al cuerpo- liderado por la vanguardia escénica de los años sesenta y setenta en la que la censura ocupa significativo lugar. Si las vanguardias históricas supusieron ya la inauguración de poéticas atentas a factores espectaculares tales como la centralidad del cuerpo del actor o el valor funcional y estético del empleo de la luz en la escena, el corte en su evolución impuesto por la guerra civil y la larga posguerra española cercenará tal vía de

---

[1] "Si la recuperación de las ideas aristotélicas por la Ilustración había contribuido a la pérdida de gran parte de la dimensión espectacular del teatro en beneficio del aspecto intelectual, el Romanticismo y posteriormente tendencias como el Realismo y el Naturalismo, son determinantes para que el texto termine por imponerse sobre el resto de los elementos de la escena que se asocia entonces, en primer lugar, a la literatura y en segundo lugar al espectáculo" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 30).

[2] "La crisis del lenguaje verbal a finales del siglo XIX supone, por tanto, la ruptura necesaria para que en el ámbito teatral se comiencen a explorar nuevas formas de comprensión del fenómeno escénico. El espectáculo teatral, que puede hacer uso de cualquier tipo de texto a su alcance, comienza a abandonar entonces la posibilidad de ser considerado inevitablemente vinculado a la realidad y de igual modo deja de reclamar la comprensión racional del mismo (…) el ámbito teatral se considera cada vez menos un espacio dominado por el logos" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 14).

[3] Señala Sánchez Montes cómo el "cuestionamiento que atraviesan las promesas de la clase" lleva a que se comience a "dudar de la efectividad no solo de las promesas de esa clase –la burguesa- sino de sus formas de representación, así como de los fundamentos que las sustentaban" (*ibídem*: 12).

renovación en la escena española. Será, por tanto, en la década de los sesenta desde la que arranca nuestro análisis, cuando se re-conquisten tales lugares para la definición de lo teatral.

Hallaremos pues paralelismos, o bien por influencia directa o bien por evolución análoga, entre ambos movimientos renovadores: el europeo de finales del XIX analizado por Sánchez Montes, y el que ahora nos ocupa, al que Cornago Bernal dedica un interesante estudio monográfico (Cornago, 1999). La crisis del realismo del fin del XIX y la polémica sobre la limitación de sus formas, el agotamiento de la razón o la crisis de lo verbal serán pues en cierta medida síntomas paralelos a los que testimoniarán la crisis o insuficiencia de los realismos en la España de los sesenta. En ambos casos asistimos al abandono progresivo de la palabra en pos de una escena de mayor sensorialidad y fisicidad. A través de las poéticas dramatúrgicas y escénicas de los sesenta y los setenta que a continuación perfilaremos se fundará un nuevo sentido de la teatralidad en el que la palabra ya no ostenta el lugar central. En estos años asistiremos a un número importante de montajes que no suponen ya la convencional representación de un texto literario sino la adaptación para la escena de cualquier material no necesariamente dramático. Comienzan a aparecer en las carteleras montajes en los que no se profiere palabra alguna[4], en los que no existe un texto dramático tras el espectáculo.

Semejantes razones a las de entonces –aunque motivadas por un contexto histórico diferente- son las que vindican el giro: el resurgir de la filosofía neonietscheana, una profunda desconfianza en la ideología burguesa y un hondo cansancio de sus temas y actitudes o la conexión con la tendencia universal de los sesenta que propone "el grito del cuerpo" tanto desde el horizonte del mayo francés como desde el movimiento hippy que se levanta contra el capitalismo americano. Se produce en este marco la subversión del cuerpo contra la inteligencia y contra la razón que hasta entonces lo regían. Herbert Marcuse publica el revolucionario *Eros and Civilization* (1953)[5]. El cuerpo dejará progresivamente de ser el sustento de la palabra para adquirir un protagonismo nuevo[6]. El análisis de las poéticas textuales y escénicas en el paso del franquismo a la transición así

---

[4] Valgan como ejemplo los primeros montajes de *Els Joglars: L'art del mim* (1963), *Els deixebles del silenci (1965), Mimetismes (1966).*

[5] La traducción al español es de 1968 en la editorial Seix Barral colección Biblioteca breve de bolsillo a cargo de Juan García Ponce. "Liberados de la tiranía de la razón represiva, los instintos tienden hacia relaciones existenciales libres y duraderas: generan un nuevo principio de la realidad" (Marcuse, 1968: 185, cit. en Oliva, 2004: 23)

[6] Muestras del nuevo protagonismo del cuerpo son el espectáculo *La mirada del sordo* (1971) de Bob Wilson en el que el desnudo es un elemento axial o Minus One quien comienza *Today* desnudándose y tirando la ropa a contenedores de basura en el marco del Festival de Nancy de 1972.

como la conversación que estas suscitaron nos desvelará el movimiento desde la subordinación del cuerpo hasta su subversión como elemento nuclear de la nueva teatralidad.

Nos detendremos en primer lugar en el análisis del discurso y la reflexión sobre el teatro para constatar la emancipación de los lenguajes del cuerpo, y seguidamente procederemos a analizar las poéticas teatrales que nacen al calor del teatro independiente para constatar ese desplazamiento de la palabra al cuerpo.

2. POÉTICAS DEL SILENCIO: DEL CUERPO ANTROPOLÓGICO AL CUERPO LÚDICO

La recepción de las teorías de Artaud, la presencia del *Living* en España y la llegada del pensamiento y estética de Grotowski serán tres influencias fundamentales en la conformación de las poéticas de la escena independiente en las que el cuerpo detentará el centro. Esta combinación de influjos supuso el impulso definitivo en la génesis de poéticas espectaculares en las que la presencia sobre la escena del cuerpo del actor tendrá un lugar capital. El hecho dramático se reduce a sus elementos mínimos: actor y espectador, como piezas básicas y suficientes para la comunicación teatral.

Apunta Cornago Bernal en *La vanguardia teatral española (1960-1970). Del rito al juego* (1999) la existencia de dos etapas en la neovanguardia que nos ocupa, que terminarán conviviendo en el tiempo. Una primera fase de mayor predominio de un teatro ritual, idealista y trascendental que tiene como influencias esenciales a el *Living* y a Grotowski y entre sus principales representantes la dramaturgia del flamenco que propone *La Cuadra* o las propuestas ritualistas del *grupo Cátaro*; y una segunda etapa, que sigue ya a la crisis de los *grands récits,* en la que prevalece la lúdica espontaneidad de un lenguaje popular y frívolo, representado por grupos como *Tábano* o *Esperpento*. Una y otra fase vienen caracterizadas por el rechazo a la palabra y la reivindicación del cuerpo y sus lenguajes, en los que se descubre una potencia mayor y más expresiva que en todo el teatro de texto. Cornago Bernal señala elementos que acucian la crisis de lo verbal en pro de formas nuevas de comunicación liberadas del racionalismo logocéntrico que impone la palabra:

> consecuencia directa de la crisis que venía sufriendo desde principios de siglo la palabra como medio de comunicación eficaz, acentuada durante los últimos años sesenta con el desarrollo de la semiótica, la teoría de la comunicación y la crisis del pensamiento estructuralista en su formulación inicial. Progresivamente, se revalorizaron otros canales de comunicación que prescindían del sistema lingüístico, en beneficio de códigos más intuitivos o emocionales, mientras se rechazaba toda retórica que implicase la gratuita proliferación de signos, así como lenguajes de excesiva complejidad (Cornago Bernal, 2001: 208)

Se produce la conquista del cuerpo del actor como elemento axial en su materialidad física sobre la escena. El actor toma de conciencia de "su propio cuerpo como una compleja maquinaria de creación de significados que abandonaba su condición de objeto instrumental para convertirse también en sujeto de la enunciación" (Cornago Bernal, 2001: 220). Esta traslación de la palabra al cuerpo es paralela a la estudiada por Sánchez Montes a nivel europeo a lo largo del siglo XX[7]. La amplia gama de poéticas escénicas que se inauguran desde el teatro independiente se mueven entre los polos que constituyen la concepción antropológica y ritual del cuerpo y del acontecimiento teatral, y la lúdica o festiva.

El cuerpo antropológico[8] vindicado desde el teatro ritual recurre al primitivismo del grito o el cante en la comunicación emocional e irracional con el espectador, rechazando lenguajes más intelectualizados. El cuerpo semidesnudo, intuitivo y animal del teatro ritual deviene mártir de la civilización occidental en la que la condición materialista de la misma se convierte en principio destructor de la dimensión individual del individuo[9]. Encuentra el camino de lo espiritual en lo instintivo. Participa esta poética de la disolución de fronteras entre la vida y el arte, erigiéndose el acto escénico en un acto de rebeldía política y social. Es el que Peter Brook nomina "teatro sagrado".

El cuerpo lúdico logra su actuación política en la escena por los caminos de la instrumentalización de los lenguajes propios de la revista, el cabaret, el mimo, el circo o el carnaval. El "teatro tosco", en la nominación del Brook, participa de una semejante función liberadora. Son buenos ejemplos la trayectoria que presenta *Tábano teatro* más vinculada al lenguaje de la revista o la de Els Joglars, fuertemente ligada al mimo en su origen. Los lenguajes del cuerpo y el arte del actor consiguen hacerse con el centro como ya vimos a propósito de las calas del discurso crítico sobre la pantomima.

---

[7] Apunta Sánchez Montes cómo "se produce un impulso hacia una renovada valorización del papel del cuerpo del actor en el espacio de la escena teatral en virtud de la cual se entiende que este no ha de atenerse al oficio de desempeñar simplemente el papel de soporte de la palabra dramática" (Sánchez Montes, 2004: 13).

[8] El grupo Artea revisa en el artículo "Teatro y ritualidad" cómo se han recuperado en el siglo XX para la escena las formas y los modos de recepción del rito, la ceremonia y la fiesta, desde Artaud a Kantor, para centrarse a continuación en España y proponer desde esta perspectiva una lectura del trabajo de compañías como *Cátaro, La Cuadra, Comediants, La Zaranda* o *Atala,* dramaturgos como Nieva, Riaza, Romero Esteo, Eusebio Calonge y Rodrigo García" (Artea y Sánchez, 2006:11).

[9] Esto se hace muy gráfico en montajes como *Herramientas* de *La cuadra*, en la que el cuerpo del trabajador es agredido por el poder de las herramientas. José Antonio Sánchez señala en la reflexión sobre este espectáculo cómo "la confrontación del cuerpo sufriente con la máquina desencadenaba el drama, no apoyado en palabras, sino surgido de un conflicto físico que probablemente había satisfecho a Artaud" (Artea y Sánchez, 2006: 83)

A través de estas poéticas escénicas vanguardistas la escena española alcanza a la europea en la conquista del movimiento y del cuerpo como elementos sustitutivos de la palabra en la escena –incluso aunque no se llegue a prescindir de ella para el espectáculo- en la comunicación expresiva que supone el acontecimiento teatral. La comunicación racional y logocéntrica deja paso a una comunicación más orgánica e intuitiva. Nacen, precisamente, las poéticas escénicas de la búsqueda de una comunicación sensorial y emocional con el espectador. Apunta Cornago Bernal cómo "el fin último de la interpretación era la comunicación con el público, el deseo de transformarle, ya sea en un sentido social o espiritual" (Cornago Bernal, 2001: 194). El espectáculo tenía como finalidad última la catarsis transformadora del espectador. Persiguen y logran, de este modo, las nuevas poéticas escénicas una experiencia catártica liberadora -ya sea por los caminos del rito, ya sea por los de la fiesta popular- que reintegra al individuo a la comunidad social.

Las poéticas escénicas del Independiente se ven marcadas por el deseo de devolver el teatro al pueblo, vocación en la que emplearán distintos códigos parateatrales aportando espontaneidad, vitalidad y frescura a la escena y logrando una elevada eficacia comunicativa

3. IMPLICACIONES ESTÉTICAS Y POLÍTICAS DE LA CENSURA: EL CUERPO POLÍTICO

La censura constituye un elemento axial en la conformación del polisistema teatral franquista. Aceptarla o asumirla –al menos superficialmente- es requisito indispensable para acceder al sistema teatral y obtener, por tanto, ciertas posibilidades de representación y/o publicación. La polémica del posibilismo o imposibilismo ilustra ambas posibilidades y sus consecuencias. Entre los lugares de la discusión sobre la dimensión política del teatro, ocupa un lugar importante el debate en torno a la censura. Hasta su supresión en 1977, el discurso crítico en torno a la misma se circunscribe a las frecuentes noticias de prohibiciones o suspensiones así como a las referentes a la firma de manifiestos reclamando la anisada libertad de expresión. A la supresión definitiva de la censura previa en 1977 no sigue el abandono del asunto, sino que apreciamos curiosamente una mayor presencia del debate en torno a la misma. Una vez conquistada la libertad de expresión, percibimos una manifiesta voluntad de no olvidar. Otro centro de la conversación en este punto será la investigación y búsqueda de permanencias veladas de la censura. El distinto rigor aplicado a cuestiones sexuales y políticas es también percibido por el discurso crítico del momento, que constata la mayor laxitud censora en el ámbito de la piel en pro de aparentar una falsa "apertura". Otro lugar común en este momento de la conversación es la comprobación de que el teatro, pese haber sido conquistada la libertad

de expresión, ha quedado convertido en una actividad domesticada, no trasgresora en aspecto alguno. Entre las razones de esta aparente domesticación, señala el discurso crítico la presencia de fenómenos como la inercia y la autocensura que operan sigilosamente. El peso de cuatro décadas de silencio impuesto se deja notar sobre el estado de la cultura. Aporta también la crítica argumentos que señalan cómo una vez conquistadas las vías de desarrollo normal de la política, el teatro deja de ser útil para este cometido, aclarando así a la paradoja que constituye el mutismo en tiempos de libertad.

3.1. Las poéticas escénicas de la censura: la politización del fenómeno teatral

Pérez Cassaux en el artículo publicado en 1980 considera que la censura franquista tuvo como principal fin la despolitización del teatro y de la cultura. Afirma de este modo que

> Los censores tendían a imponer, no una ideología concreta, sino un rechazo a toda reflexión ideológica sobre fenómenos sociales o de convivencia (…) La participación del ciudadano de a pie en la función política tenía que ser mínima y meramente externa, porque lo que interesaba era fomentar el desinterés político, de cualquier signo que fuese. La actividad político-cultural del hombre corriente no era necesaria, y de que siguiese siendo innecesaria se encargaba el automatismo coercitivo del Estado. La Dictadura estaba muy interesada en la despolitización cultural porque así se aseguraba indirectamente la adhesión, que se suponía resultante de la renuncia del pueblo a ejercer en política. La censura, pues, no obedecía a ideales religiosos, ni sentimentales, ni siquiera ideológicos concretos. Obedecía a un solo designio: fomentar la indiferencia política absoluta (Primer Acto, núm. 184, abril- mayo 1980: 90)

Consideramos desde la óptica aventajada que da a veces el paso del tiempo, que esta tensión coercitiva en extremo por parte del sistema teatral franquista logró los efectos contrarios a los deseados. La pretensión de despolitizar el teatro agudizó su politización, el teatro avanzó contra el poder y asumió funciones hasta el momento propias de la política.

En otro artículo del mismo número de *Primer Acto* Gerardo Malla alude a un fenómeno esencial para la comprensión de la posterior evolución del teatro en tiempos de libertad. Se trata de la ya anunciada canalización a través del teatro de la lucha política. Citamos sus palabras:

> la persecución de cualquier actividad política que supusiera una oposición al régimen franquista, inclinó a muchas gentes a buscar en el teatro un posible resquicio a través del cual llevar a cabo una lucha que estaba negada y duramente reprimida en sectores que le eran más propios, esto último sin negar en ningún momento el contenido político que el teatro por definición tiene. Esta última razón, la canalización a través del teatro de la lucha política tal vez sea, sin olvidar en ningún momento las otras, la principal causa y razón del auge mantenido durante largo tiempo por los

grupos que se denominaron a sí mismos independientes (Primer Acto, núm. 184, abril- mayo 1980: 102)

3.1.1. El valor del destape

El distinto rigor aplicado a cuestiones sexuales y políticas[10] es también percibido por el discurso crítico del momento. Desde los últimos años del franquismo hasta bien acabada la década de los setenta se pasean por las pantallas y escenarios españoles cuerpos desnudos que despiertan no pocas polémicas en la calle y en la crítica. Dentro de los desnudos teatrales –recurrentemente comentados en los diarios y revistas del momento- podemos citar un ejemplo que por sus características particulares genera una sacudida altamente llamativa. Nos referimos al desnudo integral masculino que presenta la puesta en escena de *Equus* de Peter Shaffer en 1975[11]. Las razones que acendran el debate van desde el hecho de que el desnudo es, en este caso, masculino, lo que conlleva unas implicaciones radicalmente diferentes a las del desnudo femenino más aceptado, hasta el tratamiento no festivo ni revisteril que recibe el mismo en tal propuesta.

Pero descendamos ya a la percepción de la crítica del desnudo y la mayor laxitud censora en tal ámbito. En el artículo de *Pipirijaina* afirma Miralles cómo "las cuestiones de la piel ya no se censuran; muy al contrario, se alientan"- continúa- "[a]l principio, sacar una teta o una nalga en un escenario era una pequeña batalla ganada a la represión; pero con el tiempo, aquel gesto revolucionario ha sufrido la inflación más estrepitosa en su mística de lo subversivo" (*ibídem*: 58). En un artículo posterior dará cuenta Miralles de cómo Aranguren denunció el erotismo de la "apertura" como último refugio del inmovilismo conservador *(Pipirijaina*, sept. 1978: 55). Miralles volverá sobre el tema en *Primer Acto* en el número que ve la luz en abril de 1980:

> No se ha meditado lo bastante en el freno que supuso para la normalización del Teatro, el que empresarios sin escrúpulos se aprovecharan de la tolerancia política y la represión sexual e inundaran los escenarios de todo lo que cuelga convenientemente despojado de ropas. A la falta de costumbre de pensar, se le añadía ahora, por motivos económicos (nunca

---

[10] Da cumplida cuenta César Oliva en *La última escena* (2004): "Datos hay, sobre todo a partir de que Arias Navarro tomara la presidencia del gobierno en 1973, de cierta laxitud en algunos temas principalmente en lo relativo al sexo (…) El paso a la estética del destape fue inminente. Aunque reclamado desde algunos montajes del independiente era lo que esperaba el teatro comercial para incrementar unos ingresos bastante diezmados. (…) Esa tolerancia con el sexo no se vio correspondida con la temática política" (Oliva, 2004: 44-45).

[11] El estreno tiene lugar en el Teatro de la Comedia de Madrid, el 15 de octubre de 1975, bajo la dirección de Manuel Collado con escenografía de Antonio Cortés. El reparto estaba compuesto por los siguientes nombres: Margot Cottens, Juan Ribó, María José Goyanes, Luis Peña, Ana Diosdado, María Teresa Cortés, José Luis López Vázquez, Manuel Sierra, Biel Moll.

por necesaria libertad erótica), la alienación por el sexo (Primer Acto, núm. 184, abril mayo 1980: 122)

De Paco recoge detalladamente la activa lucha de Miralles contra la censura tanto en tiempos de dictadura como en tiempos de democracia (2004).

3.2. El camino indirecto en tiempos de silencio: el desarrollo de los lenguajes de la escena a la sombra de la censura

No cabe duda de que la censura supone un factor interviniente en la conformación del lenguaje dramático de las largas décadas en que ésta permanece vigente. Es obvio el valor del empleo metafórico o simbólico de la historia o del mito en un buen número de las obras escritas bajo sus restricciones. Desde el realismo simbólico de Buero Vallejo a la ruptura del realismo de los nuevos autores mediante lenguajes simbólicos y alegóricos (De paco, 1984 y 1994). El discurso crítico reflexiona sobre la influencia de la censura en la conformación del nuevo lenguaje. Martínez Mediero entiende que "la pregunta que en principio cabe hacerse es si fue la censura franquista la que nos obligó a buscar nuevas formas de expresión autoral, o fue sencillamente que el realismo se agotó en sí mismo, extenuado de contar siempre la misma historia…" (*Primer Acto*, núm.184, abril mayo, 1980: 94). Pérez Cassaux hace referencia en el mismo número a la complicidad que se genera entre autor y público, entre actor y espectador en la comunicación dramática que se produce en tiempos de censura:

Junto a la censura venía el capítulo de las connivencias. Como todo el mundo sabe, *connivere* quiere decir guiñar el ojo. (…) Se guiñaba muchísimo en aquel nuestro teatro. Quizás también la connivencia con el público se practicaba inconscientemente: había un código y el público acabó aprendiéndolo. Todo el mundo sabía quiénes eran los *escorpiones*, el *Faraón* o el *Padre.* Era una semiótica que todos manejábamos; es más, que incluso la censura conocía y que hasta ciertos límites toleraba" (*Primer Acto*, núm. 184, abril mayo, 1980: 91)

Miralles señala asimismo el empleo de "la parábola, el símil y la alegoría como recurso estilístico típico de una época represiva donde la complicidad con el público era imprescindible para comprender las indirectas verbales, la tipología enmascaradora o la creación de ficciones identificables con las realidades" (*Primer Acto*, núm. 184, abril mayo, 1980: 89).

El desarrollo de los lenguajes de la escena estuvo en cierta medida avivado por el silencio impuesto. Cuando la palabra es censurada deviene necesario hacer decir al cuerpo. El gesto, la mímica, el empleo simbólico de los objetos en escena, la presencia de determinados signos, la creación de códigos nuevos y la interconexión significativa de los

141

mismos se hace portadora de valores y mensajes que tenían vedado el camino de la palabra. Si bien la censura lo era también del texto espectacular mediante la asistencia de censores al ensayo general; siempre resultaría más fácil cifrar el mensaje prohibido en los signos escénicos que en la palabra dramática. Guillermo Heras en "Sobre autocensuras y metalenguaje" (*Primer Acto*, núm. 184, abril- mayo 1980: 98-99) hace una revisión de la poética escénica que se creó desde el independiente con el fin de burlar la censura y cifrar el mensaje político en la escena. Señala cómo "los espectáculos desarrollaron una especial imaginación" que en ocasiones llegó a ser "críptica" (Heras, 1980: 99). Afirma así que "la complicidad del público convertía las funciones en una especie de asamblea que en muchos casos sustituía una práctica política coherente, ya que a través del aplauso y del guiño amplios sectores se lavaban la mala conciencia de su inacción" (Heras, 1980: 99). Constata Guillermo Heras cómo "un régimen dictatorial siempre tiene un límite y los lenguajes de creación en cualquier terreno son infinitos para burlarlo (…) la creación de signos metafóricos en algunos casos mucho más contundentes que cualquier arenga panfletera" (Heras, 1980: 99).

No pretenden estas constataciones afirmar que la censura constituyera un elemento imprescindible en el desarrollo de los lenguajes escénicos. Muy al contrario, fueron tantas las limitaciones y coerciones que impuso a los escenarios que podemos afirmar sin temor a equivocarnos que en condiciones de libertad los lenguajes escénicos hubieran hallado inteligentes y más veloces vías de desarrollo. Sin embargo, los caminos de nuestra escena –como los de nuestro país- pasaron por los condicionamientos impuestos por casi cuatro décadas de silencio.

4. CONCLUSIONES

Desde el análisis de las poéticas escénicas del teatro independiente se constata el lugar central que adquieren la improvisación, como principal arma creativa del actor, y la creación colectiva, como dramaturgia nacida a su medida, potenciadora al tiempo de la autonomía y diversidad formal de los sistemas de signos convocados a la escena. Las influencias del otro lado de la frontera constituirán el impulso definitivo en la génesis de poéticas espectaculares en las que la presencia sobre la escena del cuerpo del actor tendrá un lugar capital. El hecho dramático se reduce a sus elementos mínimos: actor y espectador, como piezas básicas y suficientes para la comunicación teatral. La amplia gama de poéticas escénicas que se inauguran desde el teatro independiente se mueven entre los polos que constituyen la concepción antropológica y ritual del cuerpo y del acontecimiento teatral, y la lúdica o festiva. A través de las poéticas escénicas

vanguardistas la escena española alcanza a la europea en la conquista del movimiento y del cuerpo en la comunicación expresiva que supone el acontecimiento teatral. Si la recepción del hecho teatral desde la perspectiva logocéntrica de la escena realista fue eminentemente racional e intelectual; la recepción que vindica la nueva escena en tanto que tejido de diversos códigos entrecruzados es necesariamente sensorial y fenomenológica. Nacen, precisamente, las poéticas escénicas de la búsqueda de una comunicación emocional con el espectador, logrando una experiencia catártica liberadora -ya sea por los caminos del rito, ya sea por los de la fiesta popular- que reintegra al individuo a la comunidad social.

La permanencia de la censura tiene implicaciones directas sobre las poéticas teatrales. La censura supone un factor interviniente en la conformación del lenguaje dramático: el valor del empleo metafórico o simbólico de la historia o del mito en un buen número de las obras escritas bajo sus restricciones o el desarrollo de los lenguajes de la escena avivado por el silencio impuesto son huellas de su intervención. Cuando la palabra es censurada deviene necesario hacer decir al cuerpo. El gesto, la mímica, el empleo simbólico de los objetos en escena, la presencia de determinados signos, la creación de códigos nuevos y la interconexión significativa de los mismos se hace portadora de valores y mensajes que tenían vedado el camino de la palabra.

REFERENCIAS BIBLIOGRÁFICAS

Artea y Sánchez, J. A. *Artes de la escena y de la acción en España: 1978-2002.* Cuenca: Servicio de publicaciones de la Universidad de Castilla La Mancha, 2006.

Brook, P. *The Empty Space.* London: Penguin, 1990 (1968).

Cornago Bernal, Ó. *Discurso teórico y puesta en escena en los años sesenta: la encrucijada de los realismos.* Madrid: CSIC, 2001.

Cornago Bernal, Ó. *La vanguardia teatral en España (1965-1975). Del ritual al juego.* Madrid: Visor, 1999.

De Paco, M. "El teatro español en la transición: ¿una generación olvidada?". *Anales de Literatura Española.* 2004, núm. 17, pp. 145-158.

__. *Estudios sobre Buero Vallejo*, Universidad de Murcia, Murcia, 1984.

__. *De re bueriana*. Murcia: universidad de Murcia, 1994.

Heras, G. "Sobre autocensuras y metalenguaje". *Primer Acto*. 1980, núm. 184, abril mayo, pp. 98-99.

Malla, G. "En torno a las censuras". *Primer Acto*. 1980, núm. 184, abril mayo, pp. 100- 103.

Marcuse, H. *Eros y civilización.* Madrid: Seix Barral, 1968.

Martínez Mediero, M. "Qué verde era mi valle". *Primer Acto*. 1980. núm. 184, abril mayo,pp. 94-97.

Miralles, A.   "*Alias Serrallonga* de Els Joglars". *Primer Acto*. 1975, núm. 179-180-181, pp.90-95.

_. "El contagio de la paranoia". *Pipirijaina*, sept. 1978, pp. 54-57.

_. "Epílogo. De la agonía a la esperanza y se van a cumplir cinco años". *Primer Acto.* 1980 núm. 184, abril mayo, p. 121.

_. "Los tiempos no están cambiando". *Pipirijaina*, junio 1978, pp. 56-60.

Oliva, C. *La última escena. Teatro español de 1975 a nuestros días.* Madrid: Cátedra, 2004.

Pérez Cassaux, M. "La censura y otros demonios". *Primer Acto*. 1980, núm. 184, abril mayo pp. 90-91.

Sánchez Montes, M.J. *El cuerpo como signo*. Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2004.

RESEÑAS

Oralidad y escrituralidad en la recreación del español coloquial – Araceli López Serena[1]

Paula Albitre Lamata
Instituto Universitario Menéndez Pidal
paulalbitre@gmail.com

La **relación entre lengua hablada y escrita** ha generado gran controversia a lo largo de la tradición lingüística. En este libro, López Serena analiza en profundidad dicha relación para tratar de esclarecerla, primero planteando los problemas teóricos a los que se ha enfrentado y después con una aproximación a un estudio crítico del español coloquial.

Las líneas de investigación en las que se enmarcan los trabajos de esta autora son la epistemología o fundamentación metateórica de la lingüística y, como se refleja en esta obra, el análisis de la relación entre lengua hablada y escrita.

Asimismo, es doctora de Filología por la Universidad de Sevilla, donde ejerce hoy en día como profesora titular del Departamento de Lengua Española, Lingüística y Teoría de la Literatura y, desde 2001, ha participado en todos los proyectos del grupo de investigación *El español hablado en Andalucía.*

En la primera parte se analiza el **proceso** que va **desde la proclamación saussureana de la lengua hablada como 'objeto único y verdadero' de la ciencia del lenguaje hasta su muy posterior análisis efectivo**. De hecho, este análisis ha obligado a replantearse la validez del instrumental metodológico y conceptual usado por los paradigmas de investigación y por la lingüística, puesto que siguen enmarcados en el *escriptismo* y no serían válidos para realizar una aproximación a la lengua hablada.

López Serena muestra en el primer capítulo los problemas que ha generado tradicionalmente el estudio de la relación entre lengua oral y escrita, denunciando el olvido de la oralidad en el mundo lingüístico[2]. Esta desatención ha sido provocada por la

---

[1]López Serena, A.; *Oralidad y escrituralidad en la recreación literaria del español coloquial*, Madrid: Gredos, 2007 (Colección Biblioteca Románica Hispánica, II. Estudios y Ensayos, 449)

[2] Muestra de ello es que, tanto generativistas como estructuralistas, excluyeron como objeto de estudio la lengua, en su uso hablado y escrito, dejando fuera oralidad y escrituralidad

tendencia *escriptista[1]*, la cual opta por un análisis preponderante de documentos escritos y por la concepción de la comunicación en los términos propios de la comunicación escrita, no oral.

Además, señala que los estudios que habían abordado la oralidad y la escrituralidad lo habían hecho desde una perspectiva multidisciplinar, convergiendo numerosos enfoques y objetivos de investigación sin obtener resultados oportunos. Esta perspectiva no sería la más apropiada para la autora, puesto que se caracteriza por la dispersión disciplinar, y apuesta por una **investigación 'transdisciplinar' o interdisciplinar**, donde el uso conjunto de varias disciplinas permita esclarecer las características de la oralidad.

En el siguiente capítulo, López Serena prosigue indagando en distintas teorías lingüísticas para extraer las causas de la marginación de la oralidad.Cabe mencionar la **invención del magnetófono** como un antes y un después en los estudios científicos de las lenguas, ya que tras su desarrollo se fomentó la investigación de la oralidad y su variabilidad. Dichas variaciones entre lo oral y lo escrito fueron fundamentales para que los romanistas alemanes Koch y Oesterreicher, quienes desarrollaron la idea de *diasistema*, englobando tres niveles del lenguaje: universal, histórico e individual[2].

Desde la perspectiva antropológica, se entiende oralidad y escrituralidad como conjuntos de usos lingüísticos que caracterizan una comunidad lingüística, en relación con el conocimiento o no de la escritura. La investigación antropológica, en definitiva, ha incrementado su interés en lo oral y lo escrito gracias al **desarrollo de medios electrónicos de transmisión de mensajes**. La autora señala cómo este *determinismo tecnológico elemental* dela perspectiva antropológicaha sido superado por las propuestas 'ideológicas'. De esta forma, los medios oral y escrito dejan de ser ajenos a los cambios sociocognitivos y pasan a estar supeditados a una consideración contextualizada, clave en la pragmática actual, donde se da entrada a aspectos de la situación histórico-cultural en la que se produce la variación (*contexto, papel del oyente, del receptor*, etc).

De esta manera, no será hasta los últimos años cuando la oralidad comience a suscitar interés y sea atendida desde la **Lingüística Integracional, la Pragmática y la Teoría de la Relevancia**, logrando **superar** la concepción determinista de la condición humana, de marcadas**raíces escriptistas.** Además, se hanse han desarrollado **nuevas teorías, como el Análisis del Discurso o la Lingüística textual,que estudian** *el lenguaje en uso* **y su funcionamiento** y, por ende,incluyenla oralidad y la escrituralidad.

---

[1]Desde el punto de vista tradicional, se ha entendido la escritura como una representación muy próxima a lo hablado (igualación formal) y se ha desestimado lo oral, ya que gran parte de los estudios se basan en textos escritos.

[2] Esta teoría está en clara connivencia con los postulados estructuralistas saussereanos.

Destaca también López Serena el nacimiento de la **sociolingüística** como impulso fundamental del análisis de la lengua hablada. De hecho, esta disciplina considera la lengua hablada como un objeto de estudio en sí misma y como una fuente material para el estudio de la variación lingüística. **Esta proclamación pragmática de supremacía provocará una desviación de la atención hacia la lengua hablada, en detrimento de la escritura.**

En la segunda parte del libro, se atiende específicamente a los alcances y límites de la aproximación estilística al estudio del español coloquial. Además, se efectúa un análisis contrastivo entre conversaciones coloquiales 'reales' y 'literarias', en relación con su recreación literaria.

En el tercer capítulo, la autora se centra en la indefinición de 'español coloquial', la apelación a principios psicologistas de escasa legitimidad científica[3] y la predilección por el análisis del léxico y la fraseología en detrimento de los aspectos construccionales.

El problema de la **vacilación terminológica y la indefinición conceptual de 'español coloquial'** procede de los estudios estilísticos y femológicos. Para poder postular una mejor definición, López Serena identifica las distintas construcciones consideradas 'sinónimos' (*español coloquial, hablado, popular, conversacional*) y analiza su estructura conceptual y las circunstancias que propician el empleo de la modalidad de uso lingüístico inmediato. De este modo, López Serena propone especificar el ámbito de cada término para evitar esta confusión conceptual:

1. 'Informal' ('popular') para referirse al registro.
2. 'Conversacional' para el tipo de discurso.
3. 'Hablado' para el canal o medio de realización física del discurso.
4. 'Coloquial' para la intersección entre conversación y registro informal, no exclusiva de un único medio de realización.

Así, el lenguaje coloquial carecía de un **marco teórico general** capaz de abarcar por completo la variación lingüística y que facilitara su estudio. Esta confusión terminológica fue el punto de partida del marco desarrollado en los años 80 por **Koch y Oesterreicher**. Estos autores propusieron asentar el estudio de lo oral y lo escrito sobre la diferenciación entre *medio* (fónico/gráfico) y *concepción* (gradual escrito/hablado) y sobre los tres niveles de Coseriu (universal, histórico y actual). El aporte fundamental de este estudio fue la **aplicación de la dimensión variacional del continuo 'hablado/escrito' al estudio**

---

[3] La afectividad.

diacrónico de las lenguas, puesto que permite enlazar los factores históricos extralingüísticos y los cambios lingüísticos del eje continuo inmediatez/distancia. Con este nuevo marco, se añade una cuarta variación 'hablado/escrito' a las ya distinguidas por Coseriu (diatópica, diafásica y diastrática).

La autora también señala un principio psicologista a tener en cuenta en el estudio de la lengua coloquial: la **afectividad**. De hecho, la corriente estilística le atribuye un papel fundamental en la lengua hablada[4]. Sin embargo, los últimos estudios sobre fenómenos coloquiales, enmarcados dentro de la Pragmática, no recurren a la afectividad para explicar la incidencia de los hablantes en el discurso, sino que atienden a las **estrategias comunicativas**que constituyen lasfunciones generales del acto de hablar (*producción*, *recepción*, *conexión* e *interacción*, todas enmarcadas dentro de la *situacionalidad* del discurso).López Serena no intenta llevar a cabo un agravio comparativo entre Estilística y Pragmática, sino que muestra el salto cualitativo que hay entre ambas teorías. Además, reconoce el mérito de Beinhauer de haber resaltado el papel de la afectividad como mecanismo en la modalidad de uso coloquial.

No obstante, los mayores **problemas** generados por el **estudio del español coloquial** se encuentran en la **sintaxis**, ya que el léxico y la fraseología copaban gran parte de la atención. De hecho, ni la sociolingüística ni la dialectología, impulsoras del interés por la lengua hablada, han enfocado directamente sus estudios hacia la variación sintáctica. Mientras que la sociolingüística se ha centrado en el nivel fónico, al ser el que mejor se adapta a la metodología variacionista, la indagación dialectológica se ha limitado tradicionalmente al estudio de la pronunciación y el léxico.El Análisis del Discurso y la Lingüística Textual serían claves para López Serena en el desarrollo de nuevos enfoques de la sintaxis coloquial. **Salvar la concepción escriptista y optar por un enfoque pragmático-discursivo** era una necesidad para insertar el estudio de la sintaxis coloquial en el marco de una gramática del texto y de la lingüística de la enunciación, que manifestara su estructura temática (*tema/rema, tópico/comentario,…*).

López Serena, en el cuarto capítulo, trata de aproximarse a la mímesis de la oralidad en la literatura. Lo hace a través del análisis de la narrativa española de posguerra (*El Jarama* y *Entre Visillos)*, siempre siendo consciente de que 'toda creación literaria lleva implícita una transformación estética de la realidad'. De esta forma, las muestras coloquiales y de

---

[4] Como reflejan las teorías de Vigara (*La afectividad es el factor clave que determina en gran medida la elección léxica, las variantes morfológicas y la estructuración sintáctica del enunciado*) (167) y Beinhauer (*El habla se impulsa por la afectividad*) (165)

conversaciones que aparecen en los textos literarios no reflejan una correspondencia pura con el uso coloquial real.

La autora del libro nos presenta las distintas **figuras de sintaxis** coloquial aportadas por Benveniste, siguiendo el **análisis en grillas** del GARS[5]: *figura de simetría, figura de enumeración, figura del factor común* y *figura del paréntesis*. Este tipo de análisis consiste en una representación gráfica del material transcrito, que permite visualizar los fenómenos característicos del discurso en construcción, mediante la explotación del eje vertical (relaciones entre eje paradigmático y sintagmático). Es decir, es un análisis sintáctico basado en la escritura en columna de elementos del eje paradigmático, pero que en el habla aparecen encadenados.

Tras analizar las figuras sintácticas y las escaleras, noción aportada por la propia autora, se deduce que **la captación de lo coloquial en la literatura sigue una escala gradual, dando gran importancia a la captación funcional de los esquemas sintácticos.** Además, demuestra que hay **esquemas sintácticos que abundan más en la literatura que otros**, como el caso de las *funciones semántico-pragmáticas* (figuras de simetría con valor enfático o figuras de enumeración coordinativa) cuya presencia es mucho más elevada que las *figuras de planificación discursiva* (repeticiones que indican final de turno o que delimitan unidades informativas).

La tesis que defiende la autora es que **las diferencias entre conversaciones 'reales' y 'ficticias' son esperables, ya que se dan entre discursos que actualizan unidades lingüísticas diferentes y las adecuan a sus condiciones comunicativas.** De esta forma, se acepta la cadena variacional como mecanismo explicativo de la mímesis de la oralidad en literatura porque, meramente, estamos ante dos discursos diferentes que se amoldan a sus características (*medio, finalidad discursiva, interlocutores, canal,…*).

En resumen, López Serena analiza en este libro la recreación de la lengua hablada en la literatura de posguerra. Se ha de resaltar que no sólo realiza un análisis comparativo entre la literatura y lo real, sino que parte de un análisis teórico de los estudios multidisciplinares sobre oralidad y escrituralidad y de la investigación femológica hispánica. De esta forma, la autora realiza una **progresión de lo general a lo particular, desde la reflexión historiográfica y consideración teórica, hasta el análisis fáctico**.

Considero que la división del libro, en dos grandes bloques, lo convierte en un manual práctico y comprensible. Aporta al lector una base teórica necesaria para comprender las conclusiones extraídas en el análisis contrastivo entre lengua real y ficticia.

---

[5]*Groupe Aixois de Recherche en Syntaxe*, dirigido durante años por Blanche-Benveniste.

La autora contribuye a incrementar el valor de su obra citando y basando sus argumentos en teorías de grandes estudiosos de la lingüística como Benveniste, Coseriu, Halliday, Chomsky; demostrando haber realizado un amplio estudio previo que sirve de base a su tesis personal sobre la mímesis de la oralidad en la literatura.

López Serena consigue elaborar una obra novedosa, tratando un tema tradicionalmente olvidado en la lingüística pero que parece haber despuntado recientemente. Además, logra solventarlas carencias sobre oralidad, creadas por la perspectiva multidisciplinar, con gran rigor expositivo y argumentativo.

VERBEIA· JOURNAL OF ENGLISH AND SPANISH STUDIES · VERBEIA· REVISTA DE ESTUDIOS FILOLÓGICOS